

Bethuel, Fabrice

A counterexample to the weak density of smooth maps between manifolds in Sobolev spaces.

(English) [\[Zbl 07160156\]](#)

Invent. Math. 219, No. 2, 507-651 (2020).

Let M and N be two manifolds with \mathcal{N} isometrically embedded in some euclidean space \mathbb{R}^l and \mathcal{M} possibly having nonempty boundary. For given numbers $0 < s < \infty$ and $1 \leq p < \infty$, this paper is concerned with the Sobolev space

$$W^{s,p}(\mathcal{M}, \mathcal{N}) = \{u \in W^{s,p}(\mathcal{M}, \mathbb{R}^l) \mid u(x) \in N \text{ for almost every } x \in M\}.$$

The study of these spaces is motivated particularly by various problems in physics, such as liquid crystal theory, Yang-Mills-Higgs or Ginzburg-Landau models, in which singularities of topological nature loom, yielding maps which are not continuous but lie in suitable Sobolev spaces, built up in view of the corresponding variational frameworks. The seminal work of *R. Schoen* and *K. Uhlenbeck* [*J. Differ. Geom.* 18, 253–268 (1983; [Zbl 0547.58020](#))] has sparked rapid development in research of this field for last decades. The approximation of maps in $W^{s,p}(\mathcal{M}, \mathcal{N})$ by smooth maps or maps with singularities of prescribed type lies central. The author restricts himself to the case $s = 1$ in the paper. It turns out that when $1 \leq p < \dim \mathcal{M}$, the answer to the approximation problem is strongly related to the $[p]$ -th homotopy group $\pi_{[p]}(\mathcal{N})$ of the target manifold \mathcal{N} , where $[]$ stands for the Gauss symbol.

This paper is concerned with approximation by sequences of smooth maps at the level of weak convergence.

It was observed in [*F. Bethuel*, *Acta Math.* 167, No. 3–4, 153–206 (1991; [Zbl 0756.46017](#))] that

Theorem. Assume that

$$1 \leq p < m$$

and

$$\pi_{[p]}(\mathcal{N}) \neq 0$$

Then $C^\infty(\mathbb{B}^m, \mathcal{N})$ is not sequentially weakly dense in $W^{1,p}(\mathbb{B}^m, \mathcal{N})$.

It was shown in [*F. Bethuel*, *Ann. Inst. Henri Poincaré, Anal. Non Linéaire* 7, No. 4, 269–286 (1990; [Zbl 0708.58004](#)); *Acta Math.* 167, No. 3–4, 153–206 (1991; [Zbl 0756.46017](#)); *F. Bethuel* and *X. Zheng*, *J. Funct. Anal.* 80, No. 1, 60–75 (1988; [Zbl 0657.46027](#))] that

Theorem. Let p be an integer. Given any manifold \mathcal{M} , $C^\infty(\mathcal{M}, \mathbb{S}^p)$ sequentially weakly dense in $W^{1,p}(\mathcal{M}, \mathbb{S}^p)$.

A positive answer was given in [*P. Hajlasz*, *Nonlinear Anal., Theory Methods Appl.* 22, No. 12, 1579–1591 (1994; [Zbl 0820.46028](#))] for $(p - 1)$ -connected manifolds \mathcal{N} and in [*M. R. Pakzad* and *T. Rivière*, *Geom. Funct. Anal.* 13, No. 1, 223–257 (2003; [Zbl 1028.58008](#))] in the case $p = 2$ for whatever manifold \mathcal{N} . Similar results involving H^2 energy were given in [*R. Hardt* and *T. Rivière*, *Calc. Var. Partial Differ. Equ.* 54, No. 3, 2713–2749 (2015; [Zbl 06505905](#))].

The main result of the paper is

Theorem. Given any manifold \mathcal{M} of dimension larger or equal to 4, $C^\infty(\mathcal{M}, \mathbb{S}^2)$ is not sequentially weakly dense in $W^{1,3}(\mathcal{M}, \mathbb{S}^2)$.

The author explicitly constructs a map which is not weakly approximable in $W^{1,3}(\mathcal{M}, \mathbb{S}^2)$ by maps in $C^\infty(\mathcal{M}, \mathbb{S}^2)$. One of the central ingredients in the argument is strongly related to issues in branched transportation and irrigation theory in the critical exponential case. When the domain \mathcal{M} has a more sophisticated topology, it was shown in [*F. Hang* and *F. Lin*, *Math. Res. Lett.* 8, No. 3, 321–330 (2001; [Zbl 1049.46018](#)); *Acta Math.* 191, No. 1, 55–107 (2003; [Zbl 1061.46032](#))] that the topology of \mathcal{M} might induce some additional obstructions to the approximation problem.

Reviewer: [Hirokazu Nishimura \(Tsukuba\)](#)

MSC:

58C25 Differentiable maps on manifolds

46E35 Sobolev spaces and other spaces of “smooth” functions, embedding theorems, trace theorems

Full Text: [DOI](#)

References:

- [1] Almgreen, F.; Browder, F.; Lieb, E.; Chern, S., Co-area, liquid crystals, and minimal surfaces, *Partial Differential Equations* (Tianjin, 1986), 1-22 (1988), Berlin: Springer, Berlin
- [2] Alberti, G.; Baldo, S.; Orlandi, G., Variational convergence for functionals of Ginzburg-Landau type, *Indiana Univ. Math. J.*, 54, 1411-1472 (2005) · [Zbl 1160.35013](#)
- [3] Auckly, D.; Kapitanski, L., The Pontrjagin-Hopf invariants for Sobolev maps, *Commun. Contemp. Math*, 12, 121-181 (2010) · [Zbl 1198.58009](#)
- [4] Bernot, M.; Caselles, V.; Morel, Jm, *Optimal Transportation Networks. Models and Theory*, 200 (2009), Berlin: Springer, Berlin · [Zbl 1163.90001](#)
- [5] Bethuel, F., A characterization of maps in $(H^1(\mathbb{B}^3, \mathbb{S}^2))$ which can be approximated by smooth maps, *Ann. Inst. H. Poincaré Anal. Non Linéaire*, 7, 269-286 (1990) · [Zbl 0708.58004](#)
- [6] Bethuel, F., The approximation problem for Sobolev maps between two manifolds, *Acta Math.*, 167, 153-206 (1991) · [Zbl 0756.46017](#)
- [7] Bethuel, F., The Jacobian, the square root and the set (∞) , *J. Math. Anal. Appl.*, 352, 548-572 (2009) · [Zbl 1173.35038](#)
- [8] Bethuel, F.; Brezis, H.; Coron, Jm; Berestycki, H.; Coron, Jm; Ekeland, I., Relaxed energies for harmonic maps, *Variational Methods* (Paris, 1988), 37-52 (1990), Berlin: Springer, Berlin · [Zbl 0793.58011](#)
- [9] Bethuel, F.; Chiron, D., Some questions related to the lifting problem in Sobolev spaces, in *Perspectives in nonlinear partial differential equations*, *Contemp. Math.*, 446, 125-152 (2007) · [Zbl 1201.46029](#)
- [10] Bethuel, F.; Zheng, X., Density of smooth functions between two manifolds in Sobolev spaces, *J. Funct. Anal.*, 80, 60-75 (1988) · [Zbl 0657.46027](#)
- [11] Brezis, H.; Coron, Jm; Lieb, Eh, Harmonic maps with defects, *Commun. Math. Phys.*, 107, 649-705 (1986) · [Zbl 0608.58016](#)
- [12] Devillanova, G.; Solimini, S., On the dimension of an irrigable measure, *Rend. Semin. Mat. Univ. Padova*, 117, 1-49 (2007) · [Zbl 1165.28302](#)
- [13] Giaquinta, M.; Modica, G.; Soucek, J., The Dirichlet energy of mappings with values into the sphere, *Manuscr. Math.*, 65, 489-507 (1989) · [Zbl 0678.49006](#)
- [14] Giaquinta, M.; Modica, G.; Soucek, J., *Cartesian Currents in the Calculus of Variations. I. Cartesian Currents* (1998), Berlin: Springer, Berlin · [Zbl 0914.49001](#)
- [15] Hajlasz, P., Approximation of Sobolev mappings, *Nonlinear Anal.*, 22, 1579-1591 (1994) · [Zbl 0820.46028](#)
- [16] Hang, F.; Lin, Fh, Topology of Sobolev mappings, *Math. Res. Lett.*, 8, 321-330 (2001) · [Zbl 1049.46018](#)
- [17] Hang, F.; Lin, Fh, Topology of Sobolev mappings II, *Acta Math.*, 191, 55-107 (2003) · [Zbl 1061.46032](#)
- [18] Hardt, R.; Rivière, T., Connecting topological Hopf singularities, *Ann. Sc. Norm. Super. Pisa Cl. Sci.*, 2, 287-344 (2003) · [Zbl 1150.58004](#)
- [19] Hardt, R., Rivière, T.: *Ensembles singuliers topologiques dans les espaces fonctionnels entre variétés*, Séminaire EDP, Ecole Polytechnique (2001-2002)
- [20] Hardt, R.; Rivière, T., Connecting rational homotopy type singularities, *Acta Math.*, 200, 15-83 (2008) · [Zbl 1148.58003](#)
- [21] Hardt, R., Rivière, T.: *Sequential weak approximation of maps of finite Hessian energy*, preprint (2014) · [Zbl 06505905](#)
- [22] Kosinski, A., *Differential Manifolds, Pure and Applied Mathematics* (1993), Cambridge: Academic Press, Cambridge
- [23] Lin, Fh; Hardt, R., Mappings minimizing the (L^p) norm of the gradient, *Commun. Pure Appl. Math.*, 40, 555-588 (1987) · [Zbl 0646.49007](#)
- [24] Monastyrsky, M., *Topology of Gauge Fields and Condensed Matter* (1993), New York: Plenum Press, New York · [Zbl 0863.53050](#)
- [25] Pakzad, M.; Rivière, T., Weak density of smooth maps for the Dirichlet energy between manifolds, *Geom. Funct. Anal.*, 13, 223-257 (2003) · [Zbl 1028.58008](#)
- [26] Pontrjagin, L., A classification of mappings of the three-dimensional complex into the two-dimensional sphere, *Rec. Math. [Mat. Sbornik] N.S.*, 9, 51, 331-363 (1941) · [Zbl 67.0736.01](#)
- [27] Rivière, T., Minimizing fibrations and p-harmonic maps in homotopy classes from (\mathbb{S}^3) into (\mathbb{S}^2) , *Commun. Anal. Geom.*, 6, 427-483 (1998) · [Zbl 0914.58010](#)
- [28] Schoen, R.; Uhlenbeck, K., Boundary regularity and the Dirichlet problem for harmonic maps, *J. Differ. Geom.*, 18, 253-268 (1983) · [Zbl 0547.58020](#)
- [29] Xia, Q., Optimal paths related to transport problems, *Commun. Contemp. Math.*, 5, 251-279 (2003) · [Zbl 1032.90003](#)

- [30] Xia, Qinglan; Vershynina, Anna, On the Transport Dimension of Measures, *SIAM Journal on Mathematical Analysis*, 41, 6, 2407-2430 (2010) · [Zbl 1203.49064](#)

This reference list is based on information provided by the publisher or from digital mathematics libraries. Its items are heuristically matched to zbMATH identifiers and may contain data conversion errors. It attempts to reflect the references listed in the original paper as accurately as possible without claiming the completeness or perfect precision of the matching.