

JOURNAL OF WORLD HERITAGE STUDIES

世界遺産学研究

Special Issue 2020:

Proceedings of the Fourth Capacity Building Workshop on Nature-Culture Linkages
in Heritage Conservation in Asia and the Pacific 2019

September 24 - October 4, 2019, Tsukuba, Japan

MIXED CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE 文化と自然の複合遺産

UNESCO Chair on Nature-Culture Linkages in Heritage Conservation

筑波大学・世界遺産学学位プログラム

University of Tsukuba・Degree Program in Heritage Studies

Copyright: © 2020 University of Tsukuba.

Reproduction of this publication for educational or other non-commercial purposes is authorized without prior written permission from the copyright holder provided the source is fully acknowledged. Reproduction of this publication for resale or other commercial purposes is prohibited without prior written permission of the copyright holder.

Citation: Ishizawa, Maya, Inaba, Nobuko and Yoshida, Masahito, Eds. (2020). Proceedings of the Fourth Capacity Building Workshop on Nature-Culture Linkages in Heritage Conservation, Asia and the Pacific 2019. Mixed Cultural and Natural Heritage. Journal of World Heritage Studies, University of Tsukuba, Japan: University of Tsukuba. 163 pp.

Editorial Board of the Journal of World Heritage Studies:

Yasufumi Ukita (Chief Editor)

Hiromu Ito and Mariko Ikeda (Associate editors)

Edited by: Maya Ishizawa, Nobuko Inaba and Masahito Yoshida

Editorial assistance: Claudia Uribe Chinen

Photos: All photos in the Part Two by Claudia Uribe except of pp. 137 Ami Masuichi, and pp. 82, 109, 111, 113, 114, 116 by Ichita Shimoda, pp. 85, 87 and 103 by Maya Ishizawa and p. 153 by Maiko Suda.

Available from:

UNESCO Chair on Nature-Culture Linkages in Heritage Conservation

World Heritage Studies, University of Tsukuba

1-1-1 Tennodai, Tsukuba, Ibaraki

Japan 305-8571

Tel +81-29-853-6344

Fax +81-29-853-7099

<http://conservation.tsukuba.ac.jp/UNESCO-Chair/>

ISSN: 2189-4728

JOURNAL OF WORLD HERITAGE STUDIES

Special Issue 2020:

Capacity Building Workshop on Nature-Culture Linkages in
Heritage Conservation, Asia and the Pacific 2019

MIXED CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE

文化と自然の複合遺産

Organized by

**UNESCO Chair on Nature-Culture Linkages in
Heritage Conservation**

In collaboration with

**UNESCO World Heritage Centre
International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN)
International Centre for the Study of the Preservation and Restoration of
Cultural Property (ICCROM)
International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS)**

**SEPTEMBER 24-OCTOBER 4, 2019
UNIVERSITY OF TSUKUBA, TSUKUBA, JAPAN**

Table of Contents



List of Acronyms	v
■ Foreword	1
■ Introduction.....	3
■ Acknowledgements.....	5
■ Part One: Proceedings of the Fourth Capacity Building Workshop on Nature-Culture Linkages in Heritage Conservation. Mixed Cultural and Natural Heritage	
Special contribution	
An Indigenous perspective: the case of Pimachiowin Aki Mixed Cultural and Natural Heritage, Canada by Sophia Rabliauskas	9
CBWNCL 2019 Participants Case Studies	
Exploring Nature-Culture Linkages in the Apatani Valley of Arunachal Pradesh, India by Bina Gandhi Deori.....	17
Nature-Culture Interaction at the Rice Terraces of Ifugao Province, Philippines by Eulalie Dulnuan	24
Doi Suthep Mountain, The Living Heritage by Warong Wonglangka	30
Managing mixed sites and cultural landscapes: challenges and opportunities in Alpine National Park by Kimberley Wilson	38
Ngorongoro Conservation Area: A land of treasures by Joshua Mwankunda	44
The Study of Nature-Culture Linkages of World Heritage Mount Wuyi by Ziyang Yang	50
Sacred Mountain Landscape and Heritage Routes: Nature, Culture and Borderless Beliefs by Anuranjan Roy.....	58
Recognizing the characteristics of Kangchenjunga Conservation Area as a potential World Heritage property in Nepal by Yadav Uprety	65

■ Part Two: Report on the Fourth Capacity Building Workshop on Nature-Culture Linkages in Heritage Conservation. Mixed Cultural and Natural Heritage

Executive Summary 74

CBWNCL 2019. MIXED CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE 78

Module 1: Understanding Nature-Culture Linkages in the Context of Mixed Cultural and Natural Heritage 80

Module 2: Management, Implementation and Governance in Mixed Cultural and Natural Heritage 107

Module 3: Reflection on Theory and Practice.....117

Module 4: International Symposium 125

■ Annexes

Annex 1: CBWNCL 2019 Participants Abstracts 155

Annex 2: List of Participants..... 158

Annex 3: Program of the CBWCNL 2019..... 160



List of Acronyms

ACA	Agency for Cultural Affairs (Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology, Japan)
CBD	Convention on Biological Diversity
CBWNCL	Capacity Building Workshop on Nature-Culture Linkages
DRM	Disaster Risk Management
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization (UN)
GIAHS	Globally Important Agricultural Heritage Systems
HIA	Heritage Impact Assessment
HUL	Historic Urban Landscape (UNESCO)
ICCROM	International Centre for the Study of the Preservation and Restoration of Cultural Property
ICOMOS	International Council on Monuments and Sites
IPBES	Intergovernmental Platform on Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services
IUCN	International Union for Conservation of Nature
MoE	Ministry of the Environment, Japan
OUV	Outstanding Universal Value (World Heritage Convention)
SDG	Sustainable Development Goals (UN Agenda 2030)
SOC	State of Conservation (World Heritage)
UN	United Nations
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
WCPA	World Commission on Protected Areas (IUCN)
WH	World Heritage
WHITRAP	World Heritage Institute of Training and Research Asia and the Pacific

Foreword



The Convention concerning the Protection of World Cultural and Natural Heritage, adopted by UNESCO in 1972, is the only international legal instrument that deals with the safeguarding of places holding Outstanding Universal Value for cultural and/or natural significance. The category of mixed cultural and natural heritage has been used from the beginning of its implementation for places which contain both natural and cultural values transcending national borders and are universally significant for all humanity and future generations. However, the definition of mixed sites was only included in the Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the Convention in 2005.

After more than 40 years of listing, only 39 of the 1121 inscribed are mixed cultural and natural heritage. This denotes that nominating properties justifying Outstanding Universal Value for both nature and culture is a challenging task. One of the reasons found is that until 1992, there were cultural references under natural criteria, hence, a number of natural sites inscribed before that date- when Cultural Landscapes categories were integrated and the criteria for justifying inscription redrafted- could have been today nominated as mixed or even mixed cultural landscapes. Yet, of the more than 100 properties inscribed so far as cultural landscapes, only 10 are also mixed. Regarding the criteria, it can be noted that certain criteria are found more often in the nominations of mixed sites: cultural criterion (iii), and natural criterion (vii), which is natural beauty, which in itself is a cultural concept that is not present in any of the 6 cultural criteria. Added to this, some management challenges in mixed sites are related to the definition of boundaries, changes in interpretation of criteria, separated management systems for nature and culture, relationships with local communities, transboundary nature of many mixed sites, among other complexities.

These themes have been addressed on the fourth- and last of the series- Capacity Building Workshop on Nature-Culture Linkages in Heritage Conservation held in 2019. The UNESCO Chair on Nature-Culture Linkages in Heritage Conservation at the University of Tsukuba in collaboration with the UNESCO World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies to the World Heritage Convention, IUCN, ICCROM and ICOMOS, has completed the first phase of this 4-year capacity building programme, which has contributed to the implementation of the World Heritage Capacity Building Strategy, bringing together natural heritage and cultural heritage practitioners of Asia and the Pacific and beyond, to exchange on the potential of integrated management of heritage landscapes and their natural and cultural values.

The Special Issue 2020 of the Journal of World Heritage Studies of the University of Tsukuba includes the outcomes of the workshop and the International Symposium on Nature-Culture Linkages in Heritage Conservation on Mixed Cultural and Natural Heritage. Renowned international and Japanese experts shared their experience on the challenges of an integrated management of World Heritage places potentially fulfilling or inscribed for both natural and cultural criteria. Moreover, lessons learned of the 4-year programme were shared by the organizers and potential next steps discussed.

The Special Issue 2020 covers 8 cases from CBWNCL 2019 participants, 7 of which illustrate examples from Asia and the Pacific, and 1 from Africa. 2 have been inscribed as mixed sites, 1 is a cultural landscape, 2 are in the Tentative List of their respective country, 3 are protected at the national level. Furthermore, a special contribution from Pimachiowin Aki World Heritage, Canada, inscribed in 2018 as a mixed site and a cultural landscape brings a detailed testimony about the challenges described above including management by Indigenous Peoples. This broad range of case studies illustrate the complexities of nominating, evaluating and managing mixed sites of Outstanding Universal Value. It also opens pathways towards more holistic approaches on heritage conservation and sustainable development globally.

Mechtild Rössler
Director, UNESCO World Heritage Centre

Introduction



The 4th Capacity Building Workshop on Nature-Culture Linkages in Heritage Conservation in Asia and the Pacific, focusing on the theme of “Mixed Cultural and Natural Heritage,” was organized by the UNESCO Chair on Nature-Culture Linkages at the University of Tsukuba, Japan, in collaboration with the UNESCO World Heritage Centre, ICCROM, IUCN, and ICOMOS. This workshop was the final in a series of four workshops, running from 2016 to 2019. It brought together individuals from the culture and nature sectors, ten heritage practitioners from Asia and the Pacific: Australia, China, India, Indonesia, Nepal, Philippines, Thailand, and Vietnam; one from Africa (Tanzania), one from Europe (Albania). They were joined by eight graduate students from the Certificate Programme on Nature Conservation at the University of Tsukuba from Brazil, China, Ghana, Japan, and Thailand, who took part in the process as observers.

This Special Issue 2020 of the Journal of World Heritage Studies is divided into two parts. Part 1 starts with a special contribution from Pimachiowin Aki World Heritage site, followed by the case studies of 8 of the 12 participants of the CBWNCL 2019 that have been peer-reviewed and published. In Part 2, the activities developed during the workshop are compiled, structured by modules.

In **Module 1: Understanding Nature-Culture Linkages in the Context of Mixed Cultural and Natural Heritage**, lecturers and participants were invited to the University’s campus for four days. The lectures given by international heritage experts, in both the nature and culture sectors, have been summarized. The 12 participants’ case study presentations and the following group discussions are reported.

In **Module 2: Management, Implementation, and Governance**, there is a recount of the four-day field trip to the prefectures of Yamanashi and Shizuoka, where the components of the World Heritage property “Fujisan, sacred place and source of artistic inspiration,” are located.

In **Module 3: Reflection on Theory and Practice**, participants were placed into working groups. The outcomes of each group on the analysis of and recommendations for the World Heritage visited are described.

In **Module 4: International Symposium**, the keynotes and debates are summarized. Five international experts participated, representatives of the partner organizations –UNESCO World Heritage Centre, IUCN, ICCROM, and ICOMOS– and two representatives of the Japanese Government – one from the Ministry of the Environment and one from the Agency for Cultural Affairs. Finally, the conclusions of the workshop, based on the outcomes of the participants’ reflections and the symposium debates regarding the challenges faced in Mixed Cultural and Natural Heritage, within the region and globally, are reported.

In the annexes, the abstracts of participants’ presentations (Annex 1), the list of participants (Annex 2) and the program of the workshop (Annex 3) can be found.

Acknowledgements



The editors would like to thank the editorial board of the Journal of World Heritage Studies for their continuous support in the publication of the CBWNCL Proceedings as a special issue of the Journal.

We would like to thank the collaboration of our partners, ICCROM, IUCN, ICOMOS and the UNESCO World Heritage Centre, and their support to the UNESCO Chair on Nature-Culture Linkages in Heritage Conservation during these four years of the capacity building programme. Special thanks go to Dr. Mechtild Rössler, Director of the UNESCO World Heritage Centre for her kind support and collaboration. Moreover, we would like to especially thank Jessica Brown, Steve Brown, Edwin Bernbaum, Kristal Buckley, Marlon Martin and Gamini Wijesuriya for accepting collaborating as reviewers of this fourth special issue of the Journal of World Heritage Studies. We would like to acknowledge the patient cooperation of the authors who have carefully work on their articles, contributing to a diverse and rich illustration of landscapes in Asia and the Pacific region and beyond, showcasing important issues in relation to mixed cultural and natural heritage and the inextricability between nature and culture in significant heritage places.

Thanks are also due to the academic and administrative staff of the World Heritage Studies and Certificate Programme on Nature Conservation at the University of Tsukuba for accompanying this project. The cooperation of the graduate students involved in these programs is also appreciated, their support during the symposium has been indispensable.

Maya Ishizawa, Nobuko Inaba and Masahito Yoshida
Bonn, Tokyo and Tsukuba, 2020

