

DA
2003
1

**Global Bioethics and Governance: Views from FAO
and India on the Ethics of Biotechnology in
Agriculture and Medicine**

Minakshi BHARDWAJ

A dissertation submitted to the Doctoral Program in Biological Sciences,
the University of Tsukuba in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in Science

January 2003

寄贈
バミナ
ードク
ワシ
氏

03302693

Contents

Content list	i
Abstract	vii
List of Tables	x
List of Figures	xi
Abbreviations	xiii
1. Introduction	1
<i>1.1 Bioethics</i>	<i>1</i>
1.1.1 Contemporary bioethics	1
1.1.2 Varieties of bioethics	2
1.1.3 Principles of bioethics	3
1.1.4 Theories of ethics	4
1.1.5 Centrism in bioethics	5
1.1.6 Ways to view bioethics	6
1.1.7 Global ethics	6
1.1.8 Agricultural ethics	7
<i>1.2 Biotechnology</i>	<i>8</i>
1.2.1 Definitions of biotechnology	9
1.2.2 Modern biotechnology and its implications	10
1.2.3 Modern biotechnology and bioethics	11
<i>1.3 Governance</i>	<i>13</i>
1.3.1 National governance and international governance	14
1.3.2 Governance and bioethics	15
1.3.3 Global governance of biotechnology-the role of UN agencies	17
1.3.4 The European Union	21
1.3.5 The USA	22
1.3.6 Developing countries	24
1.3.7 Public opinion of biotechnology and governance	25

<i>1.4 Technology and development</i>	26
1.4.1 Developing countries versus developed countries	27
1.4.2 Impact of globalization	29
1.4.3 Biotechnology and developing countries	30
<i>1.5 Scope of this research</i>	31
<i>1.6 Thesis hypotheses</i>	32
1.6.1 Modern biotechnology has increased the discussion of the ethical issues raised by science in society	32
1.6.2 The governance of biotechnology requires multilateral and multi-sectorial cooperation	33
1.6.3 Participation from poor countries is also needed in the global governance of biotechnology	34
1.6.4 People use ethical principles even when they do not explicitly use the term "ethics"	35
1.6.5 The ethical issues raised in the national governance of biotechnology mirror those raised in the international governance	35
2. Methodology of FAO Studies	38
<i>2.1 Role of FAO in global agriculture and food production</i>	38
2.1.1 What is FAO?	38
2.1.2 Structural organization of FAO	38
2.1.3 Tasks performed by FAO	41
<i>2.2 Interviews with FAO staff members</i>	41
2.2.1 Background to the FAO ethics in food and agriculture initiative	41
2.2.2 Conducting the interviews	42
<i>2.3 Categorization of ideas from interviews</i>	43
2.3.1 Idea categorization	43
2.3.2 Food	43
2.3.3 Rural development	52
2.3.4 Information	68

2.3.5 Biotechnology	78
2.3.6 Sponsorship and funding	91
2.3.7 Environment	102
2.3.8 Animal issues	127
2.3.9 Personnel issues	137
3. Results of FAO study	138
<i>3.1 Sample characteristics</i>	138
<i>3.2 Explanation of analysis of frequency of concepts and keywords expressed in the interviews</i>	140
3.2.1 Importance of areas covered during the interviews	141
3.2.2 Summary of the results	143
<i>3.3 Results by category</i>	143
3.3.1 General explanation	143
3.3.2 Food	146
3.3.3 Rural development	154
3.3.4 Information	169
3.3.5 Biotechnology	181
3.3.6 Sponsorship and funding	195
3.3.7 Environment	211
3.3.8 Animal issues	231
3.3.9 Personnel issues	240
4. Studies in India	245
<i>4.1 Methodology of interviews in India</i>	245
4.1.1 Interview strategy in India	245
4.1.2 Sample characteristics	245
4.1.3 Institutions surveyed	246
4.1.4 Areas covered in biotechnology	246

4.2	<i>Results of Indian survey regarding food and agriculture</i>	247
4.2.1	Food	249
4.2.2	Rural development	254
4.2.3	Information	258
4.2.4	Biotechnology	262
4.2.5	Sponsorship and funding	267
4.2.6	Environment	272
4.2.7	Animal issues	277
4.2.8	Most urgent issues in food and agriculture in India	278
4.3	<i>Results of the Indian Survey on health care issues</i>	278
4.3.1	Legislation	281
4.3.2	WHO	281
4.3.3	Bad governance	282
4.3.4	Infrastructure	282
4.3.5	Rural areas	283
4.3.6	Poverty	284
4.3.7	Gender issues	285
4.3.8	Training	286
4.3.9	Drug availability	287
4.3.10	Health insurance	288
4.3.11	Privatization	288
4.3.12	Pharmaceutical companies	289
4.3.13	The urgent health care issues in India	290
4.4	<i>Results of Indian survey on medical research</i>	290
4.4.1	AIDS	293
4.4.2	Vaccines	293
4.4.3	Genetic privacy	294
4.4.4	DNA Banks	295
4.4.5	Stem cell	296
4.4.6	Cloning	297
4.4.7	In Vitro Fertilization	297

4.4.8	Funding	298
4.4.9	Multi National Corporations	300
4.4.10	Patents	301
4.4.11	Benefit sharing	302
4.4.12	Ethics Committees	303
4.4.13	Legislation	304
4.4.14	Clinical trials	304
4.4.15	Informed consent	305
4.4.16	People's participation	306
4.4.17	Most urgent ethical issues in medical research in India	307
4.5	<i>Governance of biotechnology in India</i>	307
4.5.1	Issues in policy making in India	307
4.5.2	Governance of genetic engineering trials in India	310
4.5.3	Governance of clinical trials in India	312
5.	Discussion	314
5.1	<i>Modern biotechnology has increased the discussion of the ethical issues raised by science in society.</i>	314
5.1.1	Modern biotechnology and traditional biotechnology	314
5.1.2	Why modern biotechnology is feared	315
5.1.3	Catalytic role of modern biotechnology in thinking about the ethics of science	316
5.1.4	Public understanding of biotechnology	319
5.2	<i>People use ethical principles even when they do not explicitly use the term "ethics".</i>	321
5.2.1	Universality of ethics	321
5.2.2	Some examples of use of ethical principles at international level.	322
5.3	<i>The ethical issues raised in the national governance of biotechnology mirror those raised in the international governance.</i>	325
5.3.1	National governance versus International governance	325
5.3.2	Some examples of universal ethical issues that are also national issues	326

5.3.3	International regulations guide national regulations	338
5.4	<i>The governance of biotechnology requires multilateral and multi-sectorial cooperation.</i>	339
5.4.1	Addressing the needs of developing countries	339
5.4.2	Multi dimensional nature of biotechnology	343
5.5	<i>Participation from poor countries is also needed in the global governance of biotechnology.</i>	346
6.	Conclusions	350
6.1	Ethics in governance	350
6.2	Policy implications for developing countries in biotechnology	353
6.3	Scientific uncertainty of biotechnology in public policy and governance	353
6.4	Global bioethics and governance of biotechnology	354
7.	Acknowledgments	355
8.	References	357