I. 市民社会における下からの運動と公共性

1．「下からの政治」とアフリカにおける国家　岩田拓夫

2. Role of Human Rights Movement during the Democratic Process in Togo
岩田拓夫

3. 先住民政権の挑戦：
「新しいボリビア」の建設に向けた困難な道のり　遅野井茂雄

4. 社会運動から学ぶ公共政策—ブラジルの『土地なし農村労働者運動』(MST)の事例
近藤エジソン謙二

5. Learning from the Movement of Landless Rural Workers:
Strategies to Build a Better World　近藤エジソン謙二

6. O Movimento dos Trabalhadores Rurais Sem Terra no Rio Grande do Sul
近藤エジソン謙二

1.「下からの政治」とアフリカにおける国家*

筑波大学大学院　人文社会科学研究科　現代文化・公共政策専攻　講師　岩田拓夫

1 はじめに

1990 年代以降、アフリカ諸国は民主化という大きな政治的変動を経験した。多くのアフリカ諸国では、一党制や軍事政権から多党制に移行し、より多元的で時に不安定な政治的環境に置かれるようになった。

アフリカ政治研究においては、国家のあり方、そして国家における統治のあり方をどのように理解し、また発展させていくのかという点が絶えず問い直されてきた。国家建設、一党制民主主義、アフリカ的社会主義、新家産主義、胃袋の政治(1)、パトロン・クライアンテリズム、リゾーム国家、破綻国家、軍閥国家、民主化、紛争、市民社会、国家の犯罪化、半権威主義など、さまざまな観点からアフリカの国家や統治に関する議論が続けられてきた。

独立後のアフリカ政治史は、国家と統治のあり方を模索しながら形成されてきた。近年のグローバリゼーションは、統治や開発主体としての国家の相対化を加速させている。NGO の役割の増大や地方分権化などが注目される中で、国家の役割は見直しを迫られている。

国家をめぐる環境の変化を背景として、近年、アフリカの国家に関する研究が再び注目されている。しかし、アフリカの国家を論じることが重要であるという問題意識の共有があるとしても、その方法論は一様ではない。それ以前に、国家の定義自体も問われなければならないところであるが、本章では、国家を一定の領域に影響を及ぼす統治機構の総体と緩やかに理解している。国家に関する研究は、通常、統治機構や制度の中心から周辺へという権力のベクトルに沿って行われるのが一般的な方法であるが、本章では統治機構の中心からではなく、逆にフォーマルな政治制度からあぶれた政治的周辺領域からアフリカの国家について考えてみたい。

本章では、「下からの政治」(le politique par le bas)という観点から、政治的周辺部からのまなざしを通じてアフリカの国家について考えてゆきたい。フォーマルな制度の外にある「下からの政治」は国家論を正面から論じるものではなく、本章が描くアフリカの国家像は限定的なものにとどまる。その反面、「下からの政治」は制度的な観点からは見えにくいアフリカの国家の性格を拾い上げ、政治的周辺に置かれた人々の権力との関わり方を描く方法を提供する。「下からの政治」はアフリカの民主化運動につながった人々の意識変化の触媒となり、そして民主化プロセスの進展の中でその性質自体を変容させていった。「下からの政治」は公式な制度の中に現れない別の角度からアフリカの国家を照射しているとも言える。

「下からの政治」の転換点として注目するのは、国民会議(Conférence nationale souveraine)であ

---

* 本稿は、川端正久・落合雄彦編『アフリカ国家を再考する』(晃洋書房、2006年)の第六章(171-194頁)に収録された論文である。

った[2]。国民会議によって開始された民主化プロセスの中で対照的な政治的歩みを見せたのが、隣国同士で国家をめぐる条件と歴史的歩みに共通点を持つベナンとトーゴであった。そして、この両国において「下からの政治」は対照的な展開を見せた。

では、両国の国家はどのように理解されてきたのだろうか。独立後のアフリカの国家をめぐる主要な論点の一つであった新植民地主義論の観点から、民主化までの両国の国家の歩みを振り返ってみる。ここでは新植民地主義を、欧米諸国による植民地支配が揺らぎ出した1950年代後半以降、形式的に独立を付与しながらも、政治的支配と経済的搾取を維持・強化するために再編成された新たな支配体系の総体である(川端 1980:13,54-55)と定義する。アフリカの独立後も政治、軍事、経済、文化のあらゆる面で影響力維持を試みてきた代表的な新植民地主義国である旧宗主国フランスとの関係において、トーゴは新植民地主義に突き進み、ベナンは脱落した。

独立直後、トーゴはフランスの新植民地主義から脱却を図ろうとしたのに対して、アフリカのカルチェ・ラタンとも呼ばれたベナン(当時ダホメー)は新植民地主義とともに生きようとした。しかし、両国共に独立から3年を迎えた時期に起された軍事クーデタによって政権が転覆し、その後の混乱を経て誕生した軍事政権は、独立直後の両国の新植民地主義に対する姿勢を180度転回した。トーゴはフランスとの関係を回復し、新植民地主義的な国際関係の中で国家運営を行った。一方、ベナンはマルクス・レーニン主義を掲げ、フランス企業の大規模な国有化を進めたためフランスとの関係を損ない、親仏的なアフリカ諸国とも距離を置き、新植民地主義のレールから外れた道を進んだ。

本章では、国民会議を分岐点とするベナンとトーゴにおける「下からの政治」の比較検討を通して、現代アフリカの国家像の変容を考えてゆきたい。

2 「下からの政治」とアフリカの国家

「下からの政治」研究は、1980 年にバヤール(Jean-François Bayart)らを中心に、フランスの国際関係研究所(Centre d'Etudes et de Recherches Internationales:CERI)の「政治行動の大衆様式」(Mode populaire des actions politiques)研究グループにおいて開始された(Bayart 1992:9)。「下からの政治」研究は、近代化論から従属論に至る研究アプローチが、歴史超越性や普遍性を強調するあまりに、アフリカの歴史を軽視していることを批判するところから始まった。また、「下からの政治」研究はフーコー(M.Foucault)、ドゥルーズ(G.Deleuze)、ドゥ・セルトー(M. de Certeau)、ブルデュー(P.Bourdieu)らフランス現代思想に関わる研究から強い影響を受けた(Bayart 1992:13)。「下からの政治」研究は、政治研究に歴史学、地理学、人類学、言語学、社会学的方法論を学際的に取り入れることを試みた。バヤール、ンベンベ(A.Mbembe)、トゥラボ(C.Toulabor)による共著『黒アフリカにおける下からの政治』(1992 年)という著作が「下からの政治」研究の帰結点である。

「下からの政治」研究が注目したのは、目に見える形で出現する政治行動に至る前段階の日常生活の中で繰り広げられる、政治性を帯びた日々の手管(tactiques)やほのめかしなどを通じてにじみ出てくる政治的行為であった。研究グループの中で、最も積極的に実証研究を試みたのがトーゴ人

研究者トゥラボであった。トゥラボはエヤデマ(Gnassingbé Eyadéma)体制の圧政の下で、受動的ながらも、工夫をして国家・権力と向かい合うトーゴ大衆の政治的行動を描こうとした。

「下からの政治」を考える上で注目されたのは、「重要でない人物の政治行動」(Actions politiques des sans importants)であった。被支配層に位置づけられる「重要でない人物」は、「社会的末っ子」(cadets sociaux)として、「社会的長男」(ainés sociaux)である政治エリートとつながっている(Bayart 1979:233-281)。バヤールは、カメルーンに関する研究を中心に支配層と被支配層を包摂する脱中心的な人間関係のネットワークによって構成されるアフリカの国家のあり様をリゾーム(根茎)国家(Etat-rhizome)(大林1996)と表現した。

では「下からの政治」とは何か。「下からの政治」と言えば、抑圧を受けてきた社会層の国家や支配層に抵抗する政治行動がまずイメージされるだろう。しかし、本章で議論する「下からの政治」は、その部分を含みながらも性悪的な国家、権力構造に敢然と立ち向かう個人と集団の抵抗という、国家機関を頂点とする上からの抑圧に対する反作用には限定されない。「下からの政治」は「正義」や反国家であることを前提とはせず、これまで支配や権力に対して受動的な主体としてのみ認識されてきた人々や集団がしたたかに生き抜こうとする政治的な営みであり、またそのことに注目するための研究アプローチである。

制度との関係で見れば、「下からの政治」は国家や政党、軍部、官僚機構を通じて行われる「上からの政治」に対して相対的に認識される概念であり、その理解に曖昧さが残されることは否めない。そしてこの両者は、必ずしも対の関係にあるわけではない。「下からの政治」は、「上からの政治」が展開される政治社会からあぶれた社会層、大衆の政治行動を考えることに重点が置かれている。研究アプローチとしての「下からの政治」は、将来に政治行動として顕在化する可能性を含む、「政治的なもの」(le politique)の理解に重きを置いている。「下からの政治」は、中央—地方という行政制度レベルにおける区分や草の根という視点に限定されるものではなく、国家権力に関心を持ちながらも蚊帳の外に置かれた人々や社会層の政治的な関わり方(engagement)である。換言すれば、「下からの政治」は選挙、政党や利益集団などを通じた通常の政治的意思表明方法以外のルート、手段を通じて展開される政治的行動やふるまいであり、またそのことを理解することを重視した政治研究アプローチである。

しかし、1980 年代初めにフランスのアフリカ政治研究者に大きな影響を与えた「下からの政治」研究に対する批判は、時間とともに強くなった。主な批判は、アフリカの歴史性を尊重すると主張しながらフランス現代思想に過度に依存していること、不必要に詩的で難解な用語を振り回していること、日常生活における大衆の政治的ふるまいを過大評価していることなどであった。後に「下からの政治」研究に強く反発したメダール(J.-F.Médard)は、「新家産主義」(neo-patrimonialism)という考え方を提唱し、上からの政治研究の重要性を主張した。一方でシャバル(P.Chabal)は、バヤールらの著書『アフリカにおける下からの政治』に関して晦渋な言葉遣いを批判しながらも、「下からの政治」に関心を払うことは重要であると評価している(Chabal 1994:85,91)。

本章で注目する「下からの政治」研究への批判は、「下からの政治」は政治的局面の変化の理解

に貢献しないというものであった(Bourmaud 1997:57)。1980年代の「下からの政治」研究では、時代を反映して国家体制が比較的安定した権威主義的な一党制を前提として、大衆が権力に対してどのように受動的抵抗や接近を行うのかに焦点が当てられてきた。しかし、民主化に代表されるアフリカ諸国における大きな政治変動の局面に際して、「下からの政治」が民主化に対してどのような意味を持ち、また民主化によって「下からの政治」がどのように変化したのかという点に関する考察は曖昧なままに留まってきた。そこで、一党制の時代に提起された「下からの政治」という研究アプローチが、政治的変動期においてアフリカ政治とその舞台としての国家を理解する上で、どのような意味を持つのか、という問題意識の下で議論を進めていく。

上に挙げたさまざまな批判にさらされて、研究アプローチとしての影響力を減退させる一方で、「下からの政治」は英米諸国を中心に市民社会論の文脈で読み替えられ、形を変えてアフリカ政治研究に影響力を及ぼすようになった。そこでは、「下からの政治」は非民主的で権威主義的な国家に抵抗する民主化運動に還元されて理解された。その契機となったのが、バヤールの「アフリカの市民社会」(Civil Society in Africa、仏語原題は「アフリカ社会の反逆」)(Bayart 1986:109-125)[3]という英訳論文とされた。やがて市民社会概念は援助などの実務の領域にも影響を及ぼすようになった。

しかし、「下からの政治」を単線的に民主化を志向するアフリカ市民社会論に還元する傾向に対して、理論的主導者のバヤールは異を唱えた。「下からの政治」や市民社会の行動は、アプリオリに「正義」を体現しているわけではなく、暴力や排除、支配や権力という性善的な民主化主体から逸脱する性格も併せ持っていることを強調した。実際、アフリカ市民社会論と読み替えられた上記のバヤール論文では、市民社会性善説や民主化運動への還元という固定観念を相対化する文脈で議論が行われていた(Bayart 1992:18)。市民社会とは、国家に関わり、権力の脱全体主義化(国家の相対化)をはかるものではあるが、国家に対して動態的で、複雑で、両面的な関係(単に対立的であるばかりではない)にある[4]。それは 1990 年代後半にバヤールによって議論された「国家の犯罪化」(Criminalization of the State)(Bayart 1999)という議論とも矛盾しない。

「下からの政治」を考えることは、アフリカの国家をめぐる権力関係の問い直しでもある。ここでいう「権力」とは、ウェーバー的な暴力の独占を背景とする社会関係の中で抵抗を排除してでも自己の意志を貫徹しうる全ての可能性として理解されるもの(Weber 1971:95)に加えて、フーコー的な権力論(柳内隆2001)の視座を含んでいる。「下からの政治」研究に影響を与えたフーコーの権力論は、権力を上から(国家機関)の法の強制と暴力によってもたらされる支配と従属の一方的関係の中だけで考えるのではなく、社会のさまざまな場面で戦略的に繰り返され、人々を主体化する力関係の総体という側面を照らし出している。暴力以外の権力関係について指摘したフーコーの下からの権力論を念頭に入れつつ、権力と向き合う主体に注目して「下からの政治」に関する議論を進めてゆきたい[5]。

次に、「下からの政治」の転換点となった国民会議に関して検討する。

3 「下からの政治」の転換点としての国民会議

国民会議は、民主化運動を経て「市民社会」組織や合法化された野党を中心とした民主化勢力が暫定的に主権を体現・行使し、民主化移行と国民和解の実行主体となろうとした国民対話フォーラムであった。国民会議の開催によって開始された民主化は、国民会議を経ることなく権威主義的な政治指導者の権力が維持された状態で民主化が開始された、他のアフリカ諸国とは状況が異なっていた。また、民主化運動の中で「市民社会」が重要な役割を果した結果、暫定的にではあるにせよ国家権力の移動を伴う民主化の開始を実現した国民会議は、アフリカ人の政治意識に少なからず影響を与えた。ベナンでは、アフリカ諸国初の国民会議が開催されてから 15 年を経た現在においても、なお政府、政治家から大衆レベルまで国民会議は語られ続けている。

旧フランス領アフリカ諸国を中心に開催された国民会議は、フランス革命前後に招集された三部会(Etats généraux)や国民公会(Convention nationale)(河野1969:57-68、101-219)を歴史的モチーフとしていた(Noudjenoume 1999:145-146, 373-374)[6]。国民会議が招集された時期は、フランス革命から約 200 年後にあたり、当事者達は国民会議による民主化改革をフランス革命になぞって語った。また、国民会議待望論はフランス語圏アフリカ諸国にとどまるものではなく、ギニアビサウでは名目的に招集され[7]、ケニアやナイジェリアでも開催要求が起こった(Eboussi Boulaga 1993:15)。

国民会議は、当初、旧体制側から「文民クーデタ」(coup d'état civil)と非難されることもあったが(Buijtenhuijs 1993:61-62)、そのように言えないのは、権限は大きく制限されたものの民主化移行期間における大統領の地位は保証されたことであった。国民会議会期中、およびその後の民主化移行期においては、原則として大統領の職権は、条約への署名、外交使節の接受、軍隊の統帥者という儀礼的なものに縮小され、職務実行は国民会議の決定、指示に従うものとされた。

各国の状況によるが、国民会議が最終的に目指したところは、一年前後と定めた民主化移行期間中に新憲法を立案し、その可否を問う国民投票を実施し、次いで選挙法改正をはじめとする民主化への政治制度を改革した上で国政選挙を実施して、民主的手続きを経て選ばれた政権に権限を移譲することであった。国民会議は、新憲法が成立するまでの民主化移行期間中の暫定憲法となる国民会議法令(Acte de conférence nationale)を制定し、暫定統治機関として民主化移行政府(Gouvernement de la transition)を設置し、民主化プロセスの指導者として首相を選出した。国民議会(Assemblée nationale)に代わる立法機関として共和国高等評議会(Haut Conseil de la République:HCR)[8]を設置し、評議員と議長を選出した。HCRは新憲法案の作成、選挙法の改正、さらに民主化移行政府および選挙の監督を主要な任務とした。

国民会議の招集は、単にアフリカ諸国の民主化プロセス開始を告げただけではなく、独立後の国家と統治のあり方の問い直しと、国民和解の実現が期待された。国民会議では、各参加組織の代表者によって、これまでの国家のあり方に関する演説が次々と行われた。このように、国民会議はアフリカの国家の転換点となろうとした。国民会議での政治史の問い直しは、「下からの政治」のあり方にも影響を及ぼした。「下からの政治」が議論されるようになってから現在まで 20 年の歳月を経たが、そ

の中間点となる1990年代初めに招集された国民会議は、「下からの政治」の転換点ともなった。

しかし、国民会議招集によって民主化プロセスが開始された各国のその後の政治的展開は一様ではなかった。ベナン、コンゴ(ブラザビル)、ガボン、マリ、ニジェール、チャド、トーゴ、ザイール(コンゴ民主共和国)の8カ国の国民会議の会期期間だけを見ても、ベナンの10日間からコンゴの105日間までさまざまであった[9]。

国民会議を迎えて民主化プロセスが開始されながら、対照的に政治的な歩みを見せたのが、ベナンとトーゴであった。ベナンはアフリカの民主化モデルとして現在も高い評価が続いているのに対し、トーゴは同じく国民会議招集によって民主化プロセスが開始されながらも、民主化の停滞・挫折のためにヨーロッパ連合(EU)を中心に10年以上も援助が停止・制限された状態が続いている。

次に、対照的な民主化の歩みを見せたベナンとトーゴの比較検討を通して、「下からの政治」の国民会議や民主化との関係、そしてアフリカの国家像の変化を考えていく。

4「下からの政治」と民主化プロセス

「下からの政治」が、国民会議を分岐点としてどのようにアフリカの国家像の変容に関係したのかを実証的検討を通して考える。ベナンとトーゴには、政治的歩みにおいて多くの共通項がある。ともにフランスの植民地支配[10]を受け、独立後は政治的不安定、度重なるクーデタと20年前後に及ぶ軍人指導者による独裁的な政治体制を経験した末に、国民会議招集によって民主化プロセスが開始された。しかしながら、1990年代以降の両国の民主化プロセスは対照的な歩みを見せた。

多党制移行後のベナンは、国際社会からアフリカの民主化モデルと評価され、その評価を担保として援助国や援助機関から支援を受けて近年発展を遂げつつある。またベナン人の間には、ベナンは単に民主化モデルであるだけでなく、「国民会議によって」民主化を実現したという自負心が強い。そのため国民会議招集から15年を経た現在も、「国民会議」という言葉は政府文書やメディアだけでなく、大衆レベルにおいても頻繁に見聞きする。国民会議を指導したコトヌ大司教のドゥ・スーザ卿(Isidore de Souza)を称える声は、同卿の没後5年以上を経た現在も止むことがない。

一方、トーゴも国民会議を招集して民主化プロセスを開始したが、国民会議は排除と対立の場と化し、民主的な体制転換を実現することなく、形骸化された多党制だけが残された。国際社会からトーゴは民主化の挫折の典型例と評価され、EUを中心に10年以上に及ぶ援助の停止もしくは制限が続いている(岩田1999:4-8、2001:4-8)[11]。

(1) ベナン

現在でこそアフリカの民主化モデルとされるが、ベナンの独立(1960年)後の歴史は混乱と抑圧にまみれたものであった。独立後12年間に軍事クーデタによる5度の政権交代が起った。政治的不安定の構造的問題である地域対立への妥協策として、1970年に3つの地域から2年毎に交代で大統領を選出する大統領輪番制が導入され、1972年にはマガ(H.Maga)からアオマデベ

(J.Ahomadégbé)への大統領交代が行われた。しかし、同年 10 月のケレク少佐(M.Kérékou)によるクーデタで、この制度は廃止された。

西側諸国からの支持を得られないケレク政権は東側諸国に接近し、1974 年にマルクス・レーニン主義を国家教義とした。国名を独立時のダホメーからベナン人民共和国に改称し、革命政党として「ベナン人民革命党」(Parti de la Révolution Populaire du Bénin:PRPB)を設立した。この擬似革命政権において、「反革命」分子の取締機関である革命防衛委員会が企業、官庁毎に配置され、人々を監視した(Noudjenoume 1999:29)。集会の自由は存在せず、国外に多くの政治的亡命者を出した。

しかし東側諸国からの援助不足や失政と腐敗によって、国家経済は破綻の途にあった。隣の大国ナイジェリアの経済不振は、ベナン経済を直撃した。世界銀行の介入も功を奏さず、ベナン経済は悪化の一途をたどった。肥大化した公的部門への給与遅配は常態化し、公務員は給与を「支給困難で足りない給与」(Salaire Insuffisant Difficilement Acquis)という意味でSIDA(フランス語でエイズの意)と呼び、収入を求めて公務を放棄し、畑を耕し、小商いをした(Noudjenoume 1999:93; Decalo1997:53)。

ベナンの「下からの政治」は、国家レベルの政治経済的破綻に向かう中で出現した。人々は生活の窮状を打破するために、恐怖の下でも止むに止まれず行動を起し、やがて国家のあり方自体を問う民主化運動に発展した。ベナンの「下からの政治」は衣食住の問題、埋葬の問題、子供の養育など日々の具体的な問題を動機とし、大衆、労働者、公務員、教員、学生、宗教関係者、知識人が担い手となった(Eboussi Boulaga 1993:33-34)。

1980 年代後半には、断続的に政府への要求が行われた。教育環境の改善、奨学金の支給、雇用の改善要求を掲げて、学生によるストライキが頻発した。学生運動は組織結成の自由を求め、国家体制を問うものへと変化していった。ベナン労働組合連合は PRPB の国家政党としての地位の廃止、多党制の導入、組織活動の自由を要求した。

ベナンにおいて、学生、教員、金融関係者、労働者、都市部のインフォーマル・セクター従事者などのさまざまなアクターによる抗議運動が展開されたが、それらの運動をまとめたのはダホメー共産党(Parti communiste du Dahomey:PCD)系の組織連合で 1988 年 10 月に結成された「人民の協定」(Convention du peuple)であった(Noudjenoume 1999:95-104)。

ベナン弁護士会会長ドス(R.Dossou)は、当局の権力濫用による非合法的逮捕による個人の自由侵害を非難し、ケレク大統領と会談した[12]。1989 年 7 月、民主化を求めたストライキに参加した教師の逮捕に対して、当局による公務員資格取消や給与カットの脅迫にも臆せず、教員組合はケレク大統領へ公開状(lettre ouverte)を出し、拘束された教師の解放と、全国民による対話フォーラムの開催を要求した。教員組合は給与遅配への抗議から始まり、政府の教育政策やがて国家のあり方にまで批判を向け、問題の解決は民主化であると主張した。教員組合はケレク大統領との直接会談にこぎつけ、給与遅配、学生への奨学金未払い問題の解決、ストライキに参加して逮捕された教師、学生の解放を要求し、最終的には国家の哲学の問題にまで話は及んだ。この出来事は、人々に 17 年間に及んだケレク政権の恐怖と抑圧に対抗するための自信を与えた(Lalinon Gbado 1996:55-59)。

ケレク体制の支配の道具は暴力と恐怖であり(Noudjenoume 1999:128)、暴力、富の分配に加えて個人崇拝を宗教のレベル(エヤデマ教)[13]にまで高めようとしたトーゴと比較すると権力基盤は弱かった。民主化運動、民主化プロセスに貢献したと評価されたカトリック教会は、ケレク体制下においても宗教的メッセージを逸脱しない範囲で政治的発言を行った(Noudjenoume 1999:135)。勢力拡大のためにエヤデマ体制と長らく蜜月関係を保ってきたトーゴのカトリック教会とは対照的であった。

ケレクは革命国民議会の議決により、1989 年 8 月初めに任期 5 年の大統領に再任されたが[14]、この時期から国民会議招集の要求が急速に高まった。8 月末、政治犯への恩赦が出され[15]、亡命していた政治家が国内での民主化運動に加わるようになった。

フランスは、ベナンがフランス革命前後の三部会や国民公会のような国民的対話フォーラムを開催して、民主化への道筋をつけることをケレク大統領に要求し、開催のための財政支援を約束した。12 月、PRPB中央委員会と革命国民議会の共同コミュニケとして、国家教義としてのマルクス・レーニン主義の放棄、PRPBの国家政党としての役割の終了、国民会議の招集を発表した[16]。2 カ月あまりの準備期間を経て、1990 年 2 月 19 日から 10 日間にわたってアフリカで初めて民主化と国民和解のための国民会議(Conférence nationale des forces vives de la nation)が開催された。国民会議には、歴代大統領および「賢人」、労働組合、各政党および政治団体、政府、革命国民議会、PRPB、在外ベナン人、大学関係者、農工業従事者、専門組織、地域振興組織などから計 488 名の代表者が参加し、ベナンの政治史の総括と今後の改革について議論した。国民会議での議論は、連日、テレビやラジオで生中継され、穏やかな議事進行は人々に将来への希望を与えた。

国民会議議長には、コトヌ大司教のドゥ・スーザ卿が選出された。ベナンのカトリック教会最高聖職者として国民統合の象徴の役割だけでなく、同卿の政治的妥協を引き出す手腕は国民会議が急進派によるケレク大統領および関係者への排斥の場と化さないために不可欠であった。ドゥ・スーザ卿は、国民会議後もベナン人に向けてメッセージを発し続けた。特に政治絡みの暴力に対しては、暴力は問題の解決をもたらさないことを繰り返し訴えた。メディアは比較的自由な報道を維持できた。国民会議は主権を宣言し、現行憲法を停止し、暫定的立法機関である共和国高等評議会(HCR)と民主化移行政府を創設した。移行政府首相には、これまでベナンの政治社会で目立った存在ではなかった元世界銀行理事のソグロ(N.Soglo)が行政能力を評価されて選出された[17]。

国民会議ではベナン政治史の総括を行いながらも、前体制、特にケレク大統領個人に対して寛容な姿勢を堅持した。ケレク大統領もトーゴのように軍事介入によって、力ずくで国民会議、その後の民主化移行体制を粉砕しようとはしなかった。そして、軍隊もケレクの影響下にありながらも民主化を支持した(Noudjenoume 1999:205)。

ケレク大統領は国民会議で演説を行い、民主化移行期間中の自身の身分保障を再三要求した上で、国民会議が民主化移行を主導することを容認した(Eboussi Boulaga 1993:74-75)。それに応えて、国民会議は招集を受け入れたケレク大統領の英断を称え、職権を大きく制限しながらも民主化移行期間のケレク大統領の身分保証[18]と、在任中の出来事のケレク大統領個人に対する免責法[19]を制定した。旧体制に対する国民会議の穏健な対応は、ベナン以外の国民会議を招集した他の

国々には見られなかったものであり[20]、対極として旧体制を激しく弾劾し、政治の場からの追放だけでなく、党資産凍結まで強行しようとしたのがトーゴであった。

共産党はエリート中心の国民会議代表の顔ぶれに抗議し、国民会議にも、その後の民主化プロセスにも参加しなかった。その結果、民主化運動に貢献しながらも、マルクス主義に固執した共産党は、国民会議以後のベナン政治への影響力を失った。

新憲法は 1990 年 12 月の国民投票において圧倒的な支持を受けて承認され、第7共和国憲法として公布された。1991 年 2 月から 3 月にかけて議会選挙と大統領選挙が実施され、ソグロがケレクを破って当選した[21]。ソグロ大統領への国際社会の期待は大きかったが、構造調整政策実施に対する反対は根強く、議会でも少数であったソグロは不安定な政権運営を強いられた(Noudjenoume 1999:281-285)[22]。

ベナンで穏健に民主化が展開された理由には、民主化運動の原動力となった「下からの政治」の動機や目標がより物質的なものから始まったことがある。ベナンの「下からの政治」は、理念としての民主主義や人権よりも空腹(給与支払い、雇用、奨学金の問題)が動機として先行していた(Noudjenoume 1999:139-140)。空腹という広くベナン人が抱える問題であったために、大衆からの共感と支持を得られやすかった。その後、民主化の実現が単なる政権交代の手段以上の価値として認識されるようになったことも理由に加えることができる。その結果、国民会議において特定の個人、組織への非難と排斥が過熱することを回避することができた。国民会議以後の民主化プロセスを通じ、ベナンにおいて「下からの政治」は穏やかに発展を続けた。民主化によって自由な対話を行うことが可能になり、その中で政治に直接タッチしない大衆レベルでの政治の議論が盛んに行われるようになった。人々は意見を交わし、民主化の行方を静かに見守りながら、自らの政治的選択を行う時を待った。

しかし、ベナンにおける独立以来の政治構造的問題である南北対立を軸とする地域対立が解消された訳ではなく、時に暴力的な衝突に発展することもあった。それでも、民主化プロセスを頓挫させるほどにエスカレートする前に、積極的な妥協を行ってきた。アフリカ諸国に民主化を要求したことで有名なミッテラン大統領の「ラボール宣言」と呼ばれる演説(1990 年)で、ベナンは民主化の手本として示されていた。しかし 1996 年の大統領選挙でケレク前大統領が返り咲いたことは国際社会を驚かせた。かつて国民を貧窮と恐怖に陥れたケレクも政治的手法には問題を抱えながらも、民主主義がベナン発展の最大の担保であること意識した政権運営を堅持している。

(2) トーゴ

ベナンの「下からの政治」は、早くから国家権力と正面切って対峙せざるを得なかったのに対し、トーゴの場合は状況が異なっていた。

トーゴでは、軍部を権力基盤とするアフリカ最長の独裁体制が、2005 年 2 月のエヤデマ将軍の病死まで 38 年間にわたり続いてきた。1963 年 1 月 13 日、フランス植民地部隊退役軍曹のエヤデマらは軍事クーデタを起こし、初代大統領オリンピオ(S.Olympio)を銃殺して権力を奪取した。エヤデマ

らは一旦、民政に移管したが、軍部の実権を固めた 4 年後の同日に再びクーデタを起して権力を奪取した。その後、大統領となり、国家政党「トーゴ人民連合」(Rassemblement du peuple togolais: RPT)を創設し、一党制を確立した。

ベナンよりも早く政治的安定を回復したトーゴでは、情報統制、反体制勢力への弾圧がより念入りに行われた。北朝鮮から科学的拷問とマスゲームの指導を受け、密告が日常化した。経済的に破綻したベナンとは対称的に、トーゴは「アフリカのスイス」を掲げ、税制優遇地区を設置して海外からの投資を積極的に誘致した。1970 年代前半には、主要輸出産品であるリン鉱石の国際価格が4倍近くに高騰する幸運もあった。エヤデマは旧宗主国フランスをはじめ、西側諸国との良好な関係を重視した。冷戦と経済的安定は、トーゴの政治的抑圧を覆い隠した。

このような状況の中で出現したトーゴにおける「下からの政治」は、ベナンとは異なる歩みを見せた。ベナンをはじめ周辺諸国の非常な混乱と比較して、トーゴの表面的な安定は人々にある種の妥協の材料を与えた。反対者への徹底的な弾圧や亡命者の増加の一方、個人崇拝の儀式の中で、人々はエヤデマ将軍に賛美を捧げてきたが、一人の手に権力と富が集中する状況に違和感を抱かないはずはなかった。トーゴの「下からの政治」は、強固なエヤデマ体制に対する直接対決ではなく、斜に構えた揶揄・愚弄から始まった。国家が破綻寸前のベナンとは異なり、トーゴでの「下からの政治」の始まりは困窮の中で生命をかけるほどに切羽詰ったものではなかった。トーゴでは、言葉のレトリックによってエヤデマ体制を称える反面で体制を嘲笑した。この愚弄の「下からの政治」は、カビエ(Kabyè)人を中心に北部出身者を優遇するエヤデマ体制下で、多数派でありながらも冷遇されてきた南部在住のエヴェ(Ewé)人を中心に、水面下・口コミで広がっていった。この大衆的政治行動は、直接的に体制を揺さぶるものではなかったが、体制への疑問を喚起し、大衆の政治意識を徐々に覚醒させる触媒となった。

トーゴ南部地域を中心とする大衆の間で、多重的な意味を持つ言葉によって表面的にエヤデマを賞賛すると同時に暗喩的に愚弄(dérision)する受動的抵抗が展開された。エヴェ語やフランス語の同音異義語、類似語を加工して、エヤデマを性獣化(séxualisation)、動物化(animalisation)、糞便化(fécalisation)する愚弄表現の体系が作り上げられた(Toulabor 1992:109-114)。

エヤデマを称える Tsala(ツァラ)という造語にペニスの意味を持たせてエヤデマの性欲の強さが強調され(Toulabor 1992:115-116)、エヤデマの真正名 Gnassingbé(ニャシンベ)をフランス語風に分解・変形させて Grand(大きな)singe(猿)と動物化して愚弄した(Toulabor 1992:122-123)。国家政党トーゴ人民連合(RPT:エール・ペー・テー)をフランス語風に Air pété(エール・ペ・テ=屁の匂い)と加工して愚弄した(Toulabor 1992:125)。他にも、エヤデマの愛称の「バオバブ」が深く広く根を張る性質から、権力の座から動こうとしないエヤデマに例えて揶揄した(岩田 2003:60-61)。

しかし、トーゴにおける「下からの政治」は民主化運動には直結しなかった。トーゴでは、ベナンのように給与遅配や生活の困窮を動機とするものではなく、人権問題の改善要求を契機として民主化運動が展開された。トーゴの民主化運動は明日の生活のためではなく、当初から政治的色彩が強く、大衆の日々の関心から距離があった。また民主化運動は、国家の政治体制の根本を問い直すだけ

でなく、エヤデマ排除を目指した急進的なものになった。

隣国ベナンで開催された国民会議は、トーゴの民主化運動をより勢いづけた。人権組織を中心に民主化を求める組織が次々と結成され、市民社会ネットワークが形成された。1990年、「10月5日事件」(「黒い金曜日」)と呼ばれるエヤデマ体制の終わりを求めるデモ行進が実施された(Dégli 1996: 25-27)。この事件は、反体制的なビラを配った13名の学生が逮捕され、公安にて拷問を受けたことへの抗議に端を発して、エヤデマ体制の終わりを求める体制批判デモにエスカレートした。

「10月5日事件」後、「下からの政治」が新聞やラジオでも展開されるようになった(Toulabor 1991: 140-141)。エヤデマ体制はアリババと盗賊にたとえられた。中国訪問時の晩餐会で毛沢東が声をかけた「チンチン」の意味が分からず、エヤデマが「トーゴ、トーゴ」と応え返したこと[23]、低学歴、ケレクの料理人(Toulabor 1991:137-139)、エヤデマはズボンを「着る」(袖を通す)などの愚弄表現がトーゴ中にこだました。

1991年3月、民主化を求める社会組織連合の「革新連合戦線」(Front des associations pour le renouveau:FAR)が、ゼネストと体制打倒を呼びかける集会を行い、エヤデマ大統領から政治犯の恩赦、野党合法化、国民対話フォーラム設置の譲歩を引き出した。FARの解散後、野党を中心に「反体制民主連合」(Collectif de l'opposition démocratique:COD)が結成された。CODの呼びかけによる無期限ゼネストの末、ついにエヤデマ大統領は国民会議招集を受け入れた。

エヤデマ体制を支える権力の象徴部分を溶解させてきた「下からの政治」は、地下の言説から声高に、エヤデマ個人とその体制を愚弄する言説に変化した。それは公共メディアを通しても行われ、積年の体制への恨みを人々の間で増幅し、国民和解を困難にした。「下からの政治」の激化はエヤデマ大統領個人からその取り巻き、やがて北部出身者全体への恨みに転化され、植民地時代に生まれた南北間の相互憎悪の意識を表面化させた。

1991年7月、772名の代表によって開催された国民会議では、国民会議の主権が宣言され、前憲法が廃止され、公の場で演奏が禁止されてきた独立時の国歌「私達の祖先の地」(Terre nos aïeux)が復活された[24]。国民会議議長には、国民統合の象徴としてカトリック教会高位聖職者のポジョロ(P.Kpodzro)司教が選出され、ベナンと同様に民主化移行政府、「共和国高等評議会」(HCR)が創設され、エヤデマ大統領の職権は儀礼的なものに縮小された[25]。しかし、エヤデマ体制との長い蜜月関係にあったカトリック教会の正統性はベナンに比較すると弱かった。国民会議は弁護士出身のコフィゴ(J.Koffigoh)を民主化移行政府の首相に選出し、エヤデマ大統領の任期短縮、RPT資産の凍結を決定した(MTM 1991:1971)。

トーゴの国民会議は、エヤデマ体制への弾劾と報復の場と化した。国民会議の模様はテレビとラジオで連日、生中継された。国民対話と和解の場を目指した国民会議において激しい対立と憎悪を露呈したことは、表面化した「下からの政治」をエスカレートさせた。その結果、国民会議はトーゴ人の間に民主主義的な政治意識を醸成することなく、民主化プロセスは権力と富のゼロサムゲームであるという感覚を人々の心に植え付けた。エヤデマの目には、国民会議は独立前にエヴェ人統一のために結成された北部出身者を周辺化する全エヴェ会議(All Ewe Conference)に苦々しく映り

(Heilbrunn 1997:234)、不信感を募らせた。そのため、エヤデマは国民会議の決定を尊重しなかっただけでなく、実効的ではなかったものの、一方的に国民会議の閉会宣言まで行った。また、トーゴの国民会議は、24 年間に及ぶエヤデマ体制の根幹であった軍部を、エヤデマ大統領から切り離し、民主化移行への協力を取り付けることはできなかった。そのため、国民会議後の民主化プロセスに対する軍事介入を招く結果となった。同年 12 月には、コフィゴ首相が軍隊によって拉致された。この事件を契機に、コフィゴ首相はエヤデマ大統領に抗する気概を失った。また、内部に対立を抱え民主化への制度整備を進めることができない移行政府を尻目に、エヤデマ大統領は国民会議前の権力を回復した。

そして、形骸化された多党制が残された。複数の政党が存在するだけで、再びエヤデマ大統領が放送メディア、軍隊、治安機関を独占するようになり、人々の上に再び抑圧の重圧感がのしかかるようになった。

新憲法を問う国民投票は 1992 年 9 月に実施され、承認された。1993 年の大統領選挙では、野党のボイコットの結果、エヤデマ大統領が当選した。しかし 1994 年の国民議会選挙では、野党が過半数を獲得した。その後は、体制側と野党側との対立が続く中で、国際社会はトーゴを民主化挫折の典型例と評価した。フランスを除くドナー諸国はトーゴに対して 10 年以上も経済制裁を続けてきたため、かつて自称した「アフリカのスイス」の面影はなくなり衰退の一途をたどっている。民主化プロセスの挫折は、トーゴ人の間に失望感と無力感を生み出した。愚弄の表現は影を潜め、人々の間に運命論的な諦観(fatalisme)としらけが入り混じった「沈黙の文化」が蘇った。

「沈黙の文化」はエヤデマが生きている限り続くだろうと思われていた。近年は、健康不安を抱えながらも、飛行機事故(サラカワの奇跡)、数々の暗殺やクーデタの試みの後、何度も死が報じられながら、その都度生きて姿を現してきたエヤデマの不死のイメージはトーゴ社会に根強く残っていた。そのため、国民の間ではいつかは訪れるはずのエヤデマの死は、近い将来のこととは考えられて来なかった。政権内でも権力継承の準備は完了していなかった。

エヤデマ死去の同日(2005 年 2 月 5 日)、故エヤデマ大統領によって将来の指導者と目されてきた息子フォール・ニャシンベ(Faure Gnassingbé)が、憲法規定[26]を無視して軍部によって大統領に担ぎ上げられた。それに対して、アフリカ連合、ECOWAS、国際社会は、軍事クーデタに等しいと厳しく非難した。エヤデマの死によって、トーゴが世襲の軍事政権に他ならないことが改めて明らかにされた。予想より早く訪れたエヤデマ将軍の死は、トーゴ政治に大きな混乱と不安定化の危険性をもたらしている[27]。アフリカ地域機構からの圧力に抗し切れず、2005 年 4 月に大統領選挙が実施されたが、父エヤデマの時代と同様に不正と操作が行われた末、フォールの勝利が発表され、トーゴ各地で抗議の暴動が起こる中で国家権力の世襲が合法化された。

5 おわりに

近年、アフリカの国家は役割の変更を迫られ、存在自体の意味が問い直されようとしている。本章では「下からの政治」という視角から、アフリカの国家変容の一断片に関して理解を試みてきた。国民会議招集によって開始された民主化プロセスに対して、「下からの政治」がどのように関与し、変容したのかということに注目することを通して、アフリカの国家像の変容について考えてきた。

国民会議は急激な政治的流動化を生み出し、民主化と政治的不安定化とを同時にもたらした。国民会議招集によって民主化が開始された国々において、ベナンのように民主化に関して高い評価を受けている国がある一方で、コンゴやザイール(コンゴ民主共和国)のように内戦に陥り、ニジェールのようにクーデタによって民主化から逆行する国も現れた。ここでは、対照的な民主化プロセスを歩んだベナンとトーゴの比較を通して、「下からの政治」とアフリカの国家像の変遷を議論した。

政治分析アプローチとしては、政治的変化の局面の理解に対応できないという批判にもさらされたが、「下からの政治」は民主化運動の背景にあって政治的変化に影響を及ぼす可能性を持っていた。さらに、民主化による政治環境の変化によって「下からの政治」自体も変化した。「下からの政治」という国家権力の周辺領域に注目することによって、国家権力の弱体化を比較的早い段階で目にすることになった。また、民主化という国家のあり方に直結する政治改革のプロセスの展開を考える上でも、「下からの政治」は国民レベルでの民主主義の定着を理解するための手助けとなろう。

ただし「下からの政治」は国家を別の角度から映し出しているものの、「上からの政治」に対して相対的に存在する政治的営みに過ぎない。それゆえ、「下からの政治」は国家のあり様を知る上での一つの手掛かりとなりながらも、アフリカの国家と政治を全て理解するための万能の試験紙ではない。そして、「下からの政治」の読み替えとしての「市民社会論」も、アフリカ政治の問題の全てに解決をもたらす鍵ではない。「下からの政治」は、国家を舞台とする問題の所在が比較的早めに顕在化し、人々の政治意識に変化を与える可能性を持ちながらも、その結果もたらされる政治行動のベクトルは特定の方向にあらかじめ規定されるものではない。

一党制が強度を保っていた権威主義的な時代においても、バヤールがいうように政治的に周辺化された社会領域は全く国家と無縁の政治的暮らしを続けてきたのではなく、「社会的兄弟関係」というパトロン・クライアンテリズムをより社会習俗化したような関わり合いは維持されてきた。政治的周辺部への気配りと金配りは、中央よりも後回しにされるが、逆に言うと、国家の変化の兆しは国家機構の中枢よりも、周辺化された社会的末っ子の部分において早い段階に具体的な形で現れた。

ベナンでは、「下からの政治」が公務員への給与遅配の常態化という国家財政の末期的な状況において顕在化し、問題解決のために民主化運動と連動した。また「下からの政治」の展開の速さは、破綻寸前のケレク体制に抵抗の余裕を与えなかった。一方、トーゴでは比較的安定していた経済状況の中で「下からの政治」が現れ、トーゴ人のエヤデマ体制への疑問を醸成したが、民主化運動には直結しなかった。また、トーゴの「下からの政治」は水面下で広がったため展開も遅かった。「下からの政治」の展開の遅さと民主化運動と明確に連動しなかったことが、危機にあったエヤデマ体制に

立て直しの時間と機会を与えた。アフリカ諸国で初の国民会議を招集したベナンと、一年半近く後にベナンだけでなくガボン、コンゴ(ブラザビル)の国民会議の展開を見据えた上で招集に合意し、自らの権力の源泉である軍部を握り続けることに成功したエヤデマ政権には、ベナンよりも国民会議後の民主化潰しに有利な条件が揃っていた。

アフリカの国家を「国民」のものとするためには、権力や富の並べられたテーブルの奪い合いを越えた動機に基づいて、国家に対する前向きな意識を高める必要がある。その「契機」となる可能性を持っているのが「下からの政治」である。その意味でも好対照であったのが国民会議後のベナンとトーゴであった。ベナンでは、民主化プロセスを通じて「下からの政治」が国家のあり方の問い直しとして議論されたのに対して、トーゴでは民主化プロセスの挫折と独裁者の権力回復を通じて「下からの政治」は国家から目をそむけるようになった。トーゴでは、国家はいまだ権力と富のゼロサムゲームが繰り広げられるゲーム盤であるに過ぎない。体制から全てを奪おうとする側と、全てを失うことを恐れ体制にしがみつく側との間に妥協点は見出せない。

アフリカで国家的危機が起きる度に、欧米世界を中心にアフリカの再植民地化論や国際機関による再委任(信託)統治論が持ち出されるが、それは装いを変えつつも搾取と、民族間対立の構造化と、世界の中でのアフリカの周辺化の再現をもたらすだけであり、現在のアフリカ諸国が抱える政治的問題を根本から解決するものとはならない。アフリカにおける国家の模索の行く末に対して、画一的な結論は用意されていない。しかし知恵と妥協によって、国家をともに運営していくための一定の理解と納得に至ることは十分に可能である。ただし、そこに至るまでには時間が必要であり、短期的な視野で無理に決着を急ぐことは、かえってアフリカの国家に混乱と歪みをもたらしかねない。

独立後のアフリカの政治史は国家の模索の過程そのものであったが、21 世紀初めのアフリカ諸国においても国家探しは続く。現在のところ国家探しの過程を通じて、植民地政府から引き継ぎ、支配者によって操作されてきた借り物としての制度・法体系が、アフリカ人自身によって主体的に発展されていくことが必要である。いわば国家という器の内容物をできるだけ内在化させていく以外の道はない。そのプロセスはアフリカ人の対話と妥協によって実現されなければならない。

---

(1)国家という観点から見れば、「新家産主義」とは国家元首に権力と資源が集中し、国家が個人化されていく統治のあり方であり、「胃袋の政治」(politique du ventre)は国家を舞台として発生する権力と利益を最大限に回収しようと試みる政治的行動である。一方、「下からの政治」は国家を舞台に繰り広げられる「新家産主義」や「胃袋の政治」に興味を持ちながらも、おこぼれに預かることのできない社会領域の人々、社会層によって繰り広げられる政治行動である。

(2)国民会議とアフリカの民主化移行に関しては、岩田(2004)を参照。

(3)原論文は、Bayart,Jean-François (1983) "La revanche des sociétés africaines", *Politique Africaine*, No.11, pp.95-127 である。

(4)バヤールのアフリカ市民社会論に関しては、岩田(2004)を参照。

(5)参考となるのがブルデュー(P.Bourdieu)の「象徴権力」という考え方である。暴力装置によって作用する権力は、個人、集団において行動を規制する外的要因として認識される。一方で、象徴権力はある特定の権力としては認識されにくく、日常的な社会生活にまで浸透しながら、象徴を通して抑圧ではなく正

統性(権威)として作用する。そして、一部のグループの象徴を公式化することで権力が制度化される(Bourdieu 2001:281-283,286-287)。ブルデューは物理的な力関係を背景としながら、それによって生じた服従、行動の制約を正統なものであると認識させる仕組みや作用を明らかにしようとした。象徴権力の観点からアフリカ最長の現役政権であったトーゴの支配のあり方を検討したのが岩田(2003)である。

(6)フランス政府は、1989年12月にケレク大統領に送った8項目にわたる内密文書の中で、国民公会または三部会に相当する会議の招集を求め、その開催のための財政的支援の用意があることを示した。

(7)ギニアビサウの国民会議は、政権党PAIGCが350名の文民(大部分が政府系企業の代表)を招いて、多党制への移行を協議したフォーラムにとどまった(MTM 1990:2873)。

(8)ベナン、ニジェール、トーゴ、ザイールにおいては、「共和国高等評議会」(Haut conseil de la République)、チャドにおいては「民主化移行期最高評議会」(Conseil supérieur de la transition)、またコンゴにおいては「共和国最高評議会」(Conseil supérieur de la République)と、国によって呼称は若干異なっている。ガボンとマリでは民主化移行期における暫定立法機関を設置しなかった。

(9)ザイールの場合は、期間としては通算408日と最長であるが、国民会議が幾度となく中断されたことや協議が止まっていた時期も多かったために、単純に会期日数を比較することが難しい面もある。

(10)ベナンはダホメーとしてフランス領西アフリカ(Afrique occidentale française:AOF)の統治下にあったが、ベルリン会議以降、ドイツ領であったトーゴは第一次大戦以降、英仏に占領・分割され、その後、東側は国際連盟委任統治領、第二次大戦後は国際連合信託統治領としてフランスの統治下に置かれた。

(11)EUは、野党との合意の仲介も果たしてきた。透明で公正な議会・大統領選挙が援助再開の条件とされてきた。しかし、度重なるトーゴ政府の合意不遵守によって、1993年以来、EUからのトーゴへの援助は厳しく制限されてきた。

(12) *Ehuzu*,No.3465,31 mai 1989.

(13)トーゴにおけるエヤデマ教と称される個人崇拝を通じた個人支配に関しては、Toulabor(1993)を参照。

(14) Ehuzu, No.3511, 4 août 1989.

(15) Ehuzu, No.3528, 30 août 1989.

(16)「同志」(Camarade)という呼称の強制も撤廃された。Ehuzu, No.3596, 8 décembre 1989.

(17) Ehuzu, No.3632, 28 février 1990. ソグロ首相は国防大臣も兼任した。

(18) Article 14, Loi constitutionelle No.90-22 du 13 août 1990 portant organisation des pouvoirs durant la période de transition, République du Bénin.

(19) Loi No.90-13 portant immunité personnelle du Président Mathieu Kérékou, Haut Conseil de la République, République du Bénin.

(20)岩田(2004)、129-164頁を参照。

(21)ソグロは67.6パーセントの得票率で(投票率は64パーセント)当選した。

(22)1992年5月、ソグロ大統領側の与党連合である革新グループ(Le groupe le renouveau)が35名の議員を擁していたが、1993年11月の時点では19名にその勢力を縮小した。

(23)フランス語で中国を意味する「Chine(シーヌ)・Chine」と掛け声を出したと誤解して、エヤデマはそれに呼応して「トーゴ・トーゴ」と返したとされる。

(24) Acte No.1 de la conférence nationale souveraine du 16 juillet 1991, République Togolaise.

(25) Acte No.7 de la conférence nationale souveraine du 23 août 1991, République Togolaise.

(26)第4共和国憲法(1992年10月14日公布)第65条では、大統領の職務不能時には国民会議議長が臨時で大統領職を遂行し、60日以内に大統領選挙を実施することが規定されている。

(27)エヤデマ大統領死去後のトーゴの政治状況については、岩田(2005)を参照。

参考文献

日本語文献

岩田拓夫(1999)「ロメ合意とトーゴにおける複数政党制の展望」、『月刊アフリカ』第 39 巻第 11 号、4-8 頁。

岩田拓夫(2001)「ロメ合意後のトーゴ政治の展開」、『月刊アフリカ』第 41 巻第 12 号、4-8 頁。

岩田拓夫(2003)「エヤデマイズムの現在_象徴権力の観点からの試論_」、『アフリカ研究』第 62 号、57-63 頁。

岩田拓夫(2004)『アフリカの民主化移行と市民社会論_国民会議研究を通して_』国際書院。

岩田拓夫(2005)「エヤデマ将軍の死に揺れるトーゴ」、『アフリカ』第 45 巻第 2 号、4-10 頁。

大林稔(1996)「アフリカにおける国家とは何か;J.F.バヤールの「アフリカの国家」 」、『アフリカ諸国の「国家建設」と課題』日本国際問題研究所、121-133 頁。

小川了(1998)「国家誌の展望—その素描—」、大林稔編『アフリカ_第三の変容_』昭和堂、86-108 頁。

河野健二(1969)『フランス革命』河出書房。

川端正久(1980)『政治学と民族・植民地問題』法律文化社。

柳内隆(2001)『フーコーの思想』ナカニシヤ出版。

外国語文献

Bayart, Jean-François (1979) *L'Etat au Cameroun*, Paris: Presse de la Fondation Nationale des Sciences Politiques.

Bayart, Jean-François (1986) "Civil Society in Africa", (in) Patrick Chabal ed., *Political Domination in Africa*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp.109-125.

Bayart, Jean-François et al. (1992) *Le Politique par Le Bas en Afrique Noire*, Paris: Karthala.

Bayart, Jean-François et al. (1999) *The Criminalization of the State in Africa*, Indianapolis: Indiana University Press.

Bourdieu, Pierre (2001) *Langage et pouvoir symbolique*, Paris: Seuil.

Bourmaud, Daniel (1997) *La politique en Afrique*, Paris: Montchrestien.

Buijtenhuijs, Robert (1993) *La Conférence Nationale Souveraine du Tchad*, Paris: Karthala.

Chabal, Patrick (1994) "Understanding African Democracy: Democracy and Daily Life in Black Africa", *International Affairs Contents*, Vol.70, No.1, pp.83-91.

Decalo, Samuel (1997) "Benin: First of the New Democracies", (in) John Clark et al. eds., *Political Reform in Francophone Africa*, Boulder: Westview Press , pp.43-61.

Dégli, Jean Yaovi (1996) *Togo: La tragédie africaine*, Ivry-sur-Seine: Editions Nouvelles du sud.

Eboussi Boulaga, Fabien (1993) *Les Conférences Nationales en Afrique Noire; Une affaire à suivre*, Paris: Karthala.

Heilbrunn, John (1997) "Togo: The National Conference and Stalled Reform", (in) John Clark et al. eds., *Political Reform in Francophone Africa*, Boulder: Westview Press , pp.225-245.

Houngnikpo, Mathurin (2001) *Determinants of Democratization in Africa: A Comparative Study Benin and Togo*, Lanham: University Press of America.

Lalinon Gbado, Béatrice (1996) *Bénin: la période transitoire,février 1990-avril 1990*, Cotonou: Ruisseaux d'Afrique.

Noudjenoume, Philippe (1999) *La démocratie au Bénin 1988-1993; Bilan et perspectives*, Paris: Harmattan.

Toulabor, Comi (1986) *Le Togo sous Eyadéma*, Paris: Karthala.

Toulabor, Comi (1991) "La dérision politique en liberté à Lomé", *Politique Africaine*, No.43, pp.136-141.

Toulabor, Comi (1992) "Jeu de mots, jeu de vilains; Lexique de la dérision politique au Togo", (in) J.-F.Bayart et al. *Le Politique par Le Bas en Afrique Noire*, Paris: Karthala, pp.109-130.

Toulabor, Comi (1993) "Le culte Eyadéma au Togo", (in) J.-F.Bayart ed., *Religion et modernité politique en Afrique noire*, Paris: Karthala, pp.277-297.

Weber, Max (1971) *Economie et société*, Paris: Plon.

(新聞・雑誌)

Marchés tropicaux et méditerranéens (MTM)

Ehuzu (1991 年以降は La Nation、ベナン)

2. Role of Human Rights Movement during the Democratic Process in Togo*

Takuo IWATA, Assistant Professor
Doctoral Program in Modern Cultures and Public Policies
Graduate School of Humanities and Social Sciences
University of Tsukuba

<Résumé>

Il y a 10 ans déjà, nous avons commencé à parler la transition démocratique en Afrique. Mais après certaines années, les pays africains sont retombés dans le régime autoritaire. Nous analysons la transition démocratique au Togo sur le mouvement des droits de l'homme qui dirigeait la société civile. Les discussions de la société civile dans les études politiques africaines manquaient la discussion empirique de la scène politique. Nous pensons la relation entre la société civile et la démocratisation dans l'analyse concrète. A la fin, nous réfléchirons le rôle et la problématique de la société civile dans le processus démocratique en Afrique.

1 Introduction

The political scientists have become used to paying attention to other political actors besides that of the state in African political studies, through the political change to a multi-party system in the 1990's. The concept of civil society [1)] has not only been recognized as an analytical approach, but also been spread over the context of development. However, this concept is a subject in itself to be discussed (Bayart 1992:70). This article analyses the human rights movement as a new political actor in the democratic process in Togo.

There were many associations that constitute civil society for the democratic process in Africa. This article considers two reasons regarding the human rights movement in Togo. Firstly, it has been realized that the human rights movement plays a very important role in the democratic process in Togo. Civil society was expanded in the human rights movement. It started the democratic transition through the convocation of the Sovereign National Conference (Conférence Nationale Souveraine: CNS) [2)] as a provisional political authority in the transition period. Human rights associations worked in the making of a new constitution draft and report of CNS.

Secondly, human rights aren't only domestic issue, but also a diplomatic one in Togo not

* Takuo IWATA "Role of human rights movement during the democratic process in Togo," *Africa* (Universidade de Sao Paulo, Centro de Estudos Africanos), n°22-23,2004,pp.173-190.

unlike other African countries. In particular, economic cooperation is related to human rights directly. It is a matter of life or death for Togo. This ambiguity of domestic and diplomatic policy is an essential character of small country. It is well-known the violation of human rights of Togo in the international community, as political assassination, binding without judicial procedure, torture, control of expression and professional discrimination under the regime of General Gnassingbé Eyadèma since 1967. In the Cold War era, Western countries ignored the critical situation of Togo in order to keep and enlarge anti-Communist areas in Africa. However, in the post-Cold War era, anti-Communist policies disappeared. Western countries used to concern with human rights issues in African countries with international organizations, as a conditionality of economic cooperation. As a consequence, donor counties except France have principally stopped or limited their cooperation with Togo since 1993 due to human rights violations and delay of democratic transition [3)].

This article considers the human rights movement involvement in the democratic transition of Togo. Principally, it focuses on Ligue Togolaise des Droits de l'Homme (Togolese League of Human Rights: LTDH), which worked as a central role for not only the improvement of the human rights situation but also the empowerment of civil society for the democratisation in Togo. Therefore, this article also examines the human rights movement connection to the democratic process and what that means in relation to the concept of civil society.

2 Concept of Civil Society and the Democratic Process in Africa

The concept of civil society is part of political thought in modern Western Europe that dates back to the Greek era (Manfred 1990:11-135). As well, the African continent has historical fusion through the events of colonization. In this historical background, the relativistic idea that it exists completely as a different type of civil society in Africa is not realistic, even Africa have not subordinate to Europe. However, in Europe, it doesn't exist, only one standard idea of civil society that has been continually changed throughout their histories and social situations. The definition is a common point; this concept of civil society has been recognized with the state in complementary relations since Aristotle's era. So this concept has to be discussed in the state reformation (Endo 1998:5).

In general, the concept of civil society in African political studies is based on liberalism after Locke as a norm. It has been used to recognize a dichotomy that state is a bad existence to make small, to the contrary, civil society is good. Also other"European" thoughts have been examined through ideas of Hegel, Marx, Gramsci and so on. In empirical analysis, students have paid attention to civil society as an apparatus of observation and resistance to state in the premise that the natural rights are violated in African countries.

This recognition of civil society in African studies is much influenced by Bayart's article"Civil Society in Africa"(Bayart 1986) translated in English in 1986. Students understand that this article started the discussion on this concept in African political studies, and anti-state character is indispensable element of civil society (Endo 1997:6).

One of the reasons this concept is needed in African political studies is that it depends on insufficiency of governance of the African states. Almost all of the African countries have in place a modern institutionalised government through their heritage of colonial government. However, they are often just masks of modernity. Furthermore, the democratic transitions are started outside the state arena in many African countries. It increased the significance of this concept as an analytical approach even remaining its conceptual ambiguity. It is not that civil society appeared suddenly in 1990's Africa but used to be recognized in relation to the state through activation of networks of social associations. Civil society is the concept related to the state. However, the distance among these arenas isn't the same. Human rights issues are directly affected by state comportment. So the human rights movement acts directly with the state. It also enables the rethinking of the relationship between civil society and the state through a study of the human rights movement.

3 Ligue Togolaise des Droits de l'Homme (LTDH)

It is the introduction of the LTDH that has played an important role in the democratic transition. Lawyers, professors, doctors, students and civil servants created the LTDH in July 1990 because of resolution of disappearance of Nayonne, student of Université du Bénin à Lomé, in April 1990 in a student demonstration against the regime. LTDH is one of first human rights NGO's constituted by many social stratums. In October 1987, 3 years before the LTDH's creation, the National Commission of Human Rights (Commission Nationale des Droits de l'Homme: CNDH) was founded through the permission of General-President Eyadèma as a state organization for the promotion of human rights [4]. In Togo, violations of Human Rights had been quotidian in Eyadèma's regime since 1967. Yawovi Agboyibo [5], an internationally known lawyer, efforts led to the creation of the CNDH. It was very important in regard to opening the door for human rights activities and consciousness at a state level. However, the CNDH's role was limited because it was situated under Rally of Togolese People (Rassamblement du Peuple Togolais: RPT), created by General Eyadèma in 1969 and maintained a uni-party system until 1991. As well, the state has often been the violator of human rights. Even though there were limitations for the CNDH, it was very significant that human rights issues could be talked about at a state level as National Assembly, government, Generals and President of Republic. The CNDH's creation improved the human rights situation compared with the situation up to 1987 when it

had been impossible to articulate anything about it. At the moment of the LTDH's creation, there was an intention to enforce what the CNDH had engaged [6].

LTDH had three basic directions for education of the LTDH members and other Togolese people, for contribution of protection and promotion of human rights and for co-operation with other organisations to realise the purpose [7]. LTDH had an intimate relationship with the CNDH to make possible judicial intervention. The first President of the CNDH Agboyibo designed his post because of trouble with General Eyadèma but he kept a link between the CNDH and the LTDH members.

LTDH tried to realise the state of law as the only way for effective and sustainable development, through infiltrating the consciousness of rights of freedom, law and peace to Togolese people [8]. LTDH is constituted and managed by General Assembly as the supreme function and Executive Bureau with 9 members. General Assembly is convened once a year to discuss the organizational management, publication of reports and the financial program. LTDH had more than 3,000 members in 1999 and branches in principal cities such as: Kpalimé, Tsévié, and Dapaong. It can't ignore human rights activities outside of Togo because 400,000 Togoleses, 1/10 of total population, had to leave Togo as refugees [9]. So the LTDH had a branch in France [10].

LTDH played a very important role in the democratic movement for convocation of CNS. LTDH promoted the creation of other human rights associations and concentrated civil society associations for democratisation. LTDH was connected with these associations in an organic network, Association Togolaise de Lutte contre la Torture, Association Togolaise de la Liberté de Presse, Groupe de Réflexion et d'Actinon Démocratique, Mouvement Estudiantin de Lutte pour la Démocratie, Association pour la Promotion de l'Etat de Droit [11]. This network was not only formed on a domestic level but also at an international level, with International Commission of Juriste, whose headquarters situated in Geneva and Fédération Internationale des Droits de l'Homme (FIDH) in Paris, as a member association [12], Ligue des Droits et Liberté du Québec and Amnesty International. Further, the LTDH had intimate relations with foreign governments and international organizations. LTDH has contacts with embassies of France, Germany, United States and Canada, and cultural centres of these countries. As well it has connections with international organizations such as: UNHCR, UNESCO and the Council of Europe [13]. LTDH was awarded a prize for human rights from the Republic of France [14]. These connections didn't only enable it to provide information on the human rights situation of Togo to the world, but also get financial support. In the next part, human rights activities of the LTDH regarding democratisation are considered.

4 LTDH's Activities until the End of Transition Period

LTDH played an important role in the democratic process in Togo. However, its approach wasn't always the same way. The big turning point came at the end of the CNS institutions (CNS system), as the government of transition and High Council of Republic as a main actor of democratic transition CNS convened by principally civil society started the transition period through achieving sovereignty and diminishing the power of President Eyadèma. However, CNS system was weakened by military intervention ordered by General Eyadèma and an internal division. In this situation the transition process was delayed and it was able to recover from the power of General Eyadèma. This article distinguishes two periods, the end of CNS system's transition by ensemble declaration of President Eyadèma and Prime Minister Koffigoh in January 1993 and considers the LTDH's activities for democratisation.

A characteristic of the LTDH's activities before the end of CNS system was to contact directly with the state power through the human rights movement. At that moment, the LTDH emphasized that human rights issues were an indivisible relationship with the state. LTDH considered that the human rights movement wasn't automatically political in its actions, but the LTDH recognized that it was impossible to improve human rights conditions without examining political power [15]. In almost all African countries after their independence, people understood that the democracy under uni-partism was an illusion [16].

At the moment of the LTDH's creation, the student movement began to expand and clash with military police and student section of RPT [17]. In this conflict, there were many wounded, and captured without any judicial procedure. LTDH demanded the release of democratic activists captured in August 1990 and accused the state of ignorance to the rules of law. LTDH didn't only work as an association, but also as a centre of civil society network. This network grew for the realization of CNS convocation.

October 5th 1990 is a very important day, even at the new millennium, Togolese people still talks about this day as the birthday of democratisation in Togo. It was after this day that the democratic movement expanded rapidly. The demonstration of this day was planned as an accusation against the judgement of 5 years imprisonment for 2 activists who distributed anti-governmental pamphlets (*MTM* 1990:2876-2877).

In the early morning of October 5th, a number of groups concentrated in front of Palais de la Justice (Court) of Lomé and sang the old national anthem"Terre de nos aïuex"(Our Ancestor's Earth) prohibited in 1979[18] and started demonstration march crying for the end of the Eyadèma's regime. Military troupes tried to suppress this demonstration, the biggest to date, and this led to five casualties and 34 wounded (*MTM* 1990:2347). Several groups of participants developed into mobs. Car tires were burned everywhere in Lomé and the area was veiled in a black smoke. So to this day it has been called the"Vendredi noir"(Black Friday) (Dégli 1996:26). LTDH protested against military intervention before

Vendredi noir. This event led to stimulate the LTDH's actions.

In December 1990, the LTDH convened a General Assembly to improve its organizational functions. The General Assembly consisted of an elected president and other executive members. A very famous lawyer Joseph Kokou Koffigoh was elected as the first president. After the LTDH's creation, many human rights associations were born. In these younger associations, Association Togolaise de Lutte contre la Torture led by Jean-Yaovi Dégli had very radical attitude against the state. Dégli was a lawyer who organized student groups well and assisted Prime Minister Koffigoh in the transition period. He would also become the second president of the LTDH after Koffigoh's demission in 1992.

General Eyadèma thought that it was inevitable that the transition to multi-partism would occur for recovering calm in Togo. President Eyadèma began to think how the transition process would be realized while still keeping his status and honour. Eyadèma made a speech on constitutional modification to move multi-partism, creation of constitutional commission and nomination of its 109 members. However, this speech couldn't tranquillise democratic movement and he had to compromise one after another. On media, private news paper was legalized by press code"Loi No 90-25 du 30 novembre 1990 Portant code de la presse" [19]. On liberation of political prisoners, President Eyadèma announced general amnesty on January 10th 1991. However, the amnesty list excluded the names of the prisoners who had tried to attack Eyadèma in 1986. So, the LTDH required to deputies the total number and requested general amnesty a few days after the President's announcement.

In Mid-March 1991, the upsurge of political consciousness of Togolese people came into fruition as Front des Associations pour le Renouveau (FAR) concentrated on ten associations, which pursued convocation of CNS and organized a general unlimited strike. Through the discussions with President Eyadèma, FAR succeeded in forming a Forum National de Dialogue, in June constituted by 200 representatives from the presidency side and the civil society side. In April, uni-partism finished through the enactment of party law"Loi No 91-04 Portant charte des partis politiques". LTDH appealed to AFP (Agence France Presse) at the event held on April 5. They stated that soldiers shot two participants when they had tried to protest against the status of General Eyadèma showing a picture of the victim's headshot using a rifle (*MTM* 1991:953). In April, FAR was dissolved but reformed to Front de l'Opposition Démocratique (FOD) and expanded to Collectif de l'Opposition Démocratique (COD). FOD/COD concentrated again in the aim to reach democracy and organized unlimited strike in June. Economic activities were completely stopped. Clashes among groups from the regime side and the society side occurred everywhere in Lomé. Finally, President Eyadèma had to accept the convocation of CNS to finish economic paralysis and confusion in Togo. On June 12th, the convocation of CNS was signed. Associations, Catholic churches, students, political parties and the military constituted CNS delegations.

In this situation LTDH played a significant role. LTDH engaged in drafting work for the CNS

Acts in the transition period and development of the new constitution to replace the former constitution of 1980 suspended by CNS, and making a report for CNS on human rights. This report of July 1991 is very important to show political tendency of the LTDH. In this report, Togo achieved autonomy by referendum in 1956 and independence in 1960. Human rights in Togo insured political, religious and possession freedom following the sprit of Universal Declaration of Human Rights until the fall of Sylvanus Olympio's regime by military coup d'état in 1963. However, after second coup in 1967, the regime continued extra judicially in that condition until 1979. Due to lack of rules in law, no one could expect any respect for human rights and the international community was in a cold war framework. France ignored the violation of human rights in political assassinations, tortures, arrest and execution outside of law in Togo for keeping anti-Communist and pro-France countries particularly in francophone Africa. In 1980, the third constitution was enacted after 13 years absence but it had enacted the expansion of the President's power. Accusations of human rights in Togo by Amnesty International or so had never stopped. Other types of violations were: prohibition of publication of newspaper except of national paper Nouvelle Marche (Togo-Presse), negation of association freedom, telephone tapping, disturbance of exchange, arrest and binding without judicial procedure, disappearance, lay off, confiscation of property, imposed migrant, electric torture and kidnapping in foreign countries [20].

The CNS made another report on human rights [21]. This report explained the following: distribution of national resources has been distorted by tribalism and nepotism through corruption and human rights has been violated in a uni-party dictatorial regime of General Eyadèma and RPT during the past 24 years. Togolese people were marginalized by political control. The CNS tried to perform a smaller state role from an orchestra conductor of national development to enable the overcoming of the former regime's problems. Former constitutions of 1960, 1963, 1980 emphasized the State of law (L'Etat de droit), but they were just slogans. It is indispensable to divide administrative, legislative and judicial function, particularly judicial and state power for State of law. Justice has to respect fundamental human rights and the State of law has to have been constituted by pluralistic political parties that have different ideologies for criticizing freely. It means that a multi-party system is the centre of democracy. In a political system, the term for a President of Republic should be shortened to 5 years from 7 years of fifth French Republic style and re-elected one more term only. The Prime Minister should be elected in a major party of National Assemble, not by President's designation in an actual system. National Assembly introduces the unicameral system. It means a semi-presidential system.

These two reports relative with the LTDH have principally common contexts. However, remarkable differences exist on evaluation of the human rights situation of Olympio's term in 1960-1963 after independence. Southern originated people principally as Ewé and Mina had power since colonial time until 1963. In Olympio's term also, human rights violations were reported against northern people as physical binding and professional discrimination. It is recognized in CNS's report but the other

ignored it.

At the debut of the CNS, the LTDH played an important role in democratic transition. However, the LTDH gradually reduced its direct political actions through the stagnation of democratic transition caused by divisions in the transitional regime, conflict between HCR and the Prime Minister of transition government, enforcement of military intervention and recovering political power by General Eyadèma.

5 Human Rights Activities after the Democratic Transition

5.1 LTDH's Activities after the CNS System

LTDH contributed greatly in achieving a democratic process in Togo. However, after the end of transition in the CNS system, LTDH's approach changed drastically. At the debut of 1993, President Eyadèma and Prime Minister Koffigoh declared together the end of the CNS system in democratic transition. President Eyadèma once again designated Koffigoh as the Prime Minister. Even though it was the same status as the Prime Minister, its meaning was completely different. Togolese people were deeply discouraged that Koffigoh was no longer the representative of the LTDH nor the civil society but rather a politician looking after his personal interests.

Dégli, second president of LTDH had mobilization ability and a radical political tendency that he required Eyadèma's retiring as a first condition for democratisation. His accession of the LTDH's president couldn't be ignored by Eyadèma's regime that has just recovered political power from the previous CNS. Military aggression enforced against the LTDH led to the destruction of the office, confiscation of documents and attacking the members. Dégli had to flee the country.

In the absence of Dégli, Koffimessa Dévotsou was elected as the third president of the LTDH. He depoliticised rapidly LTDH's activities. LTDH has not directly accused the state for human rights violations and not required a pressure on Togo from the international community.

LTDH categorizes human rights protection and promotion in their activities. LTDH thinks that human rights protection is about accusations of human rights violations, requires its improvement, and promotion enhances the consciousness on human rights for consolidation of freedom under law, rule of law for the Togolese people. Accordingly the LTDH's categorization of human rights activities, character of the LTDH's activities has changed from the sensational human rights protection to the quiet promotion at the point at the end of the democratic transition.

From 1967 until 1991, General Eyadèma's uni-party authoritarian regime maintained military influence. During 24 years, human rights violations in Togo were well known, with 400,000 refugees

but the international community ignored this. LTDH moved its focus towards vulgarisation of human rights consciousness more than accusation of state. LTDH organized seminars not only for elementary and junior high school teachers, but also for other human rights and women's associations.

In June 1994 in Lomé, the LTDH organized two seminars with FIDH on human rights associations and administration on the theme"Good function of human rights NGO"and "Domestic adoption of regional and international norm of human rights". Other seminars were organized on themes regarding practices and human rights activities in November 1997 by support of the South African NGO Coalition for Peace in Africa, and in January 1998 by the British Council [22].

LTDH evaluated that humans rights consciousness has diffused in the higher educated people, but not in the lower educated as yet. The present purpose of the LTDH is the realization of human rights enlightenment activities at a grass root level, those that live in a state of unconsciousness regarding human rights.

United Nations declared"International Human Rights Year"in 1998 as the 50th Anniversary of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. With the UN declaration, the LTDH aimed to advance human rights education as a first purpose in 1998 for vulgarisation of human rights consciousness. In January 1998, the LTDH organized a seminar for learning "Charter of Banjul"(Charte africaine des droits de l'homme et des peuples) concluding in 1981 and"Universal Declaration of Human Rights". This seminar discussed the state's obligation on human rights, NGO's role and importance of human rights education in school education [23]. LTDH also appealed to the necessity of thorough documentation of human rights, positive use of the media, translation of documents from French to regional languages, and creation of a student's section and commission for sustainable activities in the LTDH [24].

Recently, the LTDH efforts have led to the enlightenment of human rights of prisoners. LTDH practiced education program for jailers teaching that prisoners have human rights and teaching them the meaning of human rights. In October-November, the LTDH organized human rights education programs in Protestant high schools from principal cities with Amnesty International [25].

Human Rights are very delicate and diplomatic issue in Togo. The dispute since May 1999, between Togolese government with Amnesty International is symbolic. Human rights issues in Togo aren't only on domestic politics, but also diplomacy that links directly to economic cooperation. Since 1993, with the exception of France, other principal donor countries have stopped or limited their economic cooperation for Togo. In this situation, the Togolese government reacted strongly against Amnesty International which published the report titled"Togo: rule of terror"[26] in May 1999. The most disputed point of this report was that regarding the electoral campaign of June 1998, Togolese forces executed more than 100 people including soldiers and abandoned dead bodies in the Guinea gulf. These bodies were found in Benin. The Togolese government immediately prohibited this report in Togo and accused Amnesty International of false representation. Amnesty International also accused of human

rights violation in Togo and required an investigation by an international organization. This dispute hasn't concluded as yet. The Togolese government is very nervous regarding human rights problems and that has been the major reason for the suspension of economic cooperation by the European Union, particularly by Germany. However, in this hot dispute between Togo and Amnesty international, the LTDH has kept silent on this issue. This attitude of the LTDH was unexpected, and symbolized the change of the LTDH's character.

Finally, the investigation group composed by United Nations and Organization of African Unity (OAU) was sent to Togo for the request of Togolese government. The report of UN/OAU released in February 2001 confirmed existence of human right violations and extra judiciary executions in Togo. Togolese government immediately accused this report as the imperialism of international organization.

At the time of the presidential election of June 1998, the LTDH assisted electoral observers of EU and investigated on human rights violations during the electoral campaign with Amnesty International and FIDH [27]. On refugees, the LTDH informed to L'observatoire-Paris, the FIDH, and l'organisation mondiale de lutte contre la torture [28]. However, the LTDH doesn't publish any report under it's own title. LTDH explained that financial difficulties and avoiding same type of report published already by other organizations as above-mention were reasons for not making publications on this matter [29]. However, it is evident they are avoiding conflict with the regime.

LTDH's activities became compromised with the state. LTDH petitioned the diffusion of human rights education to the ministry of education [30] and the CNDH, not by accusation and protest. The Togolese government declared"Human rights and dialogue year in Togo"in 1999 [31].

Associations change their activities sensitively in the circumstances and history. There isn't one fixed desirable type. So it can't be decided which is better. Here, the causes of the changing of the LTDH's activities are considered. There are 4 principal causes for examination. Firstly, military intervention was enforced by restoration of power by General Eyadèma after the end of CNS system. So the LTDH's activities were limited. Secondly, the leaving of principal members weakened the LTDH. At the time of the LTDH's creation, opposition party didn't exist in RPT uni-party regime. However, political party law (Loi No91-04 Portant charte des partis politiques) legalized it in April 1991. Many members participated in political parties and left from the LTDH. Thirdly, it's financial difficulty. At the time of convocation of the CNS, the LTDH could expect financial resources from broad social stratums. However, at the end of the CNS system that meant failure of democratisation by civil society, the LTDH couldn't expect contributions from mass. Further, in 1993 the principal donor countries and international organizations stopped their economic cooperation for Togo because of the delay of democratisation and human rights violations. Through cooperative suspension or limitations this has had serious damage on the Togolese economy. In this economic crisis, the LTDH counts more than 3000 members in 1999 but almost all members don't pay the annual membership fee [32].

These above reasons are important factors but not decisive one. The principal reason for changing the LTDH's activities was the falling of their legitimacy by disappointment caused by Koffigoh, the first president of the LTDH and Prime Minister of the transitional government. At the time of convocation of the CNS in July-August 1991, Koffigoh was the symbol of democratisation and civil society. There existed an optimistic atmosphere that Togo would be changed to a democratic country by Koffigoh's leadership. In fact, he deepened the division and weakened the CNS system. Finally, he handed over the democratic process to General Eyadèma on the condition of preserving his status as Prime Minister. Because Koffigoh embodied the LTDH, betrayal of Koffigoh fell instantly and directly on the legitimacy of the LTDH. In this situation, the LTDH could no longer expect big mobilization of demonstration. LTDH had to change the direction of their activities.

Due to these reasons, the LTDH changed the direction and almost all other small associations stopped their activities in Togo. However, outside of Togo, human rights associations went different road.

5.2 Human Rights Association in Foreign Countries: Batir le Togo

Now, there are 400,000 Togolese refugees, about 1/10 of total population. These refugees organize human rights movements in foreign places. Here, it considers on"Batir le Togo/Togo Aufbauen"(BT) as one of associations. With official documents written in French and German, BT's activities across in France and Germany. Togo was ruled under German colonization until 1914, defeat of World War□ by France and Great Britain that divided German Togoland. So Togo has an intimate relationship with Germany and there are many Togolese refugees in Germany. BT accused of Eyadèma regime, on human rights violation, election fraud and extra-judiciary execution.

BT appeals to support young people after the failure of democratic transition that it was expected the state of law by the wind of East [33]. BT's slogans are "Fidelity, Cohesion and Fraternity." BT has 22 sections in 3 principally categories as: association, social and economic. Financial resources of BT are a membership fee, personal property of president of BT Dégli and financial support from foreign governments and NGO's.

Generally, human rights movement in abroad tends to be more radical than domestic activities because of less physical risk, insufficiency of information and necessity sensationalism for financial support. BT isn't an exception. BT is lead by Dégli. He is said to be a presidential candidate in 10 years for his ability to achieve mass mobilization [34]. Dégli has a deep rancour against General Eyadèma because his family was attacked by military and was disappointed by the division of oppositions and betrayal of Koffigoh [35]. Dégli looked malfunction and formalization of CNS system by division caused by Koffigoh and other opposition leaders. Dégli accused the opposition leaders of lack of vision on

refugee and economic policy [36]. He also accused the LTDH of holding as election for president during his absence.

BT shows its radical character from their report. BT accused very strictly on human rights violation in the Eyadèma's regime, lack of transparency and manipulation of the election [37]. BT also accused Western countries including France of supporting Togo.

In the after election's report, BT accused the National Electoral Commission of tampering with the election results and human rights violations, detection of 20 young people by military police, and their suffocation. Also BT accused the international community for being ignorant of violations and supporting General Eyadèma. BT insisted on boycotting the election of Togolese, cooperation among opposition leaders for avoiding division, and pressure to Togo to make an Independent Electoral Commission and reorganize the election to involve the international community, such as the United Nations, EU, OAU and France [38].

But BT tends to exaggerate because of insufficient information resources in Togo and sensationalism to get financial support. For example, BT reported that if the counting of ballot had been organized in transparency, General Eyadèma would never have won in presidential election in August 1993. However, opposition leaders boycotted this election because the Supreme Court refused the presidential candidate of Gilchrist Olympio, son of first President Olymipo assassinated in 1963, due to a document problem. This election was conducted regardless of the apathy of the Togolese people. The participation rate was only 36% principally northern region of General Eyadèma and broadly boycotted in the southern region. In this situation, it was impossible to get another result besides Eyadèma's win.

6 Universal Human Rights and LTDH

This article considered the human rights movement in relation to the democratic process in Togo principally through the LTDH's activities. It is necessary to rethink the meaning of the concept of human rights in Africa before any conclusion can be made on how the human rights movement contributed to democratisation. This is in light of a context of civil society. The recognition of the LTDH on human rights known from their documents and interviews with members is based on modern European concept. LTDH has reasons in "Declaration des droits de l'homme"in 1789 and "Universal Declaration of Human Rights"in 1948. This concept exists on the premise of universality of human rights and individual as a minimum unit of society.

In this premise, the LTDH recognizes that it is important to develop civil society in adaptation of tradition and custom to universal norm of human rights stage [39]. It is possible to make the individual with the process of obtaining relatively homogeneous identity in the people of a certain territory in the

direction of nation-state. There are some questions on the LTDH's recognition. Because nation-state is still one of possibility in future not as premise in Africa, and the individual isn't necessarily a social atom in African societies.

LTDH is the biggest human rights association and has legitimacy. So the LTDH looks to be outside of ethno-regional problem, one of biggest reasons of political instability in Togo. It exists in northern-southern, Kabyè-Ewé (Mina) conflict in Togo. Southern people ruled since the colonial era under the German and French colonial government until the first coup by Eyadèma in 1963, and northern people has ruled in present after 2-coup d'état.

LTDH hasn't been outside of ethno-regional scheme in Togo. Almost all members of the LTDH are southern people. Some members don't deny that the LTDH has ethnic tendency for restoration of rights of Ewé [40]. This tendency appeared in the LTDH's attitude to ignore on human rights violations against northern people in Olympio's era 1960-1963 in the above-mentioned human rights report of the CNS in July 1991. It is far Kara for the LTDH, northern principal city situated 430km north from Lomé and 10km from General Eyadèma's village of birth, Pya, than Paris distanced some thousand kilometres. In the end of 1990's, even the northern region influenced by General Eyadèma is a way to liberalization of association and information. However, the LTDH has no office and no intention of its installation in Kara.

Even in the LTDH, an association for universal human rights, it is visible the ethno-regional identities advantages on national identities. Is it possible to discuss the consolidation of human rights consciousness in Africa without thinking how complex and diverse African's identities and individual of European concept cross each other? It is an inevitable theme for the human rights movement in Africa..

7 Conclusion

This article analysed the human rights movement in the democratic process in Togo through the LTDH's activities. LTDH changed drastically their direction of activities after the end of the transition period. It may not be appropriate to generalize on civil society's role in democratisation from a consideration of the LTDH. However, the LTDH's actions for democratisation are much more significant than an association.

Before the CNS, the LTDH accused directly against the state regarding human rights violations and worked as a centre for the civil society network. In the transition period, the LTDH contributed in making a draft of new constitution and human rights reports. Also after democratic transition, the LTDH depoliticised their activities. There are several reasons, but this article focused on the fall of legitimacy by the betrayal of Koffigoh as the decisive one. In diverse civil society spheres,

human rights issues are very sensitive with regard to what the state should be. Concerning ethno-regional relations, the LTDH doesn't exist outside of them in spite of their universal appeal. This issue isn't only concerned in Africa, but it isn't inevitable to think in African politics. It is necessary to think of the concept of human rights not only in dichotomy between tradition and modernity, nor society and individual.

Finally, the approach of the concept of civil society is indispensable for political analysis in the democratic process in African countries that have incomplete state governance. It is necessary to understand political engagement of non-state spheres. However, the relationship between state and civil society is not fixed. Civil society is not just in opposition to the state, nor a necessary-sufficient condition for development of democracy.

<Note>

1) The concept of civil society is far from fixed and clear definition, so it has to be used reflectively. This article treats this concept in minimal sense as "Politicised society". So civil society doesn't have automatically democratic character, nor will of democratisation. So we think that it is necessary to institutionalise civil society in the level of state institution and psychological level of people.

2) Sovereign National Conference (CNS) was convened principally in francophone countries. But CNS wasn't convened only in francophone countries, but also some attempts in Anglophone countries. CNS suspended former state systems, as the National Assembly, the government and the constitution, and ruled transition period as a provisional supreme authority. CNS's goal was to realize free and transparent elections for democratic transition. CNS enacted acts of CNS as provisional constitution, the High Council of Republic (Haut Conseil de la République) as provisional legislative organization and the government of transition. Historical model of CNS is thought as Convention National in 1792-1795. CNS was convened about 200 years later of French revolution.

3) After political agreement of July 1999 (L'accord-Cadre de Lomé) between presidential and opposition side, European Union announced to restart of economic cooperation to Togo, but it is very prudent to realize it.

4) Ligue Togolaise des Droits de l'homme, *Droits & Liberté,* February-March 1991,p.5.

5) Agboyibo was the Togolese representative of Human Rights Commission of United Nations in 1987-88, a member of international deputy union in 1988-89 and a member pontifical council 1988-94. He was award a prize for African in human rights and democracy and social, economy domain by German government in 1992. He is the President of opposition party CAR (Comité d'action pour renouveau) since 1991 (Dégli 1996 :84).

6) *Droits & Liberté*(1991),pp.18-19.

7) Ligue Togolaise des Droits de l'Homme, *Bilan des droits de l'homme au Togo de 1960 à 1991*, July 1991, p.1.

8) *Droits & Liberté*(1991),p.5.

9) Interview with Mr,Jean-Yaovi Dégli, President of Batir le Togo, former President of LTDH, in his office of Paris, on 9 September 1999.

10) *Droits & Liberté*(1991),p.13.

11) *Ibid.*, pp.12-13.

12) *Ibid.*, pp.10-11,13.

13) *Ibid.*, p.19.

14) Annual Report of LTDH, *Rapport d'Activités*, 1998, pp.9-10.

15) *Droits & Liberté*(1991), pp.27-28.

16) *Ibid.*, p.32.

17) Interview with Mr,Augustin Améga, ex-leader of student group, Chief of *Journal A PROPOS*, in Lomé, on 26 August 1999.

18) This chorus was not programmed and started by singing of one young participant. Interview with Améga.

19) Liberation of television and radio wasn't achieved.

20) LTDH (1991.7), pp.4-6.

21)*Rapport Générale de la Conférence Nationale Souveraine*, Conférence Nationale Souveraine, Répulique Togolaise. August 1991.

22) LTDH (1998), pp.2-3.

23) *Ibid.*, pp.4-7.

24) *Ibid.*, p.7.

25) *Ibid.*, p.8.

26) *Amnesty International-Report-AFR 57/01/99*,"Togo. Rule of Terror," 5 May 1999.

27) LTDH (1998),pp.13-14.

28) *Ibid.*, pp.15-16.

29) Interview with Mr,Kofimessa Dévotsou, President of LTDH, in headquarter of LTDH in Lomé, on 7 September 1999.

30) LTDH (1998),p.7.

31) *Ibid.*, p.9.

32) Interview with Mr,Nicolas Koffi Amulalo, Secretary of project of LTDH, in Lomé, on 6 September 1999.

33) *Statuts de Batir le Togo*, 14 February 1997, p.1.

34) Interview with Améga.

35) Interview with Dégli.

36) Interview with Dégli.

37) *Déclaration de Batir le Togo,* 14 June 1998, pp.1-2.

38) *Communique de Batir le Togo*, 24 June 1998, pp.1-3.

39) LTDH (1998), p.12.

40) Interview with Dévotsou.

<Bibliography:>

Bayart,Jean-François,"Civil Society in Africa,"in Chabal Patrick(ed.), *Political Domination in Afirca* , Cambridge,1986. (Translated from french text, Bayart,Jean-François,"La revanche des sociétes africaines,"*Politique Africaine*, No.11, Karthala,1983.)

Bayart Jean-François, Achille Mbembe, Comi Toulabor(eds.),*Le politique par le bas en*

Afrique noire,Karthala,1992.

Dégli,Jean Yaovi, *Togo: La tragédie africaine*, Editions Nouvelles du sud,1996.

Endo,Mitsugi,"Africa ni Okeru'Shimin Shakai',"*Soubun*, 1997.

Endo,Mitsugi,"'Minshuka'Go no Minshusei Teichaku Kyokumen ni Okeru NGO no Yakuwari to Kinou, Zambia no Jirei,"*Document of Kaihatsu Enjo Seminar*,1998.

Riedel, Manfred, *Shimin Shakai no Gainenshi* (*Begriffe und Geschichte,* translated into Japanese), Ibunsha, 1990.

<Magazin>

Marchés tropicaux et méditerranéens (MTM)

La Nouvelle Marche (NM) (Togo-Presse: TP)

3. 先住民政権の挑戦:「新しいボリビア」の建設に向けた困難な道のり*

筑波大学大学院　人文社会科学研究科　現代文化・公共政策専攻　教授　遅野井 茂雄

はじめに

昨年12月の大統領選挙で、アイマラ系先住民エボ・モラレス候補が劇的勝利を飾ってから8ヶ月が経過した。独立180年にして初の先住民出身の大統領であり、1982年の民主化以降、議会での決選投票を経ずに当選した初の大統領の誕生であった。1月の就任を前にキューバ、ベネズエラを皮切りにヨーロッパ、中国、南アフリカを訪問して対外的プレゼンスを高めた新大統領は、54%の得票率という高い正当性を背景に、5月公約通り天然ガスの国有化を宣言、東部の農地改革に着手し、アンデスの最貧国を一躍世界に注目される国に仕立てた。

モラレス政権の誕生は、現代ラテンアメリカ政治の文脈からみて、二つの意味をもつ。ワシントン・コンセンサスに先立ち1985年に導入された新自由主義体制(新経済政策)からの決別を意図した政権であること、既存の政治・経済システムを律する支配ルールを根底から問い直す社会運動を基盤とする政権であるという点である。

高地先住民を主体に、コカ栽培者、農民、住民組織、労組等から成る多様な社会運動は、経済政策の変更、民営化(資本化)企業の再国有化、反 FTAA(米州自由貿易地域)、天然ガスの対米輸出反対、コカ政策の見直し、土地問題や自治権などの諸要求を掲げ、「国の再興」(refundación del país)を合言葉に、既存の権力構造と真っ向から対決する反システム的集合行為を実践し、権力の均衡を創り出した。そして選挙により政権を掌握、大統領は就任式で「新自由主義体制の終焉と植民地国家の解体」を宣言した。それは自己認識で62%(2001年センサス)を占める先住民を社会底辺に押しとどめてきた植民地以来の構造と支配文化、新自由主義と限定的民主主義の解体という革命的試みである。征服から5世紀を経て白人・混血支配層が築いた排除型とは異なる、多数を包含する国家や開発、民主主義の構築、国家開発計画によれば「異文化共生に基づく民主的共同体主義」(Comunitarismo Intercultural Democrático)の建設である。8月に発足した憲法制定議会において、ケチュア、アイマラ、ガラニー、スペイン語の通訳を介し、多文化多民族に基づく新たな秩序構築へ向けた審議が開始することになった。

だが、改革はいまだプロジェクトにとどまる。予想されたように、経済ナショナリズムを標榜する最貧国とグローバル化との軋轢、経済界や中間層の利害を支える既存システムとの対立、輸出資源をもつ東部低地との対立が生まれた。9月には憲法改正の議決方法をめぐり東部4県でゼネストが発生、道路封鎖を手段に既存秩序に効果的に挑んできた社会運動を基盤とする政権は、攻守所を変える形となった。

本稿では先住民政権誕生の背景と新政権の開発の方向性を押さえ、資源の国有化、外交政策、憲法制定議会の動向の分析を通じて、モラレス政権の改革の課題を探ることとする。

1. 先住民の政治的台頭

過去20年間に顕著となった先住民の政治的台頭は、国民統合モデルの限界、民主化の進展、ネオリベラル改革に伴う国家・社会（先住民）関係の変化、既存左派勢力の衰退、分権化等による政治空間の生成、冷戦終結に伴う利益政治からアイデンティティ政治への転換、先住民族間のナショナルなレベルでの連携の構築、国境を越えたアドボカシー・ネットワークの浸透などの要因による説明が一般的には可能であろう[1]。

ボリビアに文脈を移せば、モノカルチャー経済に依拠し先住民が多数派を占める内陸の最貧国で導入された徹底したネオリベラル政策の帰結という点が根底にある。新経済政策で経済は安定し天然ガス開発に外資が流入したが、レント産業に支えられた回復は貧困改善や雇用創出にはつながらず、格差を拡大させた[2]。1990年代半ばの大衆参加法と地方分権化法は開発政策に住民参加を促し、住民を政党から切り離して地方の政治変化を活性化させ、公職の分配に基づき新経済政策を支えた政党間の「協定による民主主義（Democracia Pactada）」への批判を強めた。ネオリベラル政策や、社会からの回路を失い腐敗した政党制度への不満を吸収したのが無党派・先住民系のポピュリズム政党（CONDEPA、UCS）であったが、97年選挙を前に指導者の死去で両党が求心力を失い、「協定による民主主義」体制に吸収された結果、左派に政治空間が生まれた。さらに97年バンセル政権の下での大衆参加政策の後退は不満を広げ、米国支援による徹底した違法コカ栽培根絶政策（「コカ・セロ」）は経済危機を一層深刻にし、失業率を倍増させ反発を広げることになった（遅野井2004）。

先住民文化の根幹に触れるコカ撲滅政策への抗議運動で指導力を発揮したエボ・モラレスは、2000年の「コカ戦争」と「水戦争」を機に、反ネオリベラリズム運動を糾合・拡大した。その後モラレス政権誕生までの5年間は、後に副大統領となる左派の論客ガルシア・リネラが示唆したように、公共財の定義とその配分をめぐる社会運動と国家との熾烈な闘争のプロセスであった（García Linera 2005:36）。社会運動は、新しい公共政策のあり方を提起したのである。例えば世界銀行の支援下に行われたコチャバンバの水の民営化に伴う住民の抗議行動は、公共財の供給を民間に委ねるネオリベラル政策への批判とともに、住民生活に直接関わる重要な政策が住民に諮られることなく、上から一方的に押し付けられたことに対する反発から生じたものであった（García, García y Quitón 2003）。結果として民営化は断念され、公共政策を住民の手に取り戻す結果となった。

2002年大統領選挙では、社会運動と左派勢力との連合体である MAS（社会主義運動）から立候補したモラレスは、直接投票で首位に立った MNR（国民革命運動）のサンチェス元大統領に1．5ポイント差に肉薄する躍進を果たした。「アイマラ国建設」を唱える急進的な MIP（パチャクティ・インディヘナ運動）と併せ先住民勢力は約3分の1の議席を獲得する。転機となったのは、2003年8月、2年目を迎えたサンチェス大統領が MIR（左翼革命運動）との与党連合に第3勢力の NFR（新共和勢力）を取り込んだことである。1985年の新経済政策の立案者サンチェス大統領を軸に糾合した白人・混血の与党政権側と、野党先住民系勢力が対峙する構図が形成されたからである。諸勢力間の社会

契約の必要性が叫ばれた中で、同大統領が「国家プロジェクト」とも言えたチリ経由での天然ガスの対米輸出を具体化しようとしたことで抗議活動が高まった。道路封鎖に対し治安当局との衝突で犠牲者が生まれ、抗議活動は激化(死者59人)、連立与党が分裂する中で大統領は辞任に追い込まれ、アメリカに逃走した(「ガス戦争」)。社会運動は、05年には天然ガスの国有化と憲法制定議会の召集を要求し、後継で副大統領から昇格したメサ大統領を同様に辞任に追い込んだ。憲法上後継の上・下院議長をも実力行使で辞任を迫り、最高裁長官を暫定大統領として選挙を実現、一挙に先住民政権の樹立を達成したのである。

両政変とも、エルアルトの近隣住民組織連合(FEJUVE)のストの呼び掛けに始まり、「ミクロ政府」と化した各バリオの住民組織の反乱が触媒となり広がった(Mamani 2005)。ボリビアと隣国を結ぶ交通の要所で、ラパス包囲において戦略的位置を占める同市の道路封鎖を手段とする抗議活動が、権力の均衡状態を創り出した。05年の政変は同市の水の民営化への抗議に始まり、フランス企業は撤退を迫られている。

2005年選挙でモラレスは、ガルシア・リネラを副大統領に指名して都市中間層に支持を拡大、事前の予想を覆し ADN(民族民主行動党)から分かれネオリベラル路線を継承する社会民主権力(PODEMOS)のキロガ元大統領(28%)を大差で破った。だが MAS は上院で定員27議席の内12と過半数を獲得できず、下院では130議席の内72と過半数を制したが重要法案に必要な3分の2の議席には及ばず、野党との合意が不可欠となった。同時に行われた初の県知事公選では9県の内2県でしか勝利できなかった。

議会、地方政府との間で制約を抱えての船出であったが、新政権は、先住民・社会運動出身の多彩な活動家を閣僚に据える異色の陣容となった。大統領府には社会運動調整副大臣ポストが新設された。外相に先住民運動活動家のチョケワンカ、新設の水大臣に FEJUVE 指導者のアベル・ママニ、法務大臣に家政婦連合、鉱山大臣に鉱山協同組合連合、経済開発大臣に農民女性連合、労働大臣に工業労働者連合の指導者が、教育大臣にはアイマラ系の社会学者が登用された。焦点の炭化水素大臣は、痛烈なネオリベラリズム批判で知られたジャーナリストのソリス・ラダ、開発企画大臣は左派でサン・アンドレス大学教授のカルロス・ビジェガスが就任した。

2. 国家開発計画にみる「共同体的」開発

6 月に発表された国家開発計画には、新政権の開発コンセプトが明確に表明されている(MPD 2006)。先住民を不平等と社会的排除にとどめた元凶として、19世紀の銀、20世紀の錫、今日の天然ガスと続く一次産品輸出モデルが批判の俎上に挙げられ、それを支えた「植民地主義」の解体が急務とされる。市場主義、個人主義、消費主義に基づくネオリベラリズムは、「大多数の国民から資源を奪う」植民地主義の延長と捉えられる。それに代わり、高地・低地の先住民、農村共同体、農村からの都市移住者、小零細企業に息づく「共同体的な(comunitaria)」実践と多様な生産組織の役割が強調され、開発のオルタナティブが提示されている[3]。

開発計画によれば、ボリビア革命(1952 年)でも国内に資本蓄積を許さない一次産品輸出モデルは変わらず、錫国有化や農地改革も問題解消に不十分で、むしろ新たなオリガルキーを生み出した。外国援助に依存した国家資本主義が破綻した結果、資源配分は国家から市場に委ねられ、富は富裕層(国民の 10 分の1)に集中、格差は拡大した。「ネオリベラル植民地主義」のもと、不平等や排除は国際ドナーにより「貧困」と捉えられた。国家が弱体化し生じた公共政策の間隙は NGO により部分的に埋められたが、市場原理に基づく国際協力の開発デザインは、民衆を生産手段と雇用から切り離し差別と排除を強めたと、「貧困削減戦略」も批判にさらされている。

新たな開発として国の多様な現実にみ合う「総合的で多角化されたモデル」が提起される。天然資源の主権回復と工業化、生産手段と雇用の保障による富の再分配、生産機構の多角化、国内市場の回復、国際市場との関係再編が基盤となる。国家は開発の推進者で、天然資源、電力、環境を戦略部門とし、分配と生産の担い手として介入する。民間企業、再建される公共部門、共同体的生産組織による混合経済が想定されている。

開発コンセプトは幅広いものである。開発は「基本ニーズの充足ではなく、優先順位や政策を多様な共同体や民族が決定する参加と討議のプロセス」(p. 12)であると、公共政策への民衆参加が強調される。社会運動が政策決定と生産手段に参画する「社会共同体的な国家」を実現することで人々の能力が増大し、良き生活が保障される。そのため社会や行政に埋め込まれた植民地主義の慣行を一掃すること、連帯、協力、補完、互酬の涵養が必要とされる。計画冒頭に「民主的、文化的革命」であると標榜される所以である。

国際経済との関係については、生物多様性や人間の生存を脅かす飽くなき競争から社会を守る必要があり、財の交易のみで世界と関係を築くべきではないとして、FTA(自由貿易協定)反対の立場が表明される。競争や支配による統合に代わり、連帯、補完、互酬に基づく諸国民の新たな対等な関係として、キューバ、ベネズエラと締結した人民貿易協定(TCP)が位置づけられている。

資源価格の急騰という良好な環境を最大限に活用し、大多数の国民の要求に応えることが必要であるとして、5年間の目標は高いところに設定されている。年率6．3%の GDP 成長率の達成、年間9万人の雇用創出と都市部失業率を8．7%から4%に半減、貧困人口を63%から49．7%に削減、所得格差を富裕層上位10%と最貧層下位10%の国民所得に占める比率を現状の29倍から21倍に削減するなど野心的な目標となっている。

しかし開発計画によれば、資源の工業化を通じ中長期的に製造業の構成を転換するとしても、短期的には資源輸出モデルは解消できず、輸出部門の競争的環境を維持するため慎重なマクロ経済運営が必要である。開発銀行創設による中小生産者への融資拡大、公共投資の拡大を通じた輸出多角化と競争力ある輸入代替計画が披瀝されるが、同時に財政、価格、通貨、国際収支等の安定を基本とし、天然ガス、鉱山等への直接外国投資の急速な回復に依拠した高成長の構図が描かれている(表1)。公共投資も主にインフラ整備に割かれ、社会分野への投資は 3 割弱にとどまる。国際機関や先進国による債務免除を前提とした計画で、資源価格の下落に備え開発安定化基金の創設も

掲げられている。

全体として、反グローバル化、新自由主義の解体という表向きのイデオロギーとともに、ドナーとの良好な関係や外資・民間投資促進に必要な現実的な政策が並存しており、政策遂行上、矛盾点を含むものとなっている。

表1. 主要経済指標と新政権の推定目標値(%、GDP 比)

	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2008	20011
GDP 成長率	5.0	0.4	2.5	1.7	2.5	2.9	3.9	4.1	4.1	6.4	7.6
インフレ率	4.4	3.1	3.4	0.9	2.5	3.9	4.6	4.9	4.0	3.0	3.0
民間投資	17.8	13.4	12.8	8.6	10.1	7.6	5.6	7.1	8.6	11.4	17.0
公共投資	5.3	5.7	5.1	5.4	5.5	5.2	6.2	5.7	6.3	8.1	9.5
IDH	4.7	4.6	5.1	5.1	4.6	4.6	5.0	9.2	11.2	14.5	15.3
財政収支	-4.7	-3.5	-3.7	-6.8	-8.8	-7.9	-5.6	-2.3	-3.4	-3.5	-2.1
輸出	13.0	12.7	14.8	15.8	16.4	19.7	24.6	28.5	32.0	36.8	42.9
直接外国投資	12.0	12.1	8.7	8.6	8.5	2.4	0.7	-3.0	0.8	6.1	8.6

出所)MPD(2006)p. 217. 2005 年は暫定値、それ以降は推定値

3. 改革をめぐる動向

道路封鎖を武器に抗議活動を展開した社会運動が政権を掌握したことで、一時的に平穏が訪れた。輸出の急速な伸びによる国際収支の改善、多国間の債務免除の恩恵、新炭化水素法による財政の好転など良好な経済環境を背景に、独特のカリスマ性を醸し出す先住民大統領には、静観するアメリカを除く外国支援も集まり、政権は順調な滑り出しをみせた。

憲法制定議会選挙に向けた調整、外交政策の転換、3月末で切れた IMF とのスタンバイ協定の未更新の決定などを除くと、政権発足後100日間に具体的な改革は発表されなかった。ようやく5月1日のメーデーに天然ガスの国有化が発表された。だが同時に発表された最低賃金は控えめな改善幅となり、廃棄を目指した新経済政策(大統領令21060号)は自由契約雇用を規定した第55条の廃棄にとどまった。むしろ中央銀行の独立性は確保され、資本化(民営化)後に設立された諸規制機関も手付かずで、マクロ経済の安定と自由市場経済の大枠は堅持された。

(1)天然資源の国有化

天然ガスの国有化は主権と威厳の回復という点で熱狂的に国民に迎えられた。これは資源収益の公平な分配を目指す政府にとって、憲法制定議会選挙のキャンペーンとして最も重要な改革であった。だがいわゆる井戸元での国有化は、憲法規定や、2004年の国民投票の結果に基づき翌05年に施行された新炭化水素法の延長上にあるもので、法的枠組みを大きく転換するものではなかった。価格急騰にもかかわらず、契約の再交渉を拒んできた外資に180日間の猶予を与え、新たな契

約交渉を強制させるところに主眼があったと言える。だが56の操業施設に軍を駐留させての公約の実施は、資源ナショナリズムの再来を想起させただけに、ボリビアに対する市場の信頼をおとしめたことは疑いない。

大統領令によれば、外国企業は石油・天然ガスの生産、輸送、精油、流通等の全事業を石油公社(YPFB)に譲渡すること、石油公社は資本化企業とペトロブラス所有の2精油所の株式の51%を支配し、生産規模の大きな2施設からは収益の82%を徴収、それ以外は新炭化水素法が適用される。05年新法では、ロイヤルティ18%の他に直接税(IDH)32%が加算され、課税は50%となっていたが、大統領令で新たに32%が追徴されることになった。これにより政府収入は4億2000万ドルから7億8000万ドルに増加し、石油公社の再建・強化に充てられることになる(ICG 2006)。ペトロブラスやレプソルなど大口投資家は一方的な決定を、接収的性格として反発、国際司法裁判所への提訴も辞さない構えである。徴税率を含め交渉しだいという前提があるが、交渉の基礎となる監査の実施も遅れ、10月28日に交渉期限が迫る中、いまだ合意に至っていない。

8月11日、石油公社の運営権獲得は株式の1%を買い増す資金調達の目途がたたないため一時的に凍結することが発表され、大統領令は、資本化後実態を失った石油公社に関する非現実的な評価に基づく決定であったことが露呈された。28日には石油公社総裁など関係者の辞任が相次いだが、9月12日ペトロブラスが操業する精油所の石油輸出を停止し、操業経費を国庫に組み入れる省令が出された。これにブラジル側が反発したため、副大統領サイドから急きょ同省令が凍結され、外資に対し急先鋒であったソリス大臣らが辞任、15日ビジェガス企画大臣の横滑り人事が発表された。今後交渉は、副大統領を中心に新大臣など穏健派の布陣で行われることになったが、依然不透明な状況が続いている。

ブラジルは天然ガス消費量の50%をボリビアに依存し、ボリビアは天然ガスの75%をブラジルに輸出している。今後の価格交渉や開発計画に示された天然ガスの輸出見込みの達成にも新規投資が不可欠なだけに、ボリビアにとり、国境を接し相互依存度の高いブラジルとの決裂はあり得ない選択肢である。他方、ブラジルのルラ政権は再選を前に基盤の左派勢力を融和するためにも、保守層の批判を浴びながらも、モラレス政権の民族主義政策を支持せざるを得ないジレンマを抱える。

一方、ボリビア政府は、ベネズエラとの協力をテコにブラジルとの交渉を有利に運びたいところである。新政権は発足後最初にベネズエラと援助協定を締結し、キューバとベネズエラは、識字運動、出生証明書交付等で支援を開始した。4月29日ハバナでの3ヶ国首脳会議で人民貿易協定(TCP)が、5月26日ラパスでの包括的協力関係の調印によって、FTAA に対抗しチャベス政権の掲げる代替統合構想(ALBA)での連携が本格化した。ベネズエラ石油公社(PDVSA)と合弁会社ペトロアンディナを設立、石油化学・液化ガス・プラントの建設、探査、34ガソリン・スタンドの設置など15億ドルの協力関係が具体化する。だが国有化宣言後の交渉の中で新規投資は停滞しており、ベネズエラの支援がどこまで現実的かは疑問が残るところである。

資源の国有化は、鉱山、林業など資源全体に及ぶものとされ、米系のサンクリストバル鉱山なども

徴税強化は避けられないが、未だ必要な鉱山法の改正案は発表されていない。その中で、世界最大規模といわれる鉄鉱山ムトゥンの開発権の譲渡は、新政権の新自由主義からの決別の真意を見定める上で注目されよう。前政権下で進んでいたブラジル EBX 社の鉄鋼プラント建設を、新政権は環境等の理由で中止したが、開発推進を求めるプエルト・スアレス住民との対立が生じた。最終的にサンタクルス経済界に押される形で6月1日公開入札が行われ、インドのジンダル鉄鋼電力会社に23億ドルで落札された。40年間のコンセションが認められ、政府は日糧1000万立方メーターの天然ガスをアルゼンチン向け価格の半値で同社に開発用に供給することを条件に、税引き前収益の54%、年間2億ドルの収入を得る。9月24日に譲渡され、5年間で10億ドルの投資が予定されている。07年操業開始の予定で高成長への貢献が見込まれるが、鉱山公社の関与は最低限で、工業化の比率も小さく、鉄鉱石の開発輸出という従来型の民営化となった。

(2)対米関係

ベネズエラ、キューバとの関係が強化され、親米的な外交政策は転換された。コカ生産者組合連合の最高指導者として、大統領はコカ栽培の合法化は譲れず、国際機関でも合法化を働きかけた。コカインと違法コカ栽培が不可分とみるアメリカ政府は、高い支持を得て当選したモラレス政権に対し民主的統治を条件に静観してきたが、麻薬対策協力を大幅に削減した他、2006年のミレニアム・チャレンジ勘定(MCA、6億ドル)の適格国から事実上はずすとともに、FTAをテコに最貧国に圧力を加えている。モラレス政権は、反帝国主義の言辞とは裏腹に対米関係を断ち切れない厳しい現実を抱えている。

麻薬対策協力の見返りにアメリカ市場への特恵的アクセスを保障したアンデス通商促進麻薬撲滅協定(ATPDEA)が今年末で5年の期限が切れるため、ペルーとコロンビアは4月アメリカと FTA 合意に署名し、米議会の批准待ちとなった。その結果、交渉に不参加のボリビアは、アメリカ市場で競争力を失うだけでなく、アンデス共同体(CAN)での大豆市場を失う可能性に直面している。コロンビアが最大の輸出先で、ペルーを合わせ大豆輸出の約6割を占める市場をアメリカ産大豆の流入で失う可能性が出てきたのである。両国の FTA 締結に対し4月、チャベス大統領は共同体からの脱退を表明した。FTA を拒絶するボリビアは共同体議長国の立場から、副大統領が訪米し特恵関税制度の2年間更新をブッシュ政権に働きかけた。11 月の中間選挙後に結論が出されるが、議会を含め同意しないとみられる。更新されないと、TCP 枠でベネズエラが大豆輸入を拡大することが期待されるが、限界があろう。また特恵打ち切りでエルアルトの繊維・アパレルの他、宝飾品、皮革、木工等の対米輸出(シェアー約10%)に影響が出、1 万人の雇用確保が困難となる。

(3)憲法制定議会

憲法制定議会は、排除された先住民や社会組織の参加によるボリビア「再興」のための制度構築の中心、「脱植民地化の中心」と開発計画でも位置づけられており、憲法の全面改定は大統領はじめ長年開催を求めてきた社会運動の主張であった。ところが暫定政権下での合意に基づき3月承認された同議会召集特別法によると、改正は現行憲法規定と同様、出席議員の3分の2の承認が必要

であり(25条)、ガルシア副大統領も3月の段階では、議席の3分の2を占めることは不可能であることから、改正は全体の20%の条項にとどまると述べるなど、全面改定にはならないとみられていた。大統領の代表する社会基盤と副大統領の代表する都市中間層の見解の相異が反映されているだろうが(Lora 2006)、合意に基づく法規定上の制約がある以上、同議会は、先住民・社会運動と白人・メスティソ勢力との間で対話により多民族多文化国家建設に向けた永続的な社会契約を締結するという、2000年代に入ってからの国家的課題を実現する好機と捉えられてきた[4]。

天然ガス国有化や農地改革で与党政府は3分の2の議席獲得を目指したが、255議席の内、半数を確保したものの137議席にとどまった。同時に行われた「地域自治に関する国民投票」では、9県のうち東部4県が賛成するにとどまった。県単位の自治権設定の権限を憲法制定議会に付与し、新憲法が国民投票で承認された後、直ちに自治政府の設立を問うもので、東部諸県の要求に応える形で行われたものである。先住民居住区への自治権付与は本来与党側の目指すものだが、天然ガス等経済中心地の東部の自治権強化は中央政府の財政運営を制約しかねず、政府は国家統一を訴え県単位の自治権には否定的な立場で、与党勢力下の西部高地5県は反対という2つの地域対立が顕在化することとなった。議会選挙と国民投票は、両勢力の微妙な均衡状態を表す結果となった。

8月6日スクレで発足した憲法制定議会は議決方式をめぐり紛糾し、9月1日、与党は同議会が他の法律を超越する「独自のもの(originario)」と判断、憲法や特別法の規定には縛られず、過半数での条項改正を承認した。これは妥協を拒み「ボリビアの再興」を求める社会運動の要求に即したものだが、野党側はチャベス政権と同じく憲法制定議会を最高権力機関とすることで独裁体制に移行するものと反発し審議は中断した。妥協を模索する副大統領が、個別条項は過半数で、全体の承認は3分の2でという折衷案を出したが、否決された場合は国民投票に付され過半数で承認ということになりかねず、野党と東部4県は3分の2での承認を求め9月8日ゼネストに突入した。警察の指揮権を握る県知事の地方政府と中央政府との対立といった状況を呈したが、サンタクルスなど東部でも先住民団体や社会運動が「東部ブロック」を結成し、過半数採決と農地改革の推進を求め、道路封鎖をもって国際見本市開催を前にしたサンタクルスを包囲するに至った。

大統領が「コンセンサスによる民主主義」や、県の自立に対し国家の統一を訴え、開発計画でも「異文化間の新しい社会契約」を結ぶ手段として議会を位置づけ(p. 19)、新たな制度は「インディヘナのヘゲモニーにとって代わるものではない」(p. 14)と明示している。だが急進派は、「オリガルキー」と呼ぶ保守勢力との妥協や社会契約を求めてはないことを示す形となった。議会選挙で過半数を得た社会運動にとって、議会でその力を発揮できないことは耐え難いであろうが、46%の非 MAS 系を含む大多数にも支持された新たな制度の構築は、早々困難な状況に立ち至った。

4. 改革の展望

以上みたように改革は緒に就いたばかりで、イデオロギーと現実の間には乖離があり、対立を深め

る不透明な状態が続いている。

考慮すべきは、第1にモラレス政権が様々な社会運動を基盤とする政権だという点である。MASは階層的に組織された通常の政党ではなく、水平的で各々が自律度の高い社会運動のネットワークに立脚した組織体であり、「高地からの指令」が届きにくい特徴を持つ[5]。大統領、副大統領、旧共産党系などに代表される運動内の意思統一が困難という要素も加わる。各省庁が社会運動の影響下にあることは、石油公社の再強化など政府部門の拡大による非効率の再現や腐敗の増幅を含め、政府全体のガバナンスを損なう可能性が高い。多様な社会的要求をどう抑え有効な統治構造を実現するかだが、支持基盤が多様で、ときに対立する利害が錯綜するだけに合意形成はきわめて困難である。

第2に、改革への期待と実績のギャップが生む危険性である。現実のマクロ経済運営から予想される着地点は、中期的にも「植民地主義や新自由主義の解体」とはならず、支持勢力からの批判が早晩強くなることは避けられない。とくに憲法制定議会は500年の支配で構造化された排除と差別を解消する万能薬ではない。人々は文化的、共同体的な諸制度の導入だけでなく、生活の改善を新憲法に求めている。仮に理想的制度が構築なされたとしても、それは排除された人々に即座に効力ある市民権を付与することにはならない。

議会や地方政府の反対で改革が実現できなければ、社会運動の動員をテコに政策を進めることになろうが、それは国内対立を深め民主制度を損なう可能性を孕んでいる。国有地を対象とした東部の農地改革も早晩、非合法的、非生産的な私有地まで広げざるを得ない。逆に譲歩すれば、自らの政府がようやく誕生したとする社会運動は政権を許さず、農地占拠や街頭に戦いの場を移すだろう。すでにその傾向は現れている。運動体としての社会運動と統治主体としての社会運動の矛盾、標榜する審議民主主義(deliberative democracy)の手段と、「国の再興」というゼロから新体制を構築しようとする目的との間に横たわる本源的な矛盾、対立がある。(9月25日記)

参考文献

遅野井茂雄 2004.
「ボリビア・モデルの破綻」国際協力機構『ボリビア　国別援助研究会報告書』
国際協力総合研修所、61－72ページ。

ファーブル、アンリ(染田秀藤訳)2002.
『インディヘニスモーラテンアメリカ先住民擁護運動の歴史－』白水社

タロー、シドニー(大畑裕嗣監訳)2006
『社会運動の力―集合行為の比較社会学』彩流社

ECLAC, 2005.
Social Panorama of Latin America, Santiago.

García Linera, Álvaro.2005.

"Democracia, conflict y movimientos sociales," Carlos Vacaflores (comp.) *Conflict y colaboración en el manejo de recursos naturales,* Tarija, JAINA.,pp.31-38.

García O., A, Fernando García y Luis Quitón H.2003

La "Guerra de Agua": Abril de 2000: la crisis de la política en Bolivia, La Paz, PIEB.

ICG (International Crisis Group). 2006.

"Bolivia's Rocky Road to Reforms," *Latin American Report* No.18－3 July.

Lora, Miguel. 2006.

"La asamblea constituyente no irá más allá de la reforma," *el juguete rabioso,* Año 5, No.149, marzo 19 de 2006, pp.8-9.

Mamani, Pablo. 2005.

Microgobiernos barriales, El Alto, CADES.

MPD (Ministerio de Planificacion de Desarrollo), 2006.

Plan Nacional de Desarrollo: Bolivia digna, soberana, productiva y democrática para vivir bien, 16 de junio, La Paz. (http://www.planificacion.gov.com/)

Parelman F., Juan. 2004.

Las mil mesetas de la Guerra del Gas, La Paz, Ediciones Combate.

PNUD. 2005. *La economía más allá del gas, Informe temático sobre Desarrollo Humano,* Segunda Edición, octubre, La Paz

Van Cott, Donna Lee. 2005.

From Movements to Parties in Latin America: The Evolution of Ethnic Parties, Cambridge University Press.

World Bank, 2006.

Bolivia: Toward a New Social Contract, A Country Social Analysis, Vol.1.2, Latin America and the Caribbean Region, July.

Yashar, Deborah J.2005.

Contesting Citizenship in Latin America: The Rise of Indigenous Movements and the Postliberal Challenge, N.Y., Cambridge University Press.

新聞はLa Razónの電子版を利用した。(http://www.la-razon.com/)

---

[1] 例えば、ファーブル(2002) ;Yashar (2005);Van Cott (2005);タロー(2006)など。

[2] 最富裕層 20%と最貧層20%の国民所得に占めるシェアーの比率は、1989 年の 21 から 2002 年には44に拡大した(ECLAC 2005:338)。

[3] 副題には「良き生活をするため、尊厳と主権をもち生産的で民主的なボリビア」(*Bolivia digna, soberana, productive y democrática para vivir bien*)と謳われている。

天然ガスを超えた、多様な社会生産組織に基づく幅の広い新しい開発のあり方を検討した報告書として PNUD(2005).

[4] 世界銀行はじめドナーもそうした方向で支援を固めている(World Bank 2006)。

[5] 抗議活動が「水平的でリゾーム(根茎)構造」をもつ点については、Palelman(2004).

*『ラテンアメリカ・レポート』 2006 vol.23 no.2 (2006 年 11 月) 36-44 頁

4. 社会運動から学ぶ公共政策
ーブラジルの「土地なし農村労働者運動」(MST)[1] の事例[2] ー＊

筑波大学大学院　人文社会科学研究科　現代文化・公共政策専攻　教授
近藤エジソン謙二

1. 序論

新自由主義あるいはグローバリズムは画一的な成長追求のために多様な社会経済を破壊するだけでなく、自然破壊を推し進め、長期的な視点からすれば機会の不平等化を生んでいる。新自由主義の産業モデルは才能があり教育の機会に恵まれた者にはより多くのチャンスを与えるが、しかし、そうではない者にはほとんどチャンスを与えない、という陰の側面も持っている。有形・無形の財産を持つ者に他の人々の運命を左右する権力が与えられる一方で、財産を持たない人々は、権力を持つ人々によって決められた不利な条件の下で生活せざるを得ない。一方、産業化と経済成長のあくなき追求による自然環境破壊は自然の恵みに生存を依存していた辺境の人々の生活基盤をも破壊し、否応なく画一的なグローバル経済に巻き込むという意味において二重の社会圧迫を与えている。こうした現代産業モデルへの警鐘として、政府による規制強化と企業にその社会的責任を求める声が高まっている。政府は本来、能力主義的社会がもたらす不公正な結果を減らすため、労働、医療、教育などの分野において市民を搾取から守る義務がある。しかし、実は、経済的資源を支配する人々自身が政府により大きな影響力を行使する立場にあり、結果として法律を形成する権力を有するという矛盾が存在している。

---

[1] Movimento dos Trabalhadores Rurais Sem Terra。

[2] 本研究ノートはすでに出版されている英論文(Kondo, E.K. (2006)「Learning from the Movement of Landless Rural Workers: Strategies to Build a Better World」住田育法、田所清克、萩原八郎、山崎圭一編『現代ブラジルにおける都市問題と政治の役割―論集』京都外国語大学国際言語平和研究所、185-210)の翻訳を基に作成されたものであるが、本研究ノートでは公共政策の視点を重視して、上記の英語版から若干内容は異なっている。翻訳を主として用意してくれた丹波博紀氏と、一部協力してくれた廣岡太郎氏に深く感謝を述べたい。日本語文の大幅な修正していただいた西俣先子氏に多大な感謝を述べたい。また、論文の構成と論点についての重要かつ有意義な議論を持っていただいた西牧宏氏にも感謝をこの場を借りて述べたい。この研究は、筑波大学による研究プロジェクトである「千年持続学の確立：心性の持続性」と「比較市民社会・国家・文化特別プロジェクト」の一環として行われ、筑波大学地域研究研究科と三功グループの支援も受けた。私達は、シーロ・コヘアと、現地調査にかけ替えのない程に支援してくれた土地なし農村労働者運動（MST）の他の成員のおかげでこの研究を進めることが出来た。この論文に使用された資料は、2003年9月になされたシーロ・コヘアの日本滞在に伴う彼との対話や、2004年3月の筆者によるブラジルのMST野営地や居住地での現地滞在、更には2004年10月と2005年1月に行われた同運動代表者達との対話を通じて集められたものだ。MST野営地や居住地での現地滞在期間中、著者は環境資源コンサルタント、土居伸光氏と、当時、筑波大学大学院の学生だったマリア・マジェーラ・リオ君、そして、同じく当時、東京大学大学院の学生だった秋本佳祐君と行動を共にした。

政府の機能不全に対抗するべくこの何十年間、市民社会組織が重要な役割を演じるようになった。こうした市民社会組織は、環境的不公正や貧困にあえぐ人々、子ども、女性、障害者、少数民族など、社会的に不利な立場にある人々の条件を改善するための規制強化を政府に求めている。ブラジルの私有地の同時占拠と生存権をかけた戦いを端緒とする「土地なし農村労働者運動」（以下 MST と称す）は、公民権を剥奪された人々が主体となって自らの未来を模索し、貧しいものもよりよい将来の可能性が開かれるような法的環境を整備し、更には共同体による公共財の提供を行う「第三の道」の具体的な方向性を示唆するものである。また、競争による淘汰、拡大を基本思想としないその運営方法は、環境と経済の共生の可能性をも示している。

2. 新たな公共政策へ向けて―「土地なし農村労働者運動」(MST) の貢献―

公共政策の新の姿は能力や富を問わず誰もが威厳のある生活が出来る環境を整えることだと言えるだろう。そのような公共政策を検証する前に復習しておきたいコンセプトが公共財である。経済的な視点から、公共財（Public goods）とは、「いったん生産されたものは、誰もがその取得を妨げられることなく、その恩恵を受けることが出来る」(Nicholson 1985:709)ものを指す。ある共同体において、より多くの公共財（定義上、無償で消費出来る）を手に入れることが出来るということは、その共同体の最も貧しい人々にとって好ましいことである。なぜならば、公共財が豊富にあれば所得に関係なく誰もが公共財の恩恵を受けることが出来るからである。例えば、美しい水の流れる川などは、近隣住民がコストを負担することなく魚を釣って食べることが出来る。このように、生態系に恵まれている者は、さらに綺麗な空気、水、安定した自然のサイクルによって経済的資本が無くても生きていけるのである。その他にも、公共輸送ルート（誰でもアクセスできる道路や水路）、公衆衛生（病気や伝染病を予防するシステムの存在）、蓄積されてきた知識や知恵（現在有るすべての科学的、伝統的知識）、安全（共同体の安全確保と物理的脅威からの自由）などが掲げられる。

公共財に対し、私的財とは、市場に売られているもので、金を払って買うもののことを言い、誰かがその商品を買うと他の人はそれを消費することが出来なくなるという特徴がある。それゆえ、資産を持っている者、また資産を得るさまざまな必要条件（教育、健康、家庭環境、技術、ネットワークなど）を満たしている者は、社会で幅広く商品を消費したり、生産に必要な土地や、建物や、機械を取得することができる。

パットナムなどが提唱した社会的資本（social capital）のコンセプトは、人と人をつなぐ接着剤のようなもので、いわば、私有財産の活用を円滑に進めるための無形の財産である。社会的資本があるところでは、生産性が高まり、コストも削減できるといわれている。例えば、社会的資本の少ないところでは、信頼関係が薄く、ビジネスにおいて、弁護士を雇い、確実な契約を結ばないと仕事が安心して出来ない。[3] 当初の社会的資本というコンセプトは、経済の発展段階を説明するのに使われた。発

[3] 詳細はClaridge 2004を参照。パットナムのイタリアでの研究成果はPutnam 1993を参照。

展途上国ではこうした社会的資本の欠如を補完する方策として特に連帯経済（solidarity economy）と言う考えが、2000年開催の世界社会フォーラム以降注目されている。MSTはなかでも先端を行く代表的な例である。MSTも生産活動の効率性をもちろん求めるが、それは競争に勝って得られるものとは別に、人を優先的に考え、協力から生まれる効率性の追求である。さらに、企業や行政のハイエラルキーに基づいた運営体制などを根本から考え直し、公共政策の領域である、教育、環境、ジェンダー、人権などの問題も統合して新しい取り組みを実践している。競争に勝つことで、収益性を上げる新自由主義経済の考えと異なり、個人や共同体が人間としての夢の実現、自分の持っている特徴や、才能を伸ばす過程を味わえる場を作るすなわち、「人間優先型経済」という新たな取り組みを展開している。表1は簡単に通常の市場経済の特徴とMSTの人間優先型経済の特徴の主要素を比較している。

3. 従来の経済活動とMSTが取り組んだ新たな「人間優先型経済活動」

MSTは社会運動でありながら、130万人の共同体として、通常行政のやるべき働きも行なっている。MSTは公共的な役割を果たす過程で、生き延びるためにやって来た農業というビジネスを通常の利益重視から、人間を中心におく新たなビジネスへと進化させてきた。その新たなビジネスモデルを筆者は *Sustainable Communities in Brazil and Japan: Building a Social Business Model for Sustainable Societies Part I* で「持続可能な社会のための社会貢献型ビジネス・モデル」と称している（Kondo, 2005）。

MSTの取り組んできている人間優先型経済活動は、図1に表わすように、社会的、私的双方の収益性を求めると同時に、成員が人間として活かされて満足な人生が送れる場を提供していると考えられる。すなわち、人間として生まれてきた意義を全うするのと同時に環境破壊と人間の周縁化を避けることを目的としているのである。

MST成員は生き延びるために生産活動を行なっており、このようなさまざまな社会的、かつ環境的要素を取り入れている団体は多くない。このような新しい取り組みを始める最適な社会層は、搾取される貧困層にあるように思える。彼らは経済の枠組みの中で犠牲者であるため、現在の経済は自らのために働かないことをよく知っている。地主達は冷酷な搾取の循環を維持させ、この環の中で大衆は搾取され続ける。公共政策を担う立場の人々は搾取される集団の独創力に慎重に注意を払うべきである。なぜなら、彼らの見出す手段の中には社会のより能力をもたぬ成員を内包するという決定的な必然があり、彼らの仕組みがより普遍化できれば、誰もが尊敬され、尊厳を感じることが出来、自らの才能を開花させることが出来る新たな世界を創り出すことが出来るかもしれないからだ。

MSTにおいては、図1で示されている社会的有益性と私的収益性の双方が初めから適切に機能したのではなく、初期の失敗や矛盾こそが、人間を中心に据える価値観の確立と具体的方法論の模索へと向かわせた。そして、より良き取り組みへの柔軟で継続的な模索が、彼らに人間的な組織へと着実に進ませることを促してきた。そしてその結果、組織の行動原理となる人間主義を作り上げたの

である。

以下ではMSTが如何なる形で人間優先型経済活動を構成してきたか考察してみる。

4. 土地なし農村労働者運動(MST)

MSTの土地の占拠は、一見暴力的な戦略に思われるが、実際は非常に平和的な運動であり、市場経済に参加しつつも、利益追求主義とは違った規範として機能しうるもう一つの生産形態を追求するものである。その居住地[4]では、有機農法が採用されつつあり、また働く意志のある者を搾取、疎外することのない組織を目指している。すべての構成員には識字コースに参加し、標準的技術または発展的な訓練を受け、輪番制で責任のある指導者として働く機会が与えられている。両ジェンダーの平等な参加が強く求められており、彼らの生産活動の柱となる規範は、競争よりも協力である。

4.1. 起源

MST の起源は、貧しい州から逃げ出さざるを得なかった土地なし農村労働者を取り巻く社会・経済的条件の理解無しに語れない。1950 年代からのいくつかの農民運動を端緒とし、1970 年代に起きた一連の出来事が 1984 年 1 月 21 日の創設へとつながった。

MST設立への大きな出来事は、レオネル・ブリゾーラ知事の下にあったリオ・グランデ・ド・スル州で起こった。ブリゾーラは 1962 年 1 月 13 日にサランディ不動産の 22,400 ヘクタールの土地を収用し、400 の家族へと譲渡したことで、ブラジルで始めて農地改革を行った。この出来事が同州の他地域でも土地の占拠を引き起こしたが、その後、保守派のイルド・メネゲッティが州知事に当選したため、土地なし農村労働者は強制的に退去させられることになった。その後、1964 年の軍政移管によって運動は下火となり、再び運動が盛り上がるまでに 10 年以上の歳月が要された(Carter 2003: 6-7)[5]。

ブラジルでは輸出主導型の農業生産が 1970 年代に始まった。既に綿花やコーヒー豆の生産に影響を与えていた農業の機械化が大豆生産にも及び、結果的に多くの零細農業従事者が職を失った。大規模生産者は農民を伝統的な家族経営の農地から追い出すことで経営規模の拡大を図り、追い出された農民に残されたのは二つの選択肢だった。一つは都市のスラムへ出て行くことであり、もう一つはブラジルの奥地の未開拓の土地へ行くことだった。ブラジルの国境沿いの開拓という戦略的目標に加えて、木材や鉱物、宝石資源の増産に熱心な政府は、後者を奨励した(Harnecker 2003: 27-9)。

1970 年代末には石油産業のボイコットなどが産業危機を招き、都市での失業が拡大していた。また、アマゾン地域への植民計画もインフラ不足、やせた土壌、疾病、ビジネスマンや多国籍企業によ

---

[4] ポルトガル語の assentamento は居住地を意味する。

[5] ブリゾーラについて詳細はWikipediaを参照。農地改革についてはMaestri (2000)を参照。

る土地の購入ブームなどにより、失敗の兆しを見せていた。地所から追い出され、奥地の熱帯地方での植民計画の失敗のために戻ってきた農民の多くは、どこにも行き場所がなかった(Harnecker 2003: 28-9)。

その農民のうち、リオ・グランデ・ド・スル州北部に位置するノノアイ保護地区に侵入するものが現れた。しかし、1978年5月に1200家族はその地区に生活するカイガン・インディオに追放され、再び行き場を失い、ロンダ・アルタの道沿いや近くの自治体にとどまらざるをえなかった。それに引き続き行われた政府との激しい交渉の末、118家族はリオ・グランデ・ド・スル州南部のウルグアイとの境にあるバジェッに入植することを決めた。その他の500家族はロンダ・アルタから1500キロ北にあるマト・グロッソ州に移ることになった。そして9月7日、110家族が広大な非生産的な私有地、サランディ地所に押し入ったのである。彼らは警察からの圧力にもかかわらず抵抗し、激しい交渉の末、州知事はその土地にとどまることを認めるに至った。軍政期に成し遂げられたこの勝利が示すのは、政府がアマゾン地域に人を送ることは政策上の誤りであり、農民は最低限生存可能な地域に土地を得る権利があるという認識を引き出したということだった。MSTは、この歴史的な瞬間、1984年1月21日に誕生したのである。[6]

MSTの歴史は闘争の歴史であり、適応と生存のための進化の歴史、政府から見放された人々の歴史でもある。彼らにとって政府へのチャンネルは非常に狭く、制限されたものであったため、自らの居場所を既存の合法的空間の外に求めた。彼らにとって、働き、生産し、生き残るためには無理やり彼らの要求を通すことがただ一つの方策であった。創設から20年余り、MSTは130万人を入植させ、搾取され希望が持てなかった土地なし農村労働者に生きる希望を与えた。

4.2. 居住地の例 トリンタ・デ・マイオ地区

本研究ノートではリオ・グランデ・ド・スル州に所在する幾つかの居住地の例を使いながらMSTの本質に迫ろうとしている。特に、本節ではトリンタ・デ・マイオ地区の概要を紹介し、後の章では、他の居住地の例も使いながら、MST 全体を説明していく形をとることとする。

居住地の多くは30から50の家族から構成されている。一般的にこれらの家族の間には、野営地[7]の生活からの盟約がすでに存在している。これは彼らが共通に持っていた地理的条件、文化や価値観、未来への期待などが生んだものであった。各家族に割り当てられる土地面積は、地域や土地の

---

[6] Carter (2003) は小作人運動における最初の勝利であるこの三年間の闘争について、詳細な説明を行っている。Harnecker (2003), 31-38頁も参照。

[7] 野営は初期の段階だが、その際、土地を持たぬ農民達は政府に窮状打開の圧力をかけるために、非生産的な私有地や公有地を占拠する。彼らはこの期間、困難な生活条件と警察や雇われたガンマンによる継続的な追い立ての脅威の下で、一時しのぎのプラスチック・テント暮らしをする。種々の脅威のため、野営地が一箇所に長期にわたり留まることは稀で、状況に応じて場所から場所へと移動する。野営の段階はおよそ2年から3年間続くが、5年以上の期間続く場合もある。例えば、セルジッペ州出身のMSTのある若い成員は野営を7年間行っていると述べていた。

質に応じて8ヘクタールから25ヘクタール程であった。MSTは、過去の土地を巡る闘争から、それが家族が生存していくための最低限の土地面積だと主張している。

トリンタ・デ・マイオ居住地はリオ・グランデ・ド・スル州の州都であるポルト・アレグレから50キロほどのところにあるシャルケアーダス市に位置している。土地を獲得するための戦いは19年前の1987年に開始された。彼らは次から次へと15の地所を占拠し、そのたびに臨時のキャンプを建設し、警察や土地所有者に雇われたガンマンらに追い立てられた。1989年5月には30日間にも及ぶ警察による大変厳しい包囲に苦しめられた。これらの土地占拠に参加していたレオニール氏は、2004年5月14日筆者を自宅に招いてくれた折に、今でも思い出すたびに苦しい思いをすると語った。飛行機やヘリコプターから毒物が散布され、警察や警察犬による攻撃によって、友人を失い、流産した女性もいたという。彼らの戦いのうち最も厳しかった状況を記憶にとどめるために、勝ち取った土地をトリンタ・デ・マイオ、つまり「5月の30日間」と名づけたのである。

トリンタ・デ・マイオ居住地が開かれた1990年、46家族が850ヘクタールの土地の耕作権を認められた。彼らがその土地に入植したとき、彼らの間では大規模な生産の知識や技術を持つものがいなかった。そこで彼らは、最初の30日間は「野外研究所」と呼ばれるワークショップを開催し、17のコースを開設した。コースでは、居住地での生活に必要な実用的技術に加え、彼らひとりひとりが長年夢見てきた活動も組み込まれた。裁縫やチェス、ジャーナリズム、ギターなどの講座が開設され、30日間続けられた。

彼らは土地の使用を認められていたが、土地には草木がなく、彼らの持ち物は雨をしのぐための黒いプラスチックシートだけであった。入植者らはまず彼らの家の材料とするべくユーカリの植林を始めた。プラスチックテントから抜け出して、ユーカリの木の家に移るのに一年を要した。2004年までの14年間の努力によって、現在では全ての者が簡素ながら、快適な家に住んでいる。

5. 社会運動から自立へ

5.1. 新たな出発はかつての出発より良いものに出来るか？

ここまで見てきたように、MST は特に土地をめぐる戦いの期間はもっぱら社会運動であると見ることができる。自らの土地を獲得して以降の期間は、生産、分配、生産活動を強化し、ビジネスの世界で生き残るという新たな段階を迎える。この第二の段階は以前に比べて暴力的ではないが、以前の所有者によって消耗しきった土地を回復させうる生産システムを作り上げるという、新たな挑戦であるといえよう。

多くの土地なし農村労働者は、家族で小さな土地を耕していたか、季節農業従事者であり、農業の知識や経験を有していたが、近代的なモノカルチャー農業のせいで土地を失っていた。なかには土地を耕したことのないものもいた。農業経験がなかった入植者たちのハンディは大きく、経済的状況や政策が好転しない限り、再び土地を失い貧困へ逆戻りすることが予想された。桁外れの試練に

さらされたMSTは、農業ビジネスの分野で競争に耐えうるシステムを作るだけでなく、その競争のあり方自体を問いかけ、政府の政策に影響を与える方策を探し続ける必要があった。現在も、これは大きな課題としてMSTの肩にのしかかっている。

5.2. 搾取の現実

これまでに述べた土地なし農村労働者たちの事例からわかるように、現代の世界は彼らのような人々に対して困難なものであった。次に述べるように、MST の入植者たちは、新自由主義に基づいて成立したルールの下で行動することは、搾取や社会的な不和を生じさせ、労働者にとって危険なものであると自らの経験で学んで行った。また、有害な化学物質を使用する農業生産技術は、生態系に害を与え、有益な植物や虫、鳥獣などを死に追いやると知ったからである。MSTは労働者にとって搾取的でなく、害を与えず、環境を守ることのできる別の生産方法を選択する必要があることを苦い経験を通して理解するようになるのであった。

6. 土地なし農村労働者運動(MST)から学ぶ公共政策

6.1. 不利な産業的、行政的要素との関わり

通常の起業家はある事業に取り組むとき、十分な競争力が保持できる状況がそろっていれば市場参入を図り、競争力を十分持っていないと見れば市場参入を避けると言う選択肢をもっている。他方で、土地を所有しない人々がそのような選択肢をもたなかったことは言うまでもない。彼らが受け取った土地は、彼らにとって唯一の選択肢であり、彼らはただ、その土地を最大限有効に利用するしかなかった。商業環境が整い、経済的な報奨が大きいといった最適な条件が提供される場所に投資することが可能な資本家達と異なり、土地なし農村労働者は、明らかに不利な環境の下でどうにか成功をおさめなければならなかった。

行政の無能力によって市民を守る公共政策が整わず、あるいは政府に影響力を持つ大地主達が意図的に差別的な規定を創ることによって、零細農民は不利な状況におかれる場合が少なくない。例えば、トリンタ・デ・マイオの住民のニナは、零細農民達に課された食糧品の商業化基準が障壁になっていることについて語った。商業許可を得るために、牛乳を初め、多くの生産物が加工され、産業化される必要がある。そのような規定は零細な生産者を大規模産業団体に依存させ、彼らの労働力が搾取される方向へと向かわせる。[8]

---

[8] 2004年3月14日午後6時頃にリオ・グランデ・ド・スル州シャルケアダス市で行われたトリンタ・デ・マイオ居住地でのニナ（実名イヴォネッテ・トニン）との対談。

6.2. 人を中心におく組織

組織関連では、MST は人を中心に置くという考えから、共同体意識、参加型意思決定、人材育成重視、男女平等、協力について強調する。

6. 2.1. 共同体意識

初期の数年にわたりMSTを支配していた信念は、単独で行動する個々の家族は厳しい経済環境において生き延びることはできないというものであった。大規模農業事業によって支配された環境を生き延びるために、彼らは団結し、そうした事業に対抗できるだけの規模を形成して活動しなければならないと思った。[9]

1989 年、協同作業の初期の試みがリオ・グランデ・ド・スルのバジェッ地方の居住地で見られた（図2)。しかしながら、8 から 11 家族による初期の組合や連合会は成功せず、MSTは既存の集団同士を結び合わせることによってより大きな組合集団を促進することを試みた。だが、これと言った進展が見られないため、多くの入植者達は集合的な組織を形成することは困難であると信じ込み、彼らの多くは各組合から離脱していった。打開策を探すMSTは、多くの入植者達が作物の流通に苦しむ状態を見て、今度は流通専門の「広域農業入植者組合」[10]（COOPERAL）を創設した。誰にも必要とされる特定の公益業務を提供する、この新たな組合のあり方は、幅広い層から支持されるものであった。

多くの居住地で失敗に終わった組合とはすべての活動(投資、生産、販売)を協同で行なう形態であり、現在では他の組合と差別するために「生産組合」と呼ばれている。しかし、最初の困難を乗り越え、協同作業を円滑に進める方法を見つけた生産組合は比較的成功を収めているとMSTは言っている。筆者が訪問したうちの二つの居住地では一部の成員は生産組合に属し、すべての生産作業を協同で行なっていた。一部は各家族が個人事業として農業を営んでいた。例えば、トリンタ・デ・マイオ居住地では、27 家族が「シャルケアダス入植者の牧畜農業生産組合」[11]（COPAC）に属しており、19 家族が個人事業としてやっていた。しかし、個別に作業を進める家族においても、互いに農具を貸しあったり、いくつかの活動を共にするなど、非公式なかたちで協力し合っている。結果的には、最初のピュアーな生産組合は定着しなかったものの、クレジットや、流通といった特定のニーズをターゲットした組合は全国に広まり、個人事業として営んでいる者も形にとらわれない様々な協力関係を結んで活動している。

6. 2.2. 参加型意思決定

MST は、末端にいる個人成員から全国レベルの問題を検討する全国代表委員会のメンバーとの間の情報が出来るだけ迅速に流通するよう勤めている。例えば、ある問題に対して、ブラジル中の成

---

[9] 2004年3月16日の夕方、ロサ・ノバ居住地の訓練センターでのシーロ・コヘアやアルテミオ、マルコス・モンテイロ、マリノ・デ・ボルトレ、アントニオ・クルス、ファビアノ、そしてその他の者達との対話に基づく。

[10] Cooperativa Regional dos Agricultores Assentados。

[11] Cooperativa de Produção Agropecuária dos Assentados de Charqueadas。

員と全国代表委員会が同じレベルの情報を保持しながら決断するといえば、およそ 200 万人の人々が参加する大集会を開催するほかないだろう。そのような大集会は不可能なゆえ、MST は全国から各州へと、各州から各地域へと、各地域から各居住地へと、そして各居住地から各班へ頻繁に情報が往復する構造になっている。

草の根の段階としては、人々が運動に参加するか否かを討議しているその瞬間から始まる一連の過程の中で、お互い親密な関係にあるおよそ 8 から 10 家族が「班」[12] を構成する。次の段階は「野営地」か「居住地」である。野営地や居住地の人口は土地の規模に応じて様々だが、典型的な人口は 100 人から 200 人程だ。次の段階は、数千からおよそ 30 万人にも及ぶ「州」の段階である。バイア州のような、より大きな州では数百人から数千人の中間的な「地域」の段階が設定されている。そして、「全国的」な段階は、既に入植しているおよそ 130 万人と、野営地の 50 万人から 100 万人の人々で構成される。各々の段階は、それぞれの成員にとって固有の特色や必要性に応じて、自らを組織するための自由が認められている。

各々の段階の議論には、まず幅広い参加を確保するため、また様々な人々と彼らの役割が正確に各々の段階に反映されるように、大勢の代表者が参加する仕組みとなっている。土地なし農村労働者運動の全国レベルの会議は、通常一年に 2～3 回開催される。300 名(2005 年までは 107 名であった)の代表者によって議論が行なわれるが、それに至るまでに、州、地域、居住地各レベルで同じ議題が事前に議論されて、それを基に決断はなされている。MST の意思決定のひとつの特徴は、全国レベルの委員会は、州や居住地などの委員会に対して権力を持っているわけではなく、ただ広範囲な調整役を果たす機能を持っているということだ。意思決定方法は、調整役を果たす中心グループから(全国レベルであれ、どのレベルであれ)、末端にいる各成員までが効果的に参加でき、情報を有効に流通させる仕組みになっている。

6. 2.3. 人材育成重視

MST は出来るだけ土地なし農村労働者が人間的、また技術的、知識的に向上できるために自ら設置したトレーニングセンターや、大学や NGO などと共同で設置したコースなどで、
読み書き教育から、高等教育、大学教育までの教育を幅広く提供している。日常の活動でも、交渉力や経営力を身につけられるように、あらゆる段階のポジションを経験できるように配慮がなされている。

例えば、政府高官と何かの問題で交渉に行くとき、「代表者一人と会談する」と言われても、常に大勢で行くことにしている。そのような方針にはいろいろな理由があるが、一つの実質的な目的はより多くのものに政府高官との交渉の場を経験させるということである。

居住区に設置されている組合などの役員も能力があるなし問わず、なるべく一年の任期が終わり次第、他の人に機会を提供するという習慣がある。地域によって差はあるが、トリンタ・デ・マイオ居住地内の COPAC では役員は一年間の任期を務める。その反面、COOPERAL というバジェッ地方近

[12] ポルトガル語ではNúcleos de baseと称する。

郊(複数の居住地をまとめる地域)の組合では、役員は二年間の任期を勤める。もちろん、状況が必要とすれば、複数回にわたって役員に任命されるものもいる。

6. 2.4. 男女平等

MSTでは女性の小作人の運動への平等な参加は積極的に且つ細心の心配りをもって推進される。MSTの理解では、運動内の全ての活動と役割に女性が参加することを促進するだけでは、保守的で男性支配的な農村部の環境に変化をもたらすに十分ではない。MSTは、男性が率先して家の清掃や子育て、調理などに取り組むことによって一歩踏み出すように促す。確かに個々の、または地域間格差があり、更なる進展の余地はあるが、運動は伝統的男女の役割分担よりもヒューマニティを重んじる環境を創り出す特筆すべき結果を成し遂げている。また、MST組織の全ての段階において、代表者の男女比率をおよそ半々で保つように多大な努力がなされる。数年前、MSTは地域行政へ働きかけ、農村部に暮らす女性達(MST成員問わず)の身分証明書を得るキャンペーンを行なった。身分証明書がないことによって、女性は政府の援助も受けることができず、あるはずの市民権は手の届かないものとなっていた。それゆえ、以前は男性への依存度も増え、家庭内でも搾取される状況が珍しくなかった。

6. 2.5. 協力

多くの組織は「協力」を価値あるものとして唱えるが、実際に組織の行動原理として内面化されているかについては疑問が残る場合が多い。MST の成員によって「協力」がどれだけ内面化されてきたかは、どのようにMSTが有機栽培の種子生産を開始したかを説明するシーロ・コヘアによる物語から察することが出来る。不慣れながら、リオ・グランデ・ド・スル州にて種子生産を行うメジャーの種子生産会社から、MST は何社かの種子会社と、地方入植者による種子生産の契約について交渉をもった。一年後、数人の入植者は他の者達よりもっと生産性が良く、種子会社は最も成功している何軒かとのみ契約の更新をすることに決めた。MST はこのとても合理的な「経済の」基準に合意しなかった。シーロに従えば、「最も成功していない種子生産者こそ、最も助けを必要としているのだから、どうして彼らを見捨てられるのか？」ということになる。結果として MST は競争よりも協力の概念に基づいた種子生産事業を自前で開始することを決めた。

6.3. 人を中心におく技術選択

大多数の居住地は有機栽培による生産を試みるための対策を用意している。リオ・グランデ・ド・スルのラゴア・ド・ジュンコ居住地内の「タペス入植者の牧畜農業生産組合」(COPAT)[13]の役員の一人である、タルシジオが次のように説明した。「もし私達が資本集約的な単一栽培で用いられる技術を

[13] Cooperativa de Produção Agropecuária dos Assentados de Tapes。

もって土地を利用するならば、私達は土地なしに戻ることになるだろう」。[14] 同様の説明は、トリンタ・デ・マイオ居住地内のCOPAC の役員の一人であるペドロ・ヴァチエーによってなされた。ペドロが説明するには、COPACは初めに大土地所有者を真似て、化学肥料の利用に依存する資本集約的な農業形態を採用していた。だが、何年か後に、そのような生産手段はただ労働者を排除し、労働者を周縁化するだけではなく、流通の最終段階にいる消費者と同様に農場労働者も毒する危険にさらすことを、彼らは発見した。今日、生産はもっぱら有機農法で行われている。[15]

COPACの主要生産物は米と、牛乳、牛肉、豚肉、鶏肉、卵、野菜だ。ペドロ・ヴァチエーは、COPACの組合員は彼らがこれまで見てきた大土地所有者のように豊かになりたいと、どれほど思っていたか説明する。大土地所有者の生産方式に張り合おうとして、彼らは化学肥料や除草剤、殺虫剤の利用によって成し遂げられる集約的農業を行う技術を採用した。しかしながら、5年後、彼らは土壌の肥沃さが減少していくために、産出量は横ばいであるのに対して、化学肥料の利用は増加し、生産費用はますます増加していることに気がついた。これに付け加え、大規模単一栽培を行うことで、土壌は固められ、塩分濃度が増していった。農法の再評価と打開策の議論を重ね、入植者達は主に野菜生産を目標とする、有機農法と伝統的な技術に基づいた、より地球環境に優しい技術を採用することに決めた。今日、天然の防虫剤が野菜農園に利用され、化学殺虫剤はどうしても必要な場合に限り利用される。彼らは土壌管理のために、輪作の一部として緑肥作物を栽培しており、堆肥化作用、微生物肥料としてミミズを利用した高品質の腐葉土の生産を行っている。移行の初期の段階では、米の産出高は年間1200トンから300トンに著しく低下したが、こうした農法を学習するにつれ、費用の削減や生産物の品質改善、居住地における食糧の安全性の増加といった利点を伴いながら、年間500トンあたりまで増産することが可能となった。[16] 初期では米の生産に大きく依存していたが、新しい有機農法に伴い、多数の作物も作り、自給自足できる基盤も築いた。米の生産コストが減少するだけでなく、農薬を使わない高品質な米はCOPACが経営するスーパーでも好まれ、より良い値段で販売できるようになった。

今日のCOPACの生産物の大部分は有機農法により産出されているが、認定書はまだ下りていない。2003 年には米の生産は私営企業によって認定書を交付された。しかし、2004 年には、この会社が生産された全ての米を買い取りたいと言う申し出に、COPACが拒絶したことによって、この会社は認定書の交付を発行しないことを決めた。現在、州政府に認定書を申請中である。[17]

彼らの酪農生産（合計 300 頭いる畜牛のうち 70 頭が現在、牛乳生産を行っている）において、彼

---

[14] 2004年3月15日午後7時頃リオ・グランデ・ド・スル州タペス市で行われたラゴア・ド・ジュンコ居住地でのタルシジオ・ステインとの対談。

[15] 2004年3月15日午前にリオ・グランデ・ド・スル州シャルケアダス市で行われたトリンタ・デ・マイオ居住地でのペドロ・ヴァチエーとの対談。

[16] 2004年3月14日午後6時頃にリオ・グランデ・ド・スル州シャルケアダス市で行われたトリンタ・デ・マイオ居住地でのレオシィール・カザロットとの対談。

[17] Ibid. 初めからMSTが州政府の認定を依頼しなかったことには彼らなりの理由があると言われたが、明らかにはされなかった。

らは、ヴォアザンが考案した低投資かつ合理的に畜牛に生草を食ませるための運営方法を採用している（Krieger 1994）。[18] ヴォアザンの方法の考え方は、植物や動物は相互補完的であるということだ。小規模の遊牧地への畜牛の出入りを上手く取り扱うことによって、常に遊牧地は良好の状態にあり、また動物は青々とした牧草を食べることが出来る。

養豚場や養鶏場もまた同様の原理に従っており、そうした動物は寿命の非常に多くの時間を（拘束とは反対に）開かれた牧草地で過ごす。結果として、大規模な会社で生産されるものと異なり、居住地での生産は様々なホルモン添加薬を使用しておらず、彼らの飼育する豚や鶏は市場において高い支持を受けている。

COPACでなされた技術選択は、環境の改善につながり（土壌回復において自然環境の循環を尊重して、化学製品の利用を避ける）、産出への人間の貢献（資本集約的よりむしろ、労働集約的）を高めている。また人々が参加する中で統一見解を編み出していく一連の過程に伴う共愉（コンヴィヴィアリティ）[19] を得ていることがみてとれる。加えて、非常に多品目な野菜の生産を選択したことは、彼ら自身の充足度を高めて、共同体の成員全体が様々な領域で多様な技術を学ぶための機会を提供している。

適切な技術選択の問題は、MST が組織として闘うための選択の一つであるが、現在の技術選択は近隣の地元住民や消費者に利益をもたらしている。トリンタ・デ・マイオの歴史は、土地を持たぬ人々もまた、最初はすぐに裕福になれるという不正確な期待に惹かれ、資本集約的な技術に真正面から飛び込んでいってしまうことを示している。しかし、彼らの取り組みは必然的に迂回路を含むものだ。この取り組みは、彼らを資本集約的な技術選択の限界をより深く理解することを可能にさせた。時と共に彼らはそのような技術選択の弱点を発見して、有機農法への移行を決意する。

6.4. 社会の価値観と、顧客の社会意識と、地域市場と向き合う姿勢

通常の会社が行う顧客に対する考慮は、ある製品を消費者にとって最も高い価値のある物にするために、どのように自社製品を市場に提供するかを模索することを意味する。このような企業による製

---

[18] この方法はパリの獣医学研究所の教員、アンドレ・ヴォアザンによって開発させられ、最初にニュージーランドに知られるようになった。

[19] コンヴィヴィアリティに関してはIllich & Burremansの“The Tools For Conviviality” を参照。“The Tools For Conviviality”の邦訳書では“convivial”を、「自立共生的」と訳しているが、この訳語には“convivial”のもつ「(食事などを)共に愉(たの)しく」といった語意は反映されていない。“Convivial”の他の訳語としては、「自律共働的」といった言葉もある。古瀬幸広と廣瀬克哉の岩波新書『インターネットが変える世界』(1996年)では“convivial”を、組織やシステムに操作されていない状態、つまり人間が道具として操作されない、「共に愉(たの)しい」状態であるとして、「共愉(きょうゆ)的」と翻訳している。本文ではこの訳を採用して「共愉」を用いた。

品のポジショニングは、ある製品を入手することで得られる個人的な満足や、肯定的な特性を製品に付与することで、製品に訴求力をもたすことを意味する。例えばそうした印象の一例としては、クールや官能的な印象、または環境や社会に対する意識の高さを喚起するものが挙げられる。

しかし、企業によって追及される顧客に対するポジショニングは全体的に顧客の利己的欲望に焦点を合わせており、またその製品が環境や社会全体にいかなる影響をもたらすかという、究極的な利害は度外視される。多くの場合、企業の宣伝広告には真実でないものが含まれる。例えば、車の宣伝は、もし現実世界であるならば滅多に拝めそうもない程に美しい自然に囲まれた、驚くべきことに他に車の全くない道路を舞台にして製作される。空気清浄機や洗剤、衣類は多くの人々が夢見るような驚くべき特性をもつものとして描かれるが、しかし、実際には現実から程遠い。ガソリンの燃焼に伴う煙の排出や、鉱物採取の結果としての醜い風景、石油流出による生態系の破壊、衣類や他の消費財を染めるために利用される化学製品による汚染など、そうした消費に伴う結果は決して企業による宣伝には正確に表現されない。選択的に、ただ肯定的な製品の効果のみが提示される。

社会責任を本当に自覚した企業は、彼らの製品が労働者や関連のある一般大衆、または環境にいかなる影響があるかを公表するだけでなく、一般大衆や環境が益するため努力も行うはずである。多くの場合、消費者自身は製品の多くがもたらす結果についての自覚がない。ならば社会的責任の自覚がある企業は製品のもつ肯定的、否定的双方の影響に関して消費者を教育するように努めるべきだろう。

例えばMSTは、企業の社会的に無責任な態度に対する住民の自覚を高めるために、「遺伝子組み換え作物(GMO)[20]標識を付ける」日を計画したり、事の深刻さについて活発に問題提起している。誤った情報が瞬く間に広域に伝わる今日の世の中において、MSTは、GMO同様に、化学製品を集約的に利用する農作物生産方法の危険性を消費者に明らかにする活動も活発に行っている。また、MSTは有機栽培農園で作物を生産し、また自然や作業者、または地域共同体に危害を加えない技術を利用することで、彼らの行動と言説が首尾一貫したものになるように最大限の努力をしている。しかしながら、ニナによれば、MSTの努力にも関わらず、リオ・グランデ・ド・スルで生産される大豆の 80 パーセントがGMOであるか、GMOによって「汚染された」ものであるという。大豆オイルのような大豆に由来する多くの製品もまた、GMOによって汚染されている[21]。

多くの作物に見られる GMO「汚染」の問題は、MST 居住地だけでは何も出来ない大いなる挑戦だと言える。例えば、COPAC は、有機農法によって居住地で生産された、より安全な野菜や家禽、肉を提供することに主眼を置いたスーパーマーケットを開いた。残念なことに、GMO 内容を明記する義

---

[20]「遺伝子組み換え作物」はGMOとも知られており、英語のGenetically Modified Organism の頭字語である。GMOはアレルギー反応を起こしたケースも知られており、一部の学者達(Altieri 2001, Rosset & Mittal 2001, Shiva 2001)は、消費者の安全が保障できないうえ、小作人の生活を脅かすと訴えている。日本でも「NO! GMO CAMPAIGN」などは、GMOは消費するべきではないと訴え、ホームページ(http://www.no-gmo.org/info/book.htm)で関連書物を紹介している。

[21] 2004年3月14日午後6時に行われたリオ・グランデ・ド・スル州シャルケアダス市のトリンタ・デ・マイオ居住地の指導者の一人、イヴォネテ・トニン(ニナとしてもまた知られる)との対談による。

務が法制化されていないため、加工食糧品に使用される材料の納品業者は、材料にGMOが含まれているか、GMO が含まれていないかを区別できない。人気のある加工食料品の多くが GMO によって大きく汚染されている可能性がある。COPAC は、彼らの GMO に対する闘争の一方で、自らのスーパーマーケットでGMOに汚染された食料品を販売しているかもしれないことに矛盾を感じている。しかしながら、もし政府によって厳密な GMO 内容の明記が行われないのならば、MST の成員はこうした矛盾を取り除く手段を得られない。

6.5. MSTの社会的、かつ私的な収益性

草の根でしっかりされた議論による意思決定の過程と、土地なし農村労働者に対する極めて厳しい数々の社会環境が、MST に団結力の強い組織構造を発展させる成因となったことは推測し難くない。同時に彼らの技術選択は、「人間」を生産過程における中心的行為者としてはっきりと位置づける。MST の活動は、生存に必要な私有財の生産活動に支障を来すことなく、優先順位の高い公共利益をもたらすために必要な状況を改善し、また共同体成員の暮らしを改善する。

改善された公共利益のいくつかの例は次の通りである。

- 日陰をつくるために樹木が植えられたり、農作物が昆虫や鳥をもたらしたり、また化学肥料の代わりに堆肥を利用することで表土が回復するなどの生物的多様性の増加。
- 化学肥料や除草剤、殺虫剤の使用の削減による土壌や地下水の汚染の減少。
- MST内で責任を担う機会を通じての成員の自尊心の回復。
- 全員に開かれている講座、あるいはMST内で責務につくという形でなされる重要な学習の機会。
- 農村部に暮らす女性達が身分証明書を得ることによる男性への依存の減少と市民権の回復。
- 生産者と消費者間の相互理解による地域市場の新たな活性化。

もちろん、入植者も、自らの生活を改善するために私的な利益を必要とする。改善のいくつかの例は次の通りだ。

- 安全で、質の高い多様な作物の自給自足の達成。
- 近隣の地元住民の余剰農産物の高い需要による居住地での収入増加。

7. 現代社会に託された課題

現代の経済の仕組みを動かす論理は競争と利益に基づいている。その論理によれば、企業は、主要な「資源」を確保して、適切な「組織構造」と「技術選択」により最も高い「顧客価値」をもたらすことの出来る製品を低コストで製造販売することを目指す。この経済の仕組みは、最も優れた事業者を選び抜き、報いるが、最も劣った事業者にはほとんど何も残さないことを理解することは難しくない。多くの場合、「平均的」で「成功した」人々は、貧しい人々をあたかも「悪い性格」で、「汚く」、「伝染

病」によって犯されているかのように扱い、貧しい家庭で生まれることが、犯罪であるかのような対応をする。貧しいことは物質的に恵まれた生活をおくれないだけではなく、尊厳をもった市民として扱われないことをしばしば意味する。

この研究ノートにおいて記述してきたMSTの事例が示すことは、MSTの成員は収益見込みだけによって衝き動かされないということだ。彼らは公共の福利に対する本質的な義務感によって動かされる。彼らも人間であり、人間として彼らもまた標準的な欲望をもつため、彼らが私有財や利益に関心がないと言っているのではない。しかしながら、違いは私有財や利益というものは、それなりに満たされた生活を送る上での手段として見なされ、それ自体が目的であるとは見なされない点にある。彼らの目的は人が人に搾取されない新社会を作ることだ。その過程で最も貧乏な人も自然のもたらす公共財にアクセスできるために、環境を守り、人間の尊厳される社会環境を MST 内で築き上げ、全社会へその志が伝わっていくように務める。

この研究ノートでは、弱者自身があらゆる面で不利な状況を打開するために自ら、影響できる範囲で、公共財を守りまた広まるため、公共的な活動に打ちこんで来た社会運動の試みを考察した。MST は、自ら動くことで、弱者が必要とする真の公共政策の見本を社会に見せようとしている様にも映る。行政とビジネスがすこしでも心を打たれ、影響されることを、期待したいところである。しかし、ブラジルの主流メディアの報道を見る限り、MST は、当分現実に厳しい対立を強いられる中、創造性豊かな打開策に取り組んでいくしかないのではないだろうか。

〈参考文献〉

(1)和文

古瀬幸広 (2002)「イリイチの追悼文」『古瀬幸広の offside』85 号
(http://www.honya.co.jp/contents/offside/index.cgi?20021206, 2006 年 8 月 22 日)

〈2〉英文

Altieri, Miguel A. (2001) *Genetic Engineering in Agriculture: The Myths, Environmental Risks, and Alternatives*, Oakland: Food First Books

Carter, Miguel (2003) The Origins of Brazil's Landless Rural Workers' Movement (MST): The Natalino Episode in Rio Grande do Sul (1981-84), University of Oxford Center for Brazilian Studies Working Paper no. 43

Claridge, Tristan. (2004) *'Social Capital'* (http://www.gnudung.com/literature/evolution.html, June 27, 2006)

Doi, Nobumitsu (2005) 'Examining Sustainability in Case Studies in Japan' in Edson K. Kondo and Nobumitsu Doi (eds.) *Tsukuba University Area Studies Occasional Paper Series No. 1*: 37-65

Gardner, Gary, Erik Assadourian, and Radhika Sarin (2004) 'The State of Consumption Today' in World Watch Institute *The State of the World 2004,* Washington, D.C.: Earthscan

Harnecker, Marta (2003) *Landless People: Building a Social Movement,* Sao Paulo: Expressao Popular

Illich, Ivan (nd) *Tools for Conviviality* (http://www.eekim.com/ba/bookclub/illich/tools.html#nid03, October 9, 2006)

Kondo, Edson K. (2005) 'Sustainable Communities in Brazil and Japan: Building a Social Business Model for Sustainable Societies Part I,' *Area Studies Tsukuba No.* 25: 51-69

Krieger, Richard (1994) 'Getting the Most of Your Pasture - The Voisin Way,' *Flowerdale Alpacas Library Articles* (http://www.flowerdalealpacas.com.au/library/library10_pasture.html, October 10, 2006)

Maestri, Mario (2000) 'Brasil/Reforma Agrária - Acampamento Natalino: O MST Faz Vinte Anos,' *Cadernos do Terceiro Mundo* No. 225 (http://www2.uol.com.br/cadernos/pesquisa-public/cadernos/cadernos_225_2.htm, October 10, 2006)

Nicholson, Walter (1985) *Microeconomic Theory: Basic Principles and Extensions*, 3rd ed. Chicago: The Dryden Press

Okun, Arthur M. (1975) *Equality and Efficiency: The Big Tradeoff,* Washington, D.C.: The Brookings Institution

Putnam, Robert. D. (1993) 'The Prosperous Community,' *The American Prospect* 4(13) (http://www.prospect.org/print-friendly/print/V4/13/putnam-r.html, August 22, 2006)

Rosset, P.eter and Anuradha Mittal (2001) 'Genetic Engineering and the Privatization of Seeds.' *Dollars and Sense*, March-April. (http://www.dollarsandsense.org/archives/2001/0301mittal.html, February 11, 2005)

Shiva, Vandana. (2001) *Protect or Plunder?* London: Zed Books.

Venetoulis, Jason, Dahlia Chazan, and Christopher Gaudet (2004) *Ecological Footprint of Nations 2004,* Oakland: Redefining Progress.

Wikipedia(2006) *Leonel Brizola: A Campanha da Legalidade* (http://pt.wikipedia.org/wiki/Leonel_Brizola, February 21, 2006)

(こんどう・えじそん・けんじ)

(2006 年 9 月 6 日受理)

＊千葉大学『公共研究』第 3 巻第 3 号(2006 年 12 月) 223－247 頁。

5. Learning from the Movement of Landless Rural Workers: Strategies to Build a Better World* [i]

Edson Kenji Kondo, Professor
Doctoral Program in Modern Cultures and Public Policy
Graduate School of Humanities and Social Sciences
University of Tsukuba

Abstract

This article discusses the strategies used by the Movement of Landless Rural Workers in Brazil to survive and thrive under very unfavorable conditions. In the process, the Movement is skillfully bridging the chasm that separates social movements and business rural workers and successfully helped these workers to conquer land through an aggressive concerns. By necessity, the Movement, which started as a social movement for landless strategy of claiming unproductive land, had to quickly learn how to develop sustainable agricultural businesses in lands that were mostly barren and infertile. Faced with such adverse conditions, further compounded by unfavorable government policies that gave preferential treatment to large scale export-oriented agribusinesses, the Movement emerged as a tightly knit innovative organization that found a way to make settlements survive and succeed. Finally, the paper examines the conditions under which the model represented by the continuously evolving MST could become an alternative to the current model of profit driven neoliberal economic policies.

*Kondo, E., "Learning from the Movement of Landless Rural Workers: Strategies to Build a Better World", In Sumida, I. et al., eds.,『現代ブラジルにおける都市問題と政治の役割—論集』(The Role of Politics in the Urban Problems in Contemporary Brazil), pp. 185-210. Kyoto: Kyoto University of Foreign Studies, 2006. (English)

1. Introduction

The unbridled pursuit of industrialization and economic growth has produced a growing impact on the natural environment, destroying ecosystems, and affecting the stability of the earth's climate. Many conscientious individuals have risen to study this phenomenon from different angles, to warn about the dangers of the current industrial model, to pressure governments to pass tighter regulations and to call business to take more responsible actions.

The current industrial model, in addition to causing environmental damage, has the character of providing more opportunities to those better endowed by education or talent and fewer opportunities to those less endowed with such assets. Those who own more tangible or intangible assets are given the power to control the destinies of large numbers of people, and those with fewer or no assets have to subject themselves to the (often disadvantageous) conditions offered (or imposed) by the more powerful people. In order to reduce the undesirable consequences arising from such a purely capacity-oriented society, governments act to protect the citizens from exploitation by approving laws in areas such as labor, health, education and the like. However, those who control more economic resources also have the power to shape these laws.

In order to compensate for the malfunctions of government, civil society organizations have started to play a more prominent role in the last few decades, demanding the strengthening of regulations that can improve the conditions of the environment and of the disadvantaged segments of society such as the poor, the children, the women, the handicapped, the minorities, and the like. Although seen more as a social movement, the Movement of the Landless Rural Workers[ii] (MST), better known for their aggressive challenge for the status quo and the invasion of private lands, is actually an important part of this third way in which the disenfranchised become actors and shapers of their own future, forcing the opening of a path leading to new legal spaces where viable opportunities are made available for the poor and the dispossessed.

2. The MST

Even though the MST uses a seemingly violent strategy of invading land, it is a radically peaceful movement seeking to develop an alternative model of production that, while participating in the market, can function through a set of principles different from the pursuit of profits. For instance, MST settlements are increasingly adopting organic methods of agricultural production and searching

for an organization of work that does not exploit or marginalize anybody willing to work. Every member is given the opportunity to participate in literacy courses, receive regular, technical or advanced training, and work in positions of responsibility by constantly rotating members in leadership positions. Equal participation by both genders is insistently pursued, and the predominant principle driving their productive activities is cooperation rather than competition.

2.1. Origins

The MST owes its birth to the severe social and economic conditions that required some outlet for landless peasants to act and attempt to escape from their deprived state. The MST was preceded by several peasant movements since the 1950s, and a series of events that took place in the late 1970s led to its creation on January 21, 1984.

The major events that led to the creation of MST happened in the Rio Grande do Sul State under the term of Governor Leonel Brizola. Brizola would eventually be forced to exile, but in 1961 he staged what became known as the "campaign for legality," when the Army tried to prevent the Vice-President João Goulart, a labor rights supporter, from taking office as President, following the resignation of President Janio Quadros on August 25. Leonel Brizola became the first public official to act on agrarian reform in Brazil when, on January 13, 1962 he authorized the expropriation of the 22,400-hectare Sarandi estate and granted it to 400 families. This event sparked other occupations in Rio Grande do Sul, but they would be violently repressed when the new conservative governor, Ildo Menegheti, was elected. With the military takeover in 1964, the movement suffered a final blow and it would take more than a decade for the movement to resurface again in the late 1970s.[iii]

Brazil's agriculture started a process of export oriented agricultural production in the 1970s. The introduction of soybean increased mechanization, which was already affecting cotton and coffee production, and caused many small farmers to lose their jobs. Also, the large producers expanded by displacing peasants from traditional areas of family farming. Displaced peasants had two options: either go to urban shanty towns or go to agricultural frontiers deep in the Brazilian hinterlands. This second option was encouraged by the Brazilian government keen to exploit wood, metals and precious stones with the added strategic aim of populating Brazil's international frontiers.[iv]

In the late 1970s, the petroleum boycott and other causes led to industrial crisis and unemployment grew in the cities. At the same time, the colonization programs in the Amazon were showing the first signs of failure due to lack of infrastructure, poor soil, diseases, and a new wave of land purchases by businessmen and multinational corporations. Displaced from their small properties, and back from failed colonization programs in the tropical hinterlands, a large number of landless peasants had nowhere to go.[v]

Some of the displaced peasants in the Rio Grande do Sul State invaded the Nonoai Indian reservation located in Northern Rio Grande do Sul, near the border with Santa Catarina State. The Kaigang Indians, justifiably concerned with the situation, decided to take action and in May of 1978 expelled the 1200 peasant families. The desperate families once again had nowhere to go and camped by the roadside in Ronda Alta and nearby municipalities. Following a series of tense negotiations with the government, 118 families decided to settle in Bage, in Southern Rio Grande do Sul near the border of Argentina. Another 500 families decided to settle in Mato Grosso, a remote area about 1500 km north of Ronda Alta. On September 7th, about 110 of the remaining 500 families who did not accept the previous offers (arguing that these locations were improper for agriculture) invaded the Sarandi estate, a large allegedly unproductive private property. In spite of police pressure, they resisted eviction and after tense negotiations, the Governor finally authorized them to stay in the land. This victory obtained during the military government represented the recognition by Brazilian society that the government policy to send people to the Amazon could not be used as an excuse to buy time, and peasants had the legitimate right to claim land in areas that minimum conditions for survival. Stimulated by this historical moment, the MST came into life on January 21st, 1984.[vi]

The history of the rise of MST is a history of struggle, adaptation, and evolution for survival. It is the history of people who were largely abandoned by the state. Because the open channels with the government available in Brazilian society were either too narrow or too restricted for them to enter, they found themselves at the outside boundaries of the existing legal space, and the only way out from misery was to "forcibly" claim their fair share of opportunities to work, produce and survive. In two decades of existence, MST has settled 1.3 million people, and has dramatically changed the life prospects of otherwise hopeless, exploited, and landless peasants of Brazil.

2.2. A Typical Settlement in a Difficult Location: The Bagé Region[vii]

Between 1985 and 1988 only a small number of families were settled in this region. The area had been offered for settlement but because the perspectives of successful development in these regions were scarce, the settlers resisted accepting land in this region.

Those who ultimately came to live in this region started their fight around 1985 with the invasion of the Anoni estate, located about 550 km from this area around Bagé, in the northern part of the state. The landless moved through several estates such as the Salto estate in Palmeira das Missões in 1987. From November 1987 to March 1989, eight occupations were carried out. On March 8th, 1989 they arrived in the Santa Elmira estate, in the Cruz Alta region, about 450 km north from Bagé. At that point, the patience of the camper was running short, and they were determined to face any consequences to force agrarian reform. The participants were desperate because the grains they had

gathered from families and friends had ran out, they did not have any means of obtaining income, and were surviving thanks to the generosity of the surrounding communities. Finally, their mental strength was running thin and continuing to wait for an uncertain outcome was becoming unbearable.

Therefore, on that day the spirits were heightened at the Santa Elmira estate, and the campers were not considering stepping back from their claims. For them, either they would be attacked and hit or an area for agrarian reform needed to be produced by the government.

They were surrounded by more than 1000 policemen, with dogs, and supported by two airplanes launching teargas from the air. The police attacked shooting guns and releasing their dogs on the people. The landless who did not react were subject to humiliation and physical abuse such as placing ants on them or hitting unarmed men lying on the floor with rifles. Marino de Bortole, a member of the Roça Nova settlement,[viii] was also imprisoned for 21 days. In just three days, on March 11th, 1989, the landless were brutally forced to leave the occupation.

The violence, however, received wide media coverage and the international community was outraged with the events. The Government knew they had to do something to diffuse the situation. Coinciding with this incident, the southern region of Rio Grande do Sul was facing a drought; the land as a consequence was cheap in the region, and the many landlords wanted to leave the region. Pedro Simon, the Governor at the time, bought land that had been castigated by drought for 12 years in the Bagé region and offered them to the landless.

The offer posed a serious and difficult choice to the MST. While they had always resisted to be sent to problem areas such as this, given that the options presented were limited to these areas, and the landless were tired of the conflict, they finally decided to give it a try. As a consequence, 90 plus families settled initially, followed by 100 plus families, and in subsequent periods other settlements ensued. During 1991 and 1992, about 700 families were settled in this region.

While the settlers received the land, they remained under tents for 3 years, and no infrastructure, credit or any other support from the government ever materialized. For the government, providing land in a remote area served well to diffuse the international outcry, and limit the ability of the movement to organize themselves. Now, these families were scattered over a large area, with no infrastructure, making mobility and frequent meetings impracticable.

For several reasons, such as scarcity of drinking water, the layout of the distributed plots leaving

each house far away from the others, the long distance of several dozen kilometers to the closest consumer market, impassable roads during the rainy period, the exhausted land from the drought and careless and unproductive cattle raising, have conspired against the development of these settlements.

2.3. *A Typical Settlement in a More Favorable Location: The Trinta de Maio Settlement*

A typical settlement is comprised of about 30 to 50 families. Generally, these families already share some common bond built during the period of camping[ix] and are the result of affinities such as common geographic origin, shared cultures and values, or similar expectations on how they want to organize their future settlements.

The size of the plot each family receives varies from about 8 to 25 hectares depending on the region and the quality of the land. MST's past experience in the struggle for land has demonstrated that there is a minimum size below which a family cannot be sustained.

Among the several settlements visited in Brazil, the *Assentamento*[x] *Trinta de Maio* (hereinafter referred to as Trinta de Maio) is one of the most successful ones. The Trinta de Maio is located in the municipality of Charqueadas; about 50 km west from Porto Alegre, the capital city of the Rio Grande do Sul State.

The fight for the settlement started 18 years ago, in 1987. Brazil was still fresh out of the military government, and the Minister of the Agrarian Reform at the time was the notorious politician Jader Barbalho. The President at the time, José Sarney, had promised the settlement of one million landless families, and expectations were high.

During the initial three years, the people who came to form the Trinta de Maio were part of a group of about 700 families. Over the course of several years, they occupied 15 different areas and built temporary camps every time. Given that these occupations were done without the agreement of the property owners or local authorities, the families were expelled either by the police, by the gunmen hired by the property owners, or both. In May 1989, the area they had invaded suffered the toughest police siege lasting 30 days. According to Leonir, who generously hosted the author on the night of March 14, 2004, and had participated in these occupations, could barely recall these episodes because they caused him so much pain. The spraying of poisonous products by airplanes and helicopters, the attacks by the police and their dogs, had killed his friends or made mothers to lose their unborn babies. In memory of one of the toughest moments of their struggle for land, they named the land they finally

conquered as "Trinta de Maio Settlement."[xi]

The Trinta de Maio came to life in 1990, and 46 families were granted the opportunity to work 850 hectares of land. As they settled in the land they realized that nobody knew anything about management or had any other necessary skills for such a large undertaking. Few, if any, had had more than five years of formal education. The settlers decided then to organize what they called a field laboratory (laboratório de campo), a kind of a workshop, for the initial period of 30 days. Seventeen courses were carried out during these days. The courses dealt with practical skills necessary for life in the settlement but also included activities related to the dreams that individual settlers had nurtured over the years. As a result, dream-related courses such as sewing, chess, journalism, management, and guitar were also carried out, and at the end of the 30-day-period, the Farming and Cattle Raising Cooperative of Settlers of Charqueadas (COPAC)[xii] was founded.

Although they had received permission to use the land, the land was bare and their possessions were limited to little more than the black plastic sheet brought from the camp for shelter. Since no trees were available, the settlers began by planting a number of eucalyptus trees to be used later as raw material for building their houses. It took them about a year to leave their black plastic sheet tents and move into their barebones house made from the eucalyptus trees. Over the 14 years up until 2004, their continuous efforts have resulted in clean and comfortable houses to everyone in the settlement.

3. From Social Movement to Business

3.1. Can the New Start be better than Past Starts?

As we have seen in the previous paragraphs, particularly during the period of struggle for land, the MST can be seen mostly as a social movement. However, when they finally obtain their piece of land, they enter a new phase in which they have to survive in the business world, producing, distributing and consolidating their productive activities. This second phase, though much less violent than the period spent fighting for the land, represents the real challenge faced by the MST as they have to build a productive system that does not exploit their own people and can recover the soil that had often been exhausted by the previous owner.

Many of the landless people had been family farmers with small pieces of land or seasonal farm

workers who had knowledge and experience in working the land. Others, however, had never worked the land. Even for those experienced small farmers who knew how to till, plant and harvest, economic pressures exerted by the modern monoculture agriculture had caused them to lose their land in a not so remote past. For the new settlers who did not have experience in agriculture the odds would be even more unfavorable, and unless the economic environment and policies changed significantly in favor, the most likely outcome would be the same loss of land and return to poverty. In order to cope with such enormous challenges the MST would need to find ways to affect the government policies as well as the competitive structure in the agricultural business sector. And, if as expected, such changes did not come quickly, what could the MST do to still ensure survival of the settlers?

In the following lines, this paper will examine the strategy evolved by MST to allow the former landless to survive and succeed in a very unfavorable environment. In examining this crucial phase, we will use the framework called the *social business model for sustainable societies* (SBMSS), developed by the author in an earlier paper, and explained in more detail later.[xiii]

3.2. The Reality of Exploitation

As seen from the landless workers, the reality of the current world has not been generous to them. As we will see below, the MST settlers quickly realized that acting according to the rules established by the neoliberal economic system was exploitative, divisive, and physically dangerous to workers as they stirred competition, stimulated the use of labor substituting capital intensive technologies, and fostered the use of toxic chemicals. Further, the production technology was harmful to the ecosystems and killed beneficial plants, insects, birds, and animals. The MST realized that they have to promote a different way of production which would not exploit or harm people and protect the environment.

3.3. The Odds against Success

As described earlier in this paper, the MST is an organization that came to life as the result of the struggles of one of the weakest and most fragile segments of Brazilian society fighting for survival in an unfavorable environment. The fact that some settlements have been able to consolidate productive facilities as business units is in itself a remarkable achievement. As we will see in the following lines, these successes were achieved without violence, without driving other businesses out of the market, by including other producers, by choosing cooperation over competition, by valuing human beings, and by protecting the environment. From the perspective of a businessman, these attitudes are all laudable

attitudes, but they imply much higher costs of doing business. If trying to compete in normal terms was already difficult, how could MST compete by incurring higher costs? Furthermore, the policy and economic environment surrounding small producers were already unfavorable as the export oriented government policies favored large agricultural businesses.

3.4. How MST Has Evolved

The fact that MST could not easily change the external world seems to have stimulated the Movement to derive unique processes of communication and coordination and have consolidated it into a constantly evolving robust internal structure that can effectively adjust to the inhospitable external environment.

MST's internal organization ensures that people are at the center of the organization, and some of its features are:

a. Participation is not only encouraged but persistently pursued.
b. Serious effort made to achieve equal participation of men and women.
c. The decision making process is a highly participatory and consultative process.
d. Maximum flow of information is encouraged.
e. Leadership opportunities are created for everyone in the organization.
f. Cooperation and solidarity have become natural features of camps and settlements.

3.5. Traditional and New Business Models

As it has been discussed above, the social business model for sustainable societies (SBMSS) (Fig. 2) distinguishes from a traditional business model (BM) (Fig. 1) in that it does not pursue only (private) profitability, but aspires for an integral social and private profitability. Social profitability can be understood as all the direct and indirect benefits that accrue to the public that are produced by the activities carried out by the organization. Social and private profitability can be achieved either by the provision of products and services, or by the way in which commercial relations or internal work relations are carried out, bringing about benefits in both the private and the public spheres[xiv].

3.5.1. The Traditional Business Model

For the firms operating under traditional BMs, larger profits are always better than smaller profits. When such firms make a profit, there is no mechanism requiring them to ensure that the public also profits (or is not harmed). Generally, the guidance from BMs is exactly the opposite, and its

components are studied only with the purpose of maximizing profits.

Figure 1: Components of a Business Model

Source: Modified from Afuah Figure 1.2, p.10.

Figure 2: Components of an SBMSS

For instance, when a BM focuses on "industry factors" (See Fig. 1) it will study how the factors affecting the nature of competition in a specific industry can be used as key advantages against the competition. For instance, in different industries suppliers and buyers have different degrees of power over a firm. Are there many suppliers in a certain industry so that the firm will not be subject to price

impositions by the suppliers? Are there many buyers so that the buyers do not have bargaining power over the firm and will force the firm to sell the products at cheap prices? Is the firm the only (or one of few) producer that can impose higher (monopolistic) prices on customers? If these conditions are not in place, the firm can still work to progressively eliminating competition through price wars or other means (and causing job losses) or by obtaining patents and preventing other firms from producing the same products. The firm may also work to create barriers against new entries, ensuring that no new competitors enter the market. This can be done by being the first mover in a market that requires large initial investments and longer periods of return. If there is a learning curve that is long and steep, being the first mover ensures that other companies will face large risks to enter the market.

In terms of "positioning," the firm operating under a traditional BM can position itself either as a low cost high volume producer, or as a exclusive producer in a certain market niche and charge premium prices. In terms of controlling "costs," the firm may at times resort to restructuring by cutting jobs, or pressuring suppliers for lower prices, or still relocating manufacturing facilities to other countries where costs are lower. In general, traditional BMs will choose a cheaper pollution control process than a more expensive and efficient one, as far as the regulatory limit can be fulfilled. At the same time, many large firms spend significant time and resources lobbying against environmental regulations, inadvertently or purposely casting a blind eye on the losses incurred by the public or special segments of society. In some extreme case, some firms will finance studies to prove that there are no scientific bases for certain regulations, or initiatives such as the Kyoto Protocol against global warming. At the same time, however, the departments of social corporate responsibility in these organizations will offer grants and have a full set of socially responsible activities to "position" themselves as a firm concerned with the environment, with decent labor conditions, and responsible attitudes toward the local community.

Explained in this way it may appear that firms operating under the traditional BM are the products of evil minds. However, while most people are good men and women, the simple rule that considers that "efficiency is good" may be contributing to produce harmful results that are not easy to see first hand, and from the individual perspective may come as a totally unexpected outcome.[xv] Although the reality is not this simple, for purposes of illustration the paper will use a simplified example. Therefore, because efficiency is good, the more efficient worker is more valuable than the less efficient worker. Because efficiency is good, the more efficient firm can produce better products at cheaper prices than the less efficient firm and gain a larger share of the market at the expense of less efficient ones. The simple and straight forward result coming out of the "efficient is good" rule is that the less efficient are excluded from the market, and the more efficient dominate and at times

monopolize the market. Independently of the existence or not of any causation linkages, the current reality shows a world with only a fraction of the population who can participate in the market (1.7 billion) as consumers of standard products available there,[xvi] while the large majority of the world's population cannot participate, and more than a billion people live in extreme poverty.

3.5.2 The New Social Business Model

The SBMSS framework, in turn, has the joint social and private profitability as the ultimate objective. It is an attempt to create a tool that can provide a general guide to organizations interested in pursuing ways to fulfill human needs while simultaneously avoiding environmental destruction and marginalization of people. By following the framework, an organization should be able to preserve nature, create opportunities for human and personal growth for its members, and foster symbiotic connections that enhance life for customers and partners.

The interesting phenomenon is that a normal firm will not easily decide to adopt an SBMSS because doing this would mean radically changing the ways the firm does business. It would possibly require that the firm change from a hierarchical structure to a more participatory one. It may require the firm to adopt technologies that are not labor saving, but rather labor intensive, so that more people can be gainfully employed. It would require the firm to produce products that are not harmful to consumers and to the environment. It would require firms to start looking at other firms as partners for cooperation rather than competitors. But such cooperation should not be confused with collusion against consumers, but true cooperation in the interest of a larger public benefit. All these "requirements" contradict the rules followed by economic actors in the market, and if a firm decides to take these steps alone, it would probably go bankrupt. As we discussed earlier in this paper, the current market system encourages actors to seek and exploit every strategic advantage available so that it can be more profitable than other firms can. Although it may strike as odd, interestingly enough, the only place in which such a novel initiative could emerge would be from the exploited masses. Since they have been or are victims of the economic system, they know that the system does not work for them. Getting the land and using it in the same exploitative way the landlords did would only continue the vicious circle of exploitation, where they would be the most likely victims. That is the main reason that society in general, and decision makers in particular should pay careful attention to the initiatives of these exploited groups because there is a significant likelihood that their methods have a crucial virtue of including the least capable members of society and therefore creating a new (another) world where everyone is respected, can feel dignified, and can have their talents blossom.

Of course, the features of a SBMSS were not all in place since the beginning, but the earlier failures or contradictions stimulated them to search for alternatives that were coherent with the values placing people at the center and the flexible and continuous search for better approaches have allowed them to steadily move towards a uniquely humane organization. The shape into which MST has evolved (and continues evolving) shows it approximating the ideal model, even though the model

itself is not supposed to be static or final. In the following lines, the paper uses the framework to analyze and understand the distinct nature of the outside world restricting MST's options, and the nature of its internal world that emerged as a way to cope and break through the barriers imposed by the external world represented by the economic system, the legal framework, and government policies.

In addition, cultural discrimination and prejudices were also shaping the thought of the middle class and dominant classes. For many, the causes of poverty and despair of millions of landless were not the unfair social and economic systems, but rather their own lack of effort (the so much touted "laziness") and the lack of capacity to use land productively. The MST, therefore, faced the gigantic challenge of making sure the peasants could succeed once land was given, lest such prejudices would be confirmed and critically wound the legitimacy of the Movement. Given the situation, the MST had no other choice than developing a viable "business model" to prove that hoarding of land by the oligarchy was one of the main causes preventing peasants and rural workers from escaping from poverty and have decent lives.

But evolving a set of behavior different from that predicted by the current and dominant neoliberal economic thinking is not a small challenge. How is it that they can continue to be part of the market system, largely functioning based on the tenets of the neoliberal thinking, and at the same time act differently? Certainly, MST's attempt to function differently from traditional economic actors is a continuous struggle alternating advances and setbacks, but persistently searching for a system that might not discriminate against the weakest members of society.

The following paragraphs will discuss each of the components that comprise the SBMSS and understand how MST acts in each of these areas.

3.5.2.1. SBMSS in MST: External Factors

When a business leader uses a business model to establish a strategy, she always has the option of pulling out or avoiding entering a market if these factors cannot be used to her advantage. The landless people, of course, did not have such a choice. The land they received was the "only" choice they had, and they simply had to make the best use of it. Differently from capitalists who can choose from investment that offers the best conditions for success such as cities or states that offer the best regulatory environment, the best fiscal incentives, and so on, the landless had to try to succeed even when the external environment was clearly unfavorable to them.

Through the 1970s, failed settlements in the Amazon region showed the hopeful peasants that those otherwise attractive huge tracts of land were not appropriate for agriculture. Even when some initial and temporary production was possible, markets were so far away that they could not take advantage of any surplus production. As a result, those who had already gone through the bitter failed experiences started demanding land in areas less remote and more appropriate to agriculture. However, whenever the government was willing to negotiate, it would first offer land in remote areas, and only

those who persisted for several years would finally obtain land in places with a decent chance for agricultural production. Therefore, while a wealthy (or even middle-class) entrepreneur looking for land to start or expand his or her business in agricultural production could choose land that fulfilled what he/she thought were the necessary conditions for success such as fertility, availability of sources of water, quality of water, average amount of rain per year, average temperature and humidity, etc., the landless would have to choose among the few poor choices, and often with the soil that had been already exhausted by intense use of chemical fertilizers, pesticides and the like.

Social movements arise because the government, due to several reasons, has failed to provide adequate opportunities to the marginalized segments, either by inaction or by "purposely" creating exclusionary rules. For instance, as an example of "industry and government factors" discriminating against them, Nina, a resident of Trinta de Maio, mentioned about the barriers that certain standards required for commercialization of food products impose on small (formerly landless or otherwise) farmers. Many products, such as milk, need to be processed and industrialized in order to obtain license for commercialization. Such rules make small producers dependent on large industrial corporations (which clearly benefit from such rules), and subject to possible exploitation of their labor.

Because the rules are produced by the powerful members of society, it is very likely that hundreds of rules need to be changed, and the MST patiently and consistently maintains the following positions vis-à-vis the current social, political, and economic environment:

a. Need to immediate implementation of agrarian reform.
b. Oppose (neoliberal) policies that places profit above human welfare and environmental health.
c. Oppose laws and policies that threaten the livelihood of rural workers.
d. Oppose laws and policies that give precedence to large landholdings, such as export incentives.

While the new settlers from MST cannot easily affect government policies and they have to remain engaged on a long-term effort of maitaining pressure on the government and keep the public informed, at the local level, there is some room for change, and MST members are active in pursuing better relations and seeking comprehension from the surrounding community.

When the landless are granted a property and arrive in a new area, they always try to build trust with the local community and farmers. For instance, when the settlement members go to the city on a march to make demands, to protest a certain situation (for instance, the lack of a road connecting the settlement with the closest city), or to take a stance against a new law or a government policy that might harm the public, they take important precautions to ensure that their actions are not misinterpreted as irresponsible acts by people seeking personal advantages. First of all, their march is

made on a single file, so that they do not block the traffic or bother the community in any way. Furthermore, they clean the road as they move to and from the city, so that their march is not only an act demanding government action but also a service provided to the community.

Another example can be seen in the case when the new settlers arrived in 1995 at the expropriated property soon to become the Lagoa do Junco settlement. Six families who had been previously working for the former landlord were already living there. The new settlers, instead of expelling them, decided to include them in the distribution of land.[xvii]

3.5.2.2. SBMSS in MST: Organizational Structure

One belief that dominated the MST in its first years was that individual families acting alone could not succeed in surviving in the harsh economic environment. In order to survive in an environment dominated by large agricultural businesses, they needed to join forces and work on a scale that could compete with those businesses.[xviii]

In 1989, initial efforts in cooperative work were carried out in the settlements of the Bagé region, where the environmental conditions were particularly harsh and made survival a big challenge. However, the initial associations and cooperatives of 8 to 11 families did not succeed, and the Movement decided to stimulate larger groups by joining the already existing ones. The lack of progress, however, made many settlers believe that the collective system was the problem and many started leaving the cooperatives. Those who left found out later that working alone was as difficult or even more difficult and wanted to join back, but by then the production cooperatives were being dismantled. The Movement seeing many settlers struggling to make ends meet, created the Regional Cooperative of the Settled Farmers[xix] (COOPERAL), where anybody within or without the movement could join in order to channel their products to the market. The only condition was that they belonged to a group of 7 or 8 families carrying out periodical discussions on issues of agricultural production in the area. Apparently, this new type of cooperative, which worked by providing a specific and targeted essential service needed by everyone, was a more successful model that gained wide acceptance.

By hindsight, MST leaders believe that the failures can be credited to excessive centralization of decisions in areas such as health and education that had to go through the cooperative, making settlers too dependent on the cooperative and incapable of thinking by themselves. Also, the excessive centralization made the cooperative structure too costly and unsustainable. Another factor that contributed to the failure of one of the cooperatives was that it was formed from associations scattered across a wide geographic area, making collective work difficult.

Still, some cooperatives of production like the Trinta de Maio and Lagoa do Junco settlements, where members found a way to work together, became quite successful. But even in these two successful cases, some families decided to work individually. For instance, in the Trinta de Maio settlement, there is a group of 27 families working collectively in the Farming and Cattle Raising

Cooperative of Settlers of Charqueadas[xx] (COPAC) and a group of 19 families working individually. The individual families, however, still cooperate in informal ways by lending each other the necessary agricultural equipments, or organizing some activities together.

As mentioned above, the individual families work individually with regards to production activities per se. The families joined under COPAC present some degree of diversification and division of labor due to the larger scale of its operations. The productive activities of COPAC are divided in five areas, namely animal production (milk production, hog farm, etc.), agriculture (rice, orange, and beans), vegetable gardens, commercialization and management, and supermarket. The supermarket is the main outlet for commercialization and it is located in the nearby city of Charqueadas.

The directors of each of these five sectors have a mandate of one year,[xxi] and while some may become directors more than once, they usually do not stay for continuous mandates to give opportunity to other members of the cooperative to learn from the experience of being a director.

In terms of organization, Brazilian law establishes that a cooperative needs to have a board of directors with at least three officers: president, treasurer, and secretary. For the MST, however, the concept of one head (president) does not exist and although they have an official list of these officers, the decisions are actually made collectively by the whole group of individuals involved with the cooperative.

Moving beyond the issue of the organization of work as a cooperative or as individual families, all settlements are organized in groups of families. The basic unit is called the "core group of families" and it is usually comprised of 8 to 10 families. Generally each core group meets once a week to discuss and share information related to the eleven priority "sectors" of MST: 1.production, cooperation and environment; 2.education; 3.health; 4.policy and politics; 5.communications; 6.culture; 7.human rights; 8.gender; 9.projects and finance; 10.international relations; and 11.support for new camps.[xxii] Generally, for each of these priority sectors, there is one person responsible for leading the discussions. Later, the same issues are then discussed in a larger forum of the entire settlement.

One of the most interesting aspects of the Movement is the degree of flexibility that is given to each settlement, and to all levels of the organizations. At the grassroots level, and in a process that starts from the moment the landless people is discussing whether or not to join the movement, families are organized in the *core group of families (núcleos de base)*, which are groups of 8 to 10 families with affinities to each other. At the next level, camps and settlements are found. The number of people in a camp or settlement varies depending on the size of the property, but typically the size is from 100 to 200 people. The next level of agglutination is the state level, which ranges from a few thousands to about three hundred thousand. Larger states, such as Bahia, have an intermediate regional level with few hundred to few thousand people. Finally, at the national level, there are about 1.3 million people

already settled, and between 500,000 to 1 million people in camps. Each level has a significant degree of freedom to organize themselves depending on their unique characteristics and needs.

The decision making is always done collectively with issues being discussed within each layer but also across layers down and back up, in a system that stubbornly tries to get as close as possible to a consensual process. The levels can be represented as "bubbles" because the higher levels just mean broader instances of coordination, and not higher levels of decision making power. These bubbles always reach down to the grassroots, implying that the higher the level in which one is acting, the larger should the effort be to reach deep down and remain connected with the grassroots. At each level there are a large number of representatives, first to ensure wide participation, and second to ensure that the diversity of the people and their functions are properly reflected at each level. The criteria for choosing these representatives and coordinators vary depending on the state, but the size is generally proportional to the size of people represented. At the settlement level, the representatives are comprised by the coordinators of the core group of families and the directors of the cooperative(s) in the settlement. At all levels there is a great effort to maintain the gender balance at close to 50-50.

Many organizations talk about cooperation, but the extent to which the concept has been internalized by its members can be seen from the narrative from Ciro Correa, who was explaining how the MST had started in the business of organic seed production. Inexperienced, but observing that most seed production companies carried out the production of seeds in the state → State of Rio Grande do Sul, MST negotiated with a few seed companies the production of seeds by local settlers under contract. After a year, some settlers proved more productive than others and the seed company decided to renew the contracts only with the most successful ones. MST did not agree with this very reasonable "economic" criterion. According to Ciro, "the less successful seed producers were the ones who needed more help, how could we abandon them?" As a result, the MST decided to start its own seed production business based on the concepts of cooperation rather than competition.

The equal participation of the peasant women in the movement is pursued with determination and great care. The Movement understands that just encouraging women to participate in all activities and roles of the movement is not enough to bring about change in the conservative and male dominated rural environment. As a result, the MST encourages man to go one step further by taking the initiative in cleaning the house, taking care of the children, cooking, and the like. While there are individual and regional differences, and there is room for further progress, the movement has achieved respectable results in creating an environment where humanity takes precedence over traditional gender roles.

3.5.2.3. SBMSS in MST: Technology

Most settlements are taking measures to move towards organic production. In the Lagoa do Junco settlement in Rio Grande do Sul, Tarcísio explained that "if we take land to imitate that [capital intensive monoculture] technological model, we will go back to being landless."[xxiii] The same sort of

explanation was given by Pedro Wathier from the Trinta de Maio settlement, also in Rio Grande do Sul, located about 150 km northwest from Lagoa do Junco. Pedro explained that their settlement had started by imitating the large landlords and using capital intensive agriculture dependent on chemical inputs. After a few years, they discovered that such methods of production not only displaced and marginalized labor but also poisoned those who worked the fields as well as the ultimate consumers. Today, the production is mostly organic.[xxiv]

The main products of the Trinta de Maio settlement are rice, milk, and vegetables. Pedro Wathier, one of the current directors of COPAC, explained how the members of Trinta de Maio had initially wanted to quickly become rich like the large landowners they have seen their entire lives. Emulating the production methods of these large landowners, they adopted a technology intensive agriculture accompanied by the use of chemicals, herbicides and pesticides.

After five years, however, they discovered that soil fertility was decreasing and they had to continuously increase the use of fertilizers, raising the production costs, while yields remained constant. In addition, they found out that with large-scale monoculture, the soil was becoming compacted and salinized. After a period of discussion and reevaluation, the settlers decided to produce mainly vegetables, and adopt a more earth-friendly technology based on organic agriculture and traditional techniques. Today, natural insect repellents are used in the vegetable gardens and chemical pesticides are used only when absolutely needed. For soil management, they have adopted green manure crops as part of crop rotations, and the production of high quality humus using earthworms as composting agents, and bio-fertilizers. In the initial stages of transition, yields decreased significantly, but with learning it slowly grew to previous levels with the advantage of reduced costs, improved quality of products, and increased food security in the settlement.

Most of COPAC's production today is organic, but certification is still a process in the working. According to Leocyr, their rice production was certified by a private company in 2003. In 2004, the company wanted to buy all the rice production and when refused by Trinta de Maio, the company decided to withhold certification. Now certification is being sought from a state organization.[xxv]

The refusal to use genetically modified organisms (GMO) or transgenic seeds is another central technological choice made by COPAC and the Trinta de Maio settlement. GMOs are the prime representatives of the large scale monoculture technology with unresolved uncertainties regarding consumer safety. Furthermore, GMOs may pose unknown threats to food security by reducing the robustness of the natural system made up of a large variety of species.

For their dairy operations (70 of a total of 300 cattle heads are currently producing milk) they use the low-input Voisin Rational Grazing Management system.[xxvi] The idea of the Voisin method is that plants and animals depend on each other. By managing the access of the cattle to small areas of pasture each time, the pastures are always in good condition and animals can feed on greener pastures. Pedro further explained that an additional advantage is that, by moving the herds daily, the cows do not spend much time with their dung, and even if they are sick with worms, the worms will not be able to complete their cycle and will die. Apparently, the same seems to happen with the cattle tick who became much less of a problem after the adoption of the Voisin method.

The hog farm and the chicken farm also follow similar principles and they stay in open fields (as opposed to confinement) for a good part of their lives. As a result, unlike the products from the big firms, the settlement's production is free of hormones, and their pork and chicken have a strong demand in the market.

Figure 3 – Convivial production.

It can be observed that the technological choices made by Trinta de Maio improve the environment (avoidance of chemicals, respecting nature's cycle to recover, etc.), enhance the human contribution to output (labor intensive, rather capital intensive), and stimulates conviviality with a participatory and consensual decision making process. (See Fig. 3). In addition, the choice of producing a large variety of vegetables enhances their self-sufficiency, and provides opportunities to all members of the community to learn a variety of skills in several fields.

The issue of appropriate technological choice is one that MST has struggled as an organization too, but the current choices unambiguously bring benefits to the neighboring communities and to the consumers. The actual path followed by Trinta de Maio illustrates that the landless also were initially

attracted by the false promises of quick riches and dived head-on into adopting capital intensive technologies. With time, however, they discovered the downside of such technological choices and decided to shift to organic farming. Their strategy involved a detour, but allowed them to reach a deeper understanding of the limitations of the capital intensive green revolution technology.

3.5.2.4 SBMSS in MST: Positioning

Positioning for firms following traditional BMs means exploring ways to best position their products in the market in order to achieve the highest customer value. This involves the creation of an image that appeals the customers as something that they need, or they want to have because of individual satisfaction that can be obtained or the positive attributes attached to the product owners. It can be an image of coolness, of sensuality or of environmental or social conscience. In summary, positioning means targeting the broadest or highest paying groups of customers that may purchase the specific product of the firm.

As one might observe, the positioning pursued by firms is entirely focused on the selfish desires of the customer, and it is not at all concerned with the ultimate benefit or harm that the product may cause to the environment, to individuals, or to the society as a whole. In many cases, the advertisements of firms could easily be labeled manipulative and untrue. Advertisements for cars, for instance, are depicted in wonderful empty roads, surrounded by beautiful nature that rarely if ever occurs in real life. Air purifiers, detergents, clothes are shown as possessing magical properties that many may dream of, but are far from reality. The collateral effects of their consumption, from the exhaust fumes from burning gasoline, the ugly landscape resulting from mineral extraction, the destruction of ecosystems from oil spills, the pollution from chemical products used for dying clothes or other consumer goods, are never fairly presented in those advertisements. Selectively, only the positive (real, possible, or suggested, but not likely) effects of the products are presented.

A truly socially responsible firm should not only disclose the true impact of their product on its workers, relevant community, and the environment, but also work to bring benefits to the community and to the environment. Often times, the consumers themselves are not aware of the consequences of several products, and a socially responsible firm should work to educate the consumers about positive and negative impacts of the product.

The MST, for instance, actively makes demonstrations, or stage activities such as "GMO labeling" day, to raise the awareness of the population with regard to socially irresponsible attitudes of

certain companies. In a world in which misinformation became so widespread, the MST does work actively to clarify the consumers of the risks represented by chemical intensive agricultural production methods, as well as GMOs, and it makes the utmost effort to make its discourse coherent with its actions by producing organic farm products and using technology that does not harm nature, the workers, or the local community. According to Nina, however, and despite the efforts of MST, eighty percent of the soybean production in Rio Grande do Sul is either GMO or is "contaminated" by GMOs. Many products derived from soybean, such as soybean oil, are also contaminated by GMOs. [xxvii]

The problem of GMO "contamination" of many products, however, is a huge challenge that MST settlements have very limited power to influence. For instance, COPAC opened a supermarket committed to providing healthier vegetables, poultry and meat produced in the settlement through organic methods. Unfortunately, due to the absence of GMO-content labeling requirement, suppliers of ingredients for industrialized food products cannot distinguish GMO contaminated from GMO free ingredients, making the possibility of many of the popular industrialized food products being tainted with GMOs very large. COPAC sees a contradiction in the fact that it fights against GMOs but it may be selling GMO tainted food products in its own supermarket. However, unless a strict labeling of GMO content is implemented by the government, MST members see no way of eliminating that contradiction.

Governmental action or lack of action is a big factor affecting the welfare of small producers like COPAC. Unlike the above case that illustrates government's lack of action, the requirement that some goods can only be commercialized if they are industrialized is another measure that significantly harms small producers without necessarily protecting the consumers. For instance, in the case of milk, which can only be sold if industrialized, COPAC cannot sell directly to retailers or consumers, but needs to sell to Nestle,[xxviii] a large multinational company, which then industrializes and retails it.

3.5.2.5. SBMSS in MST: Social and Private Profitability

It can be speculated that the particularly harsh external factors against the landless people stimulated MST to develop a cohesive organizational structure, with decisions always strongly based on the grassroots. At the same time, their technological choices allowed people to enhance their role as central actors in the production process. The activities of the MST have in most places improved the availability of key public benefits without neglecting the production of private goods necessary for survival and improved quality of life of its members.

Some examples of improved public benefits are:

1. Increase in biodiversity as trees were planted to provide shade, agricultural production brought insects and birds, and use of compost instead of chemical fertilizers recovered the topsoil.
2. Reduction in the use of chemical fertilizers, herbicides, and pesticides, reduced the contamination of soil and water tables.
3. Recovery of members' self-esteem thanks to the opportunity to play a role within MST.
4. Significant opportunities for everyone to learn either in the form of courses, or in the form of taking responsibility in any of the eleven sectors of MST.
5. Recovery of the sense of citizenship of rural women was achieved by helping them obtain identification documents and become less dependent on man.
6. New dynamism in the local market due to mutual knowledge between producers and consumers that makes local transactions more reliable.

The settlers need of course to obtain private benefits also, so that they can improve their lives and live more comfortably. Some of the improvements are:

1. Enough production for self-consumption by members of the settlement with a healthy and varied diet.
2. High demand for surplus production – which is perceived as healthy by neighboring communities – bringing higher income to the settlement.

4. Current and Future Challenges for the Contemporary Society

The logic driving the economic system is based on competition and profit. In order to be the most competitive and/or the most profitable firm, firms generally adopt business models such as the one shown in Figure 1. According to such business models, the most competitive firms are the ones that can best ensure the control of key resources, understand the main competitive factors relevant in its industry, use them to its own advantage, make technology choices and shape organizational structures that can reduce cost and ensure maximum quality, and position its products in an advantageous manner in the market so as to deliver the highest customer value (in the sense of willingness to pay for the product).

It is easy to understand that the system filters and rewards the best performers, leaving very little if any to the worst performers. In many cases, just having been born poor, having had fewer opportunities for education, and having had difficulties in finding a job seem to be a crime, because "average" or "successful" people will shun them as if they have "bad character," or are "dirty," or are afflicted by a "contagious disease." Being poor does not mean just the inability to afford the material

goods, which is already a strain, but it often represents being unable to access the rights to be respectfully treated as a citizen.

The question left to the poor and weakest is whether there is a place for those at the bottom? Why those who are weak, poor, and less talented cannot have a place to live and grow decently, without being dominated or oppressed by those who can perform better in economic activities?

The case of MST described in this paper shows that their members are not driven by short, medium or long term profit expectations. They are driven by REAL commitments with the public welfare. They are also concerned with the private good, and with profits, but only to the extent that such goods and profits enable them to have a decent and fulfilling life, a life in which they can pursue their dreams and talents as unique human beings.

In the traditional business model based on the neoliberal thought, the firm will make choices that will foster maximum profit because that is what the firm WANTS, that is what the BOARD WANTS, and that is what the department heads WANT, and so on until the last man. Many people working in private firms are under much stress because not everybody WANTS what the firm and each of its divisions believes the employees SHOULD WANT. However, as an employee, anything one wants to do must necessarily lead to the final WANT of the firm, or the maximization of the profit, if one wants to have her opinions heard.

Similarly, it can be argued that the SBMSS, which places humans at the center, will want to maximize the social welfare by contributing to the growth of public goods and private goods. The main difference with the BM, however, is that the SBMSS, even when it is dealing with the production of private goods, is driven not by the profit maximization goal, but by the opportunity to have everyone working on their own self realization, self fulfillment, and trying to be everything they can be.

This self interest should not be larger or smaller than his commitment to his peers, as human beings. This commitment is represented by the respect for public goods, goods that are available to everyone free of charge. One especially important example is the natural ecosystems and, when these ecosystems are functioning well, they purify water and air, they serve as habitats for thousands of species of animals and fish, and millions of species of plants, insects and microorganisms. Collectively, and including the topsoil, they are part of a living nature that produces food free of charge for all human beings, rich or poor.

Therefore, the SBMSS can serve as a guide to all human beings who feel stressed within firms and organizations, because the predominant drive in companies following a BM is not directed to nurturing all human beings (inside and outside the organization), but only to those who can be the winners within the system.

The age old question, however, is "can firms driven by true altruistic values survive?" Can such a firm ever exist?

Social movements, and people who the humanitarian side has spoken louder, are actually building such new kinds of "firms" even though "firm" is not the name given to such initiatives. They are called nonprofit organizations, NGOs, associations, voluntary groups, etc. These organizations are generally concerned with the rights of certain groups, or monitor the activities of firms that are damaging the environment or exploiting illegal migrants or children. Few of these public goods and rights oriented groups are involved in the production of goods and services for the market.

At the other extreme, the firms that produce goods and services are increasingly incorporating symbolic activities of "corporate social responsibility" such as the protection of the environment or addressing social needs of the local community where the company is located. Usually, however, the "social" activities of these firms are more symbolic than substantive, and they generally do not criticize any other company or organization even if they are harming the public good or they are not doing enough for the common good of the local community. Their agenda is driven less by the concern to improve the world, than to avoid criticism that may hurt their corporate image.

On the other hand, those who pursue life in a nonprofit organization or in voluntary groups to help the poor[xxx] often find themselves using strategies that are closer to BM than SBMSS, and find themselves twice frustrated.

The central research question is how people can be gainfully employed in productive activities, avoid damaging the environment, avoid exploiting other people, and find enough opportunities to develop his/her skills and talents? This is certainly a long process in construction, where the MST is one of the first models of the type of firms (or a hybrid between firms and nonprofits) that may arise and help move sustainable development closer to a real possibility.

5. Bibliography

Afuah, A. *Business Models: A Strategic Management Approach.* Boston: McGraw-Hill, 2004.

Carter, M. "The Origins of Brazil's Landless Rural Workers' Movement (MST): The Natalino Episode in Rio Grande do Sul (1981-84)." University of Oxford Center for Brazilian Studies Working Paper no. 43, 2003.

Doi, N. *Examining Sustainability in Case Studies in Japan.* Area Studies Occasional Paper Series no. 1, edited by E. K. Kondo, and N. Doi, 37-65. Tsukuba: University of Tsukuba Graduate Program in Area Studies, 2005.

Gardner, G., E. Assadourian, and R. Sarin. "The State of Consumption Today." In *The State of the World 2004,* edited by Worldwatch Institute. Washington, D.C.: Earthscan, 2004.

Harnecker, M. *Landless People: Building a Social Movement.* São Paulo: Expressao Popular, 2003.

Illich, I., and V. Burremans. *Tools for Conviviality* (originally published in 1974) [Electronic version] Retrieved April 8, 2004 from http://www.eekim.com/ba/bookclub/illich/tools.html#nid03.

Kondo, E. "Sustainable Communities in Brazil and Japan: Building a Social Business Model for Sustainable Societies Part I." *Area Studies Tsukuba* 25 (March 2005): 51—6.

Krieger, R. "Getting the Most of Your Pasture – The Voisin Way." *Llama Information Resources* (1994). Retrieved on February 10, 2005 from http://www.saltspringer.com/articles/feature2.html.

Maestri, M. "Brasil/Reforma Agrária – Acampamento Natalino: O MST Faz Vinte Anos." *Cadernos do Terceiro Mundo* 225 (Outubro/Novembro 2000). Online version retrieved on February 21, 2006 from http://www2.uol.com.br/cadernos/pesquisa-public/cadernos/cadernos_225_2.htm.

Okun, A. M. *Equality and Efficiency: The Big Tradeoff.* Washington, D.C.: The Brookings Institution, 1975.

Venetoulis, J., D. Chazan, & C. Gaudet. *Ecological Footprint of Nations 2004.* Oakland: Redefining Progress, 2004.

Wackernagel, M., and W. Rees. *Our Ecological Footprint: Reducing Human Impact on the Earth.* Philadelphia: New Society Publishers, 1996.

Wikipedia. *Leonel Brizola: A Campanha da Legalidade.* Retrieved from http://pt.wikipedia.org/wiki/Leonel_Brizola on February 21, 2006.

6. Endnotes

---

[i] This research was partially supported by the "Trans-Disciplinary Research on Mind and Spirit for Sustainability Project," the Master's Program in Area Studies, and "The State, The Civil Society, and Culture in Comparative Perspective" project, all from the University of Tsukuba, and by the Sanko Group. We are indebted to Ciro Correa and many others members of MST who provided invaluable support to our field studies. The data and photos used in this article were collected through personal communication with Ciro Correa during his visit to Japan in September 2003, during field visits to MST camps and settlements in Brazil in March 2004, and further personal communications with MST representatives in October 2004 and January 2005. During the field visits to MST camps and settlements, the author was accompanied by Mr. Nobumitsu Doi, an environmental consultant, Ms. Maria Majella Rio, at the time a master student at the University of Tsukuba, and Mr. Yoshisuke Akimoto, at the time a master student at the University of Tokyo.

[ii] Movimento dos Trabalhadores Rurais Sem Terra (MST).

[iii] See Carter, pp. 6-7, Wikipedia on Leonel Brizola, and Maestri on Agrarian Reform.

[iv] See Harnecker, pp. 27-9

[v] See Harnecker, pp. 28-9 and Carter, p. 7.

[vi] Miguel Carter gives a very detailed account of the three year sttrugle of this inaugural victory of the peasant movement. See also Harnecker, pp. 31-38.

[vii] This session is mostly based on information provided by Artemio, a long-time leader of MST in the region of Bagé, at a meeting at the training center of the Roça Nova settlement, in the evening of March 16, 2004.

[viii] The Roça Nova settlement is one of a group of 56 settlements and 1800 families living in this region near Bagé, in the southern Rio Grande do Sul. They are located in the municipalities of Candiota, Hulha Negra, and Aceguá. Personal communication with Artêmio during the morning of March 17, 2004, visiting some of these settlements.

[ix] The camping is the initial stage, when the landless invade an unproductive private property or public land to pressure the government to solve their plight. This is a period in which they stay under makeshift plastic tents, under severe conditions of survival and the constant threat of eviction from police or hired gunmen. Due to such threats, it is rare for a camp to stay long in one geographical location, moving from place to place depending on the circumstances. This camping stage usually lasts about 2 to 3 years, but there are cases in which this stage has continued for longer periods of five years or more. For instance, a young member of MST from Sergipe state mentioned that they were entering the seventh year of camping.

[x] The Portuguese word *assentamento* means settlement.

[xi] *Trinta de Maio* means "thirty days in May."

[xii] Cooperativa de Produção Agropecuária dos Assentados de Charqueadas

[xiii] See *Sustainable Communities in Brazil and Japan: Building a Social Business Model for Sustainable Societies Part I* by Kondo.

[xiv] These types of goods are called private goods and public goods in Economics. Private goods are the normal goods that are commercialized in the market, and they are obtained through the payment of a price. An example would be an ice-cream, or a bicycle, or a car. Any of these goods, once they are purchased by someone, he or she becomes the sole proprietor of the good. Public goods, on the other hand, are not normally commercialized in the market. They are usually provided by the government, or by nature. An example of the former type is a public road connecting two cities. Anybody can use the road and the fact that Mrs. A is driving her car there, does not prevent Mr. B or Mrs. C to do the same. Often goods such as

roads are funded by tax collections, and even though some individuals pay more and other pay much less, both can use the road to the full extent. Examples of the latter are the ecosystems. For instance a clean river can provide clean water, fish, entertainment, and beauty, all for free.

[xv] See a detailed discussion of the dilemma of efficiency versus equality in *Equality and Efficiency: The Big Tradeoff* by Arthur Okun.

[xvi] According to Gardner, Assadourian, and Sarin, study by Matthew Bentley classifies 1.7 billion people as members of the consumer class. These members are typically owners of TV, telephone, and internet, and enjoy life styles linked to these products.

[xvii] Interview with Tarcísio Stein, at Lagoa do Junco, in the Tapes Municipality, Rio Grande do Sul on March 15, 2004, 7 p.m.

[xviii] Personal communication with Ciro Correa, Artemio, Marcos Monteiro, Marino de Bortole, Antônio Cruz, Fabiano, and others during the meeting at the training center of the Roça Nova settlement in the evening of March 16, 2004.

[xix] Cooperativa Regional dos Agricultores Assentados.

[xx] Cooperativa de Produção Agropecuária dos Assentados de Charqueadas

[xxi] Other cooperatives, such as COOPERAL near the Bagé region, the mandate of a director has a term (or a practice) of two years.

[xxii] Called *Frente de Massa* in Portuguese.

[xxiii] Tarcísio Stein; op cited.

[xxiv] Interview with Pedro Wathier, at the Trinta de Maio settlement, Charqueadas Municipality, Rio Grande do Sul in the morning of March 15, 2004.

[xxv] Apparently MST had their reasons for not having sought state certification from the beginning, but that was not made clear at the opportunity.

[xxvi] The method was developed by Andre Voisin, a teacher at the Institute of Veterinary Medicine in Paris, and it first became popular in New Zealand. See Krieger (1994) for details.

[xxvii] Interview with Ivonete Tonin (a.k.a. Nina), one of the leaders of the Trinta de Maio settlement, Charqueadas Municipality, Rio Grande do Sul on March 14, 2004, 6 p.m.

[xxviii] According to Leocyr Cazaroto, from the Trinta de Maio settlement, milk processing and distribution in Brazil is largely controlled by two large companies, Nestle and Parmalat. Personal communication with the author on March 14, 2004, 6 p.m.

6. O Movimento dos Trabalhadores Rurais Sem Terra no Rio Grande do Sul*[1]

Edson Kenji Kondo, Professor
Doctoral Program in Modern Cultures and Public Policies
Graduate School of Humanities and Social Sciences
University of Tsukuba

要旨

本論文では、土地なし農民運動（MST）の起源、ブラジルの土地配分の問題、小作農の苦しい境遇、ブラジル社会のあらゆる立場からの支持者と反対者の混在、そしてキャンプと居住区を通じた MST の組織を紹介する。また、本論文では、MST の組織、キャンプと居住区でなされている活動のタイプ、地方の歴史や地理によって起こされた主な変化、長年にわたって進化する MST の活動に影響を及ぼした要因、そして運動の主な原則を考察するために、リオ・グランデ・ド・スル州の例をあげる。まとめとして、現在ブラジルで広範囲に広がった運動の、今後の展望を議論する。

キーワード：土地、継続可能、土地なし農民、不平等、小作農、居住区、キャンプ、教育。
Palavras-chave: terra, sustentabilidade, sem-terra, desigualdade, camponês, assentamento, acampamento, educação.

I. Origens

Na década de 60, o Brasil passava a uma nova fase de produção agrícola voltada à exportação. Nessa fase, muitas das grandes propriedades improdutivas se transformavam em empresas capitalistas baseadas na mecanização e no uso de insumos químicos que permitiam a produção de colheitas de qualidade mais uniforme e previsível. Particularmente importante foi a introdução do cultivo mecanizado da soja, seguindo-se à mecanização que já ocorria com as culturas de café e algodão. Nesse processo de mudança tecnológica, os grandes fazendeiros foram comprando as terras dos pequenos agricultores que, incapazes de se manterem competitivos nesse novo ambiente, e pressionados pela abordagem agressiva dos grandes proprietários, abriam mão de suas terras.[2]

Estes pequenos agricultores tinham como opção ou buscar outras regiões onde houvesse menos competição pelas terras onde pudessem recomeçar suas vidas, ou migrar para as periferias dos grandes centros urbanos. Na época, o governo militar interessado em ocupar as zonas fronteiriças do País estimulava a migração interna com projetos de colonização para aumentar a população das áreas menos povoadas.[3]

Ao final da década de 70, a crise econômica provocada pelo boicote do petróleo gerava um aumento no contingente de pessoas desempregadas, enquanto que simultaneamente muitos dos pequenos agricultores retornavam ao Rio Grande do Sul após o fracasso dos projetos de colonização na Amazônia. Solos frágeis que logo perdiam a fertilidade, falta de infraestrutura, distância dos mercados consumidores, e doenças tropicais levaram muitos a abandonarem as novas terras e retornarem aos seus locais de origem.[4]

Muitos desses, sem lugar para ir ou ficar, decidiram ocupar algumas áreas da Reserva Indígena Nonoai dos índios Kaigang, localizada ao norte do Estado do Rio Grande do Sul. Os índios Kaigang, preocupados com a invasão de suas terras, decidiram expulsar as cerca de 1200 famílias em maio de 1978. A absoluta indisponibilidade de áreas rurais onde pudessem ficar, forçou essas famílias a acamparem às margens das rodovias nas proximidades de Ronda Alta e municípios vizinhos fazendo pressão ao Governo por terras para cultivar.[5]

Como muitas das famílias já estavam retornando de experiências mal-sucedidas de assentamento e sabiam que certos locais não ofereciam condições para que pudessem sobreviver como pequenos agricultores, exigiam agora locais onde houvessem melhores possibilidades de sucesso. Assim mesmo, as terras que o governo podia oferecer ficavam sempre localizados em áreas remotas e, portanto, difíceis de sobreviver como produtores rurais. Incapazes, porém, de resistir indefinidamente às ofertas, 118 famílias decidiam aceitar a oferta de se assentarem na região de Bagé, ao sul do Rio Grande do Sul, próximo à fronteira com a Argentina. Outras 500 famílias aceitavam uma oferta de assentamento em Mato Grosso. 110 famílias, contudo, continuavam argumentando que esses locais remotos eram impróprios para agricultura e resolviam, no dia 7 de setembro de 1978, invadir a Fazenda Sarandi considerada improdutiva. Após tensas negociações e várias tentativas fracassadas de expulsar os invasores, o governador finalmente autorizava a permanência desse grupo na propriedade.[6]

Esse episódio, considerado por muitos como o episódio precursor que levou à fundação do Movimento dos Trabalhadores Rurais Sem Terra (MST), demonstrava a importância de não aceitar terras em áreas que pela falta de infraestrutura, de mercado, ou pela própria falta de fertilidade do solo, não eram viáveis para a sobrevivência dos assentados. Em 2004, após 20 anos de sua fundação em 21 de janeiro de 1984, o MST havia assentado cerca de 1,3 milhão de pessoas.[7]

II. A Questão da Terra no Brasil

Quando se ouve falar das invasões de terras pelo MST, a primeira reação do cidadão médio é julgar que isso só pode ser executado por pessoas irresponsáveis que estariam fomentando a

desordem ou simplesmente querendo aproveitar-se da situação social para obter terras gratuitamente e depois vendê-las. Para os proprietários de terra honestos que consolidaram uma propriedade rural fruto do trabalho dedicado de várias gerações, esse tipo de preocupação é natural e justificado. O MST, contudo, tem como princípio fundamental não invadir terras produtivas, muito embora campanhas equivocadas em alguns veículos da mídia insistam em estabelecer o mito da irresponsabilidade e da ameaça às áreas produtivas do País.

Se os argumentos de que o MST é um movimento irresponsável fossem corretos, necessitaria explicar como um movimento agindo contra o bem público e privado teria atingido a dimensão e o impacto do MST. Seria mais razoável explicar o crescimento do MST como função da crise e do desespero de milhões de camponeses impedidos de trabalharem a terra devido à concentração de grandes extensões de terra nas mãos de poucos. Embora a falta de disponibilidade de terras para cultivar seja difícil de justificar num país da extensão do Brasil, o fato mais grave é que uma parte não desprezível dessas terras foi obtida ilegalmente. Nesse processo conhecido como grilagem, indivíduos, sem serem proprietários legítimos, cercam a terra, expulsam pequenos agricultores ou posseiros e assumem-se donos por meio da emissão de registros e históricos falsos obtidos através de subornos de funcionários de governos locais, em total desrespeito às normas jurídicas do País. Tais fatos fazem com que o trabalhador rural, mesmo morando num país de vastidão continental se veja cercado por todos os lados e impossibilitado de trabalhar a terra.

Figura 1- Cercado por todos os lados (Drawing by Lisa Kondo)

Apenas para ilustrar a gravidade da questão da grilagem, levantamentos realizados pelo INCRA, com base na Portaria 558 de 1999, indicam que proprietários de milhões de hectares de terras não conseguem apresentar documentos comprobatórios da posse da terra. Fruto de ações recentes tomadas pelos órgãos do governo federal, o "Tribunal de Justiça do Amazonas reconheceu a existência de fraudes em registros cartoriais no estado, ao cancelar matrículas e registros de imóveis fraudados, num total de 5,538 milhões de hectares"[8] em 14 de março de 2001. No balanço da grilagem no Brasil, divulgado pelo INCRA em agosto do mesmo ano, o Ministro Jungmann anunciou que "40,6 milhões de hectares, cadastrados ou não, tiveram seus registros imobiliários cancelados e/ou bloqueados (ênfase do autor) pela Justiça, por constatação de grilagem."[9] Apenas como referência, essa área que teve os registros cancelados é maior do que todo o território do Japão (37,7 milhões de hectares).

III. Desenvolvimento Agrário do Rio Grande do Sul[10]

Nos séculos XVIII e XIX, a produção do charque[11] era a principal atividade econômica do estado do Rio Grande do Sul. O charque era vendido em grandes quantidades para garimpeiros que buscavam ouro nas minas dos estados de São Paulo e Minas Gerais. Conta-se que a tradição de produção do charque teria vindo dos indígenas que passavam o ano todo rodando o estado e caçando bois que eram mortos e carregados em fatias entre o cavaleiro e o cavalo, fazendo com que o suor de ambos salgasse a carne.

Devido à importância estratégica do estado do Rio Grande do Sul para a defesa das fronteiras nacionais contra a invasão dos países vizinhos, a Coroa e posteriormente o governo da República deram a posse da terra a indivíduos que fossem capazes de manter exércitos particulares para expulsar eventuais invasores. Como os proprietários dessas terras tinham exércitos, eram chamados de coronéis, e com o passar do tempo, todos os grandes proprietários de terras passaram a ser chamados de "coronéis".

Figura 2 – Poluição produzida por uma termelétrica à base de carvão na região de Candiota.

Um dos principais problemas desta área para a pequena produção agrícola é a má qualidade da água que contém proporções excessivas de carvão e enxofre. A causa dessa contaminação não é clara mas aparentemente existe uma situação geológica e uma outra criada pela atividade humana. A primeira causa seria a própria existência de carvão e enxofre no solo, que poderia estar se dissolvendo na água. A outra possível causa seria as emissões tóxicas e a liberação de dejetos da atividade industrial das minas de carvão e cimento, principais atividades econômicas da região, que estariam contaminando a água. Relacionado a essa atividade industrial, existe ainda a questão da chuva ácida que as emissões produzidas no Brasil geram no Uruguai, e que tem criado um certo desconforto nas relações diplomáticas dos dois países. Aparentemente, o problema da chuva ácida só existe no Uruguai, e a água da chuva do lado brasileiro parece ser utilizável. A única alternativa que se tem mostrado de alguma viabilidade para o MST tem sido a construção de poços rasos ou reservatórios de água da chuva.[12]

A questão da água, entretanto, não é o único problema dos assentados da região. A falta de estradas apropriadas para o escoamento da produção é outro dos grandes desafios. Principalmente na região sudeste do estado, onde há um grande número de assentamentos, caminhões ou outros veículos de carga não conseguem transitar pelas estradas de terra durante os três meses da época das chuvas. Os pneus dos veículos acabam sendo paralisados de tanta argila que adere aos pneus. O único veículo capaz de trafegar é a carroça com "pneus" finos de madeira, que consegue evitar que a argila paralise seus "pneus". Muitas atividades, como a produção de leite, é inviabilizada pela impossibilidade de escoar a produção.

Finalmente, existe o conservadorismo dos habitantes da parte sul do estado. Diferentemente da região norte montahosa do estado, acostumado com a tradição de pequenas propriedades e cultura européia, os moradores desta região dominada tradicionalmente pelos coronéis, vê com desconfiança a atuação do MST, o que faz com que os assentados tenham dificuldade de se integrar à comunidade local tanto social como economicamente.

Resultado dos problemas mencionados acima, o nível de desistência nesta região é relativamente alto, e embora números exatos não estejam disponíveis, as lideranças estimam algo em torno de 15%. Tendo em vista a conjunção de muitos fatores desfavoráveis, as lideranças do MST tem também discutido a possibilidade de saírem em definitivo desta região em busca de outras áreas para assentamento e declarar a região inviável para a reforma agrária.[13]

O contraste entre a região norte e a região sul é marcante. Na parte norte a água é boa, a infraestrutura bem melhor, a população local possui um bom domínio das tecnologias adaptadas à produção em pequena escala e a integração com a população local é muito mais fácil. Diferentemente dos assentamentos da região sul do estado (V. Figura 3, por exemplo), o assentamento Trinta de Maio (Figura 4) localizado mais ao norte do estado possui um nível de vida relativamente alto, com produção diversificada e um supermercado na cidade mais próxima para a comercialização de seus produtos.

Figura 3 – Fotos da região de Hulha Negra e Candiota, RS, 16 e 17 de março de 2004.

Figura 4 – Fotos do Assentamento Trinta de Maio em Charqueadas, RS, 14 e 15 de março de 2004.

IV. Os Objectivos do MST

De acordo com Geraldo Fontes, responsável pela área de relações internacionais do MST, o principal objetivo do MST é a concretização da reforma agrária. Nas duas décadas de lutas pela terra, o Movimento aprendeu que não bastava obter a terra, mas era preciso lutar em outras frentes para construir uma nova sociedade mais justa para todos. Assim, em primeiro lugar, o MST luta para obter a terra; em segundo, luta para concretizar a reforma agrária; e, em terceiro, luta para construir uma nova sociedade mais justa onde todos possam viver com dignidade.

Figura 5 – Entrevista da equipe com Geraldo Fontes (centro-esquerda).

Para o observador externo, ou para os proprietários de terras, a invasão de terras pelos sem-terra parece ser apenas um ato irresponsável de desrespeito às regras básicas de convívio social: "não tomar o que pertence a outrem". Pode-se dizer, contudo, que se esses mesmos observadores tivessem a oportunidade de se familiarizar com as condições de pobreza em que se encontravam os sem-terra, e com a situação fundiária brasileira descrita anteriormente, iriam sem dúvida compreender que esse ato extremo não é nada mais que uma resposta desesperada a uma situação igualmente extrema e injusta. De fato, em 1988, a sociedade brasileira reconhece a injustiça dessa exclusão, e estabelece em sua nova Constituição Federal[14], Artigo 5°, Parágrafo XXIII, que "a propriedade atenderá a sua função social." A Constituição ademais prevê em seu Artigo 186 que

> A função social é cumprida quando a propriedade rural atende, simultaneamente, segundo critérios e graus de exigência estabelecidos em lei, aos seguintes requisitos:
>
> I - aproveitamento racional e adequado;
>
> II - utilização adequada dos recursos naturais disponíveis e preservação do meio ambiente;
>
> III - observância das disposições que regulam as relações de trabalho;
>
> IV - exploração que favoreça o bem-estar dos proprietários e dos trabalhadores.

V. Organização do MST

Para os membros do MST, os temas relativos à organização de suas atividades são referidos como "organicidade". A organicidade do MST, portanto, pode ser melhor entendida pelas várias instâncias de decisão e coordenação representadas esquematicamente na Figura 6 abaixo:

Figura 6 – Representação esquemática das várias instâncias de coordenação do MST.

V.1. Núcleos de Base

O núcleo de base é a primeira instância de organicidade e se constitui de 10 a 15 famílias. É o primeiro nível de tomada de decisão. Questões que requerem decisões podem estar relacionadas com as atividades produtivas do assentamento, com a escola, com a comunidade, com as atividades diárias da comunidade, bem como com as questões mais amplas de política nacional ou internacional. Por exemplo, cada núcleo de base pode estar discutindo sobre a avaliação do governo Lula, ou da campanha internacional contra as determinações da Organização Mundial do Comércio (OMC), ou da participação de seus representantes na reunião quadrienal da Via Campesina. Vale a pena notar a importância dada a todos os membros da comunidade nessas discussões, onde nem a idade nem o sexo são fatores limitantes. Crianças, por exemplo, são particularmente consultadas quando se trata de questões relativas ao cotidiano do assentamento, visto que elas são as que dispendem mais tempo

na comunidade e seus pontos de vista estariam baseados na realidade do acampamento.

O núcleo de base é coordenado por duas pessoas, sendo um homem e uma mulher. O mandato é de um ano, e o MST encoraja a troca de coordenadores anualmente, de maneira que todos tenham a oportunidade de aprender a liderar.

V.2. Acampamento ou Assentamento

Esta instância, como o nome indica, é responsável por coordenar as ações do MST dentro do acampamento ou assentamento. Esse papel é desempenhado por uma coordenação composta de todos os coordenadores dos núcleos de bases, todos os diretores das cooperatives.locais, e por outras pessoas que por sua dedicação, contribuição ou qualidades especiais se tornaram referência na comunidade.

V.3. Coordenação Regional

Esta instância existe nos estados mais populosos. Nos estados menos populosos a instância seguinte ao assentamento é a coordenação estadual. A coordenação é composta por um representante de cada núcleo de base, o que faz com que seu tamanho seja relativamente grande. Por exemplo, segundo Geraldo Fontes, na sua região de origem, Corumbal Extremo Sul no estado da Bahia, há 183 representantes.[15] Os representantes dos núcleos de base podem ser um dos dois coordenadores, ou uma terceira pessoa. A principal função desta instância de coordenação é a de coordenar as linhas políticas de ação do movimento a nível regional.

V.4. Coordenação Estadual

Uma das fortes características do MST é a flexibilidade para se ajustar às especificidades de cada região ou estado. No caso da seleção de representantes das coordenações estaduais, a Bahia faz com que cada região nomeie 15 representantes para compor a coordenação estadual. No Rio Grande do Sul, os representantes são escolhidos por grupos de famílias. Assim, a cada 50 famílias um representante é escolhido. A esse grupo de representantes, juntam-se os presidentes e diretores das cooperativas regionais para completar, no caso da Bahia, 155 representantes. No caso do Rio Grande do Sul, ocorre o mesmo, embora o número total não tenha sido esclarecido. As coordenações estaduais reúnem-se periodicamente, em geral algo em torno de três vezes ao ano. Note, entretanto, que devido ao grande dinamismo do MST, esses números variam de ano para ano, e os processos de seleção continuam evoluindo anualmente.

A partir da instância estadual, existe, além da coordenação, uma direção que é um grupo menor responsável por atividades executivas do estado. A direção fica localizada na sede estadual e a

dedicação de seus membros é em tempo integral. Na Bahia, os membros da direção estadual são escolhidos dentre os membros da coordenação, mas no Rio Grande do Sul, cada grupo de 500 famílias escolhe um representante para a direção estadual. As direções são compostas geralmente por grupos de 10 a 15 pessoas.

V.5. Coordenação Nacional

A coordenação nacional do MST é composta de 300 representantes.[16] Na constituição desta instância de organicidade, cada estado escolhe dez representantes por meio de um processo consensual. Nesta instância, além dos representantes de cada estado, outras pessoas com competências específicas nos 11 setores estratégicos do MST (discutidos abaixo) são selecionadas para completar a coordenação nacional. A direção nacional, que é responsável pelas atividades executivas, era composta de 23 pessoas em 2004.

Fazem ainda parte da instância nacional o Encontro Nacional, realizado a cada dois anos, e o Congresso Nacional, realizado a cada cinco anos. O último encontro nacional do MST[17] reuniu cerca de 1.200 representantes de todo o Brasil. O Encontro Nacional representa a instância de tomada de decisões das mais importantes para o movimento. O Encontro é também utilizado para compartilhar problemas enfrentados em cada estado, as soluções adotadas, e outros tipos de experiências em geral. Sessões de treinamento de novas lideranças são também organizadas nessa oportunidade. O Congresso Nacional de agosto de 2000, realizado em Brasília, reuniu em torno de 11.700 pessoas.

VI. Setores Estratégicos do MST

Desde a sua fundação, o MST vem definindo os setores que representam recortes funcionais que o auxiliem a focalizar esforços nas áreas consideradas estratégicas para a organização e seus membros. Os onze setores existentes na atualidade são os seguintes:

1. Produção, cooperação e meio-ambiente;
2. Educação para todos e capacitação;
3. Saúde;
4. Formação política;
5. Comunicação;
6. Cultura;
7. Direitos humanos;
8. Gênero;
9. Projetos e finanças;
10. Frente de massa; e

11. Relações internacionais.

Embora todas essas áreas sejam importantes, os dois primeiros são os que têm uma importância especial e serão discutidos em maiores detalhes abaixo.

VI.1. Produção, Cooperação e Meio-ambiente[18]

Enquanto que a grande maioria dos outros setores são de natureza mais pública como direitos humanos, questões de gênero, educação, e cultura, o setor de produção é o que mais concretamente representa o sonho dos sem-terra: ter um pedaço de terra para poder produzir, colher e morar. A produção assume uma importância central, porque o MST aprendeu no correr dos anos que conquistar a terra pode apenas terminar em desilusão se não houver um trabalho cuidadoso e concertado de produzir e sobreviver na nova terra. A dificuldade de começar a produzir sem ter equipamentos ou insumos é por si só uma barreira significativa para o sem-terra, mas essa dificuldade é multiplicada pelo fato de que as terras que recebem estão geralmente exauridas pela exploração desregrada do antigo dono da terra, ou porque sua localização geográfica, infraestrutura viária, ou fatores climáticos fazem com que elas sejam menos apropriadas para a agricultura.

Nos primeiros anos do MST, os assentados desejosos de algum dia conquistarem o estilo de vida opulento e luxuoso dos grandes proprietários de terras resolveram adotar a monocultura de capital intensivo. Após alguns anos, contudo, descobriram que além do investimento fixo alto requerido, a agricultura química exauria a terra exigindo que colheitas posteriores recebessem doses maiores de fertilizantes químicos e consequentemente aumentassem os custos de produção. Nos anos 90, alguns assentamentos do MST começaram a reavaliar o seu processo de produção que não estava produzindo os resultados esperados. O uso de agrotóxicos, além de compactar o solo, reduzia a fertilidade da terra, aumentava o custo e prejudicava a saúde dos trabalhadores. Nessa reavaliação, os assentados se deram conta de que, além das desvantagens apontadas acima, esse modelo de produção que eles vinham adotando era exatamente aquele que os havia transformado em sem-terra, e que seria um contrasenso continuar reproduzindo um modelo de produção prejudicial ao homem do campo e aos consumidores. A partir de então, o movimento passou a treinar técnicos e a encorajar os assentamentos a aplicar métodos orgânicos de produção.

A transição para o método orgânico, contudo, não ocorreu de maneira fácil ou foi necessariamente seguida por todos. No assentamento Trinta de Maio, localizado no município de Charqueadas, por exemplo, Pedro Wathier, diretor da área de produção da Cooperativa de Produção Agropecuária dos Assentados de Charqueadas[19] (COPAC), explicou como a produção de arroz caiu do seu pico anterior (com uso de insumos químicos) de 20 mil sacas para 5 mil sacas por ano, e levou cerca de 5 anos para chegar ao patamar atual de 8 mil sacas. Segundo Pedro, embora a

produção seja menor, existe a grande vantagem de estar utilizando menos recursos na compra de insumos e produzindo um produto mais saudável e valorizado no mercado. Um problema de natureza distinta ocorreu no assentamento Lagoa do Junco, localizado no município de Tapes, quando membros individuais do assentamento continuaram a produzir com agrotóxicos enquanto o grupo cooperado decidia adotar a produção orgânica. A fim de evitar a contaminação da cultura orgânica por agrotóxicos, uma difícil negociação visando o realocamento dos terrenos teve de ser feita, felizmente, de maneira satisfatória para ambas as partes.

O assentamento Trinta de Maio produz também leite de vaca, além de porcos e frangos para o abate. Nos dois primeiros casos, a criação é feita utilizando-se o método de Voisin[20] que por meio da divisão do pasto em piquetes de cerca de 40 por 40 metros, permite aos animais sempre consumirem pastos de boa qualidade e bom conteúdo alimentar, o que os mantém saudáveis e a baixo custo. O método permite também a prevenção de vermes que, mesmo que tenham infectado algum animal, não conseguem se hospedar em outro animal, pois, quando o gado retorna após 45 dias ou mais, os vermes já desapareceram das excreções. Por causa dessas vantagens, segundo Pedro, o método é também adotado em Cuba. Como um dos principais objetivos do MST é servir de veículo para a conquista da dignidade pelos seus membros, tanto o método de Voisin quanto a agricultura orgânica que requerem uma maior participação da mão-de-obra, são tecnologias de produção muito mais alinhadas com o Movimento.

É interessante notar que os métodos de produção utilizados pelo MST têm evoluído para um novo paradigma de produção e associação, como uma alternativa bastante interessante aos métodos vigentes que funcionam como um jogo de soma zero, onde os benefícios auferidos com a produção de bens, necessariamente exigem sacrifício dos recursos naturais ou de empregos. Assim, não só na agricultura quanto na indústria de manufatura em geral (que em grande parte continua a poluir significativamente o meio-ambiente) parece não existirem "avanços" que não sejam o corte de milhares de pessoas a cada nova medida de reestruturação, colocando a perda de empregos como um caminho necessário desses avanços. Curiosamente, o MST, seja motivado pela necessidade, ou guiado pela sabedoria de colocar o ser humano em seu centro, tem conseguido evoluir para soluções "win-win", onde a atividade produtiva, ao invés de sacrificar a natureza e o ser humano, respeita os tempos e o ciclo da natureza e adota métodos que dignificam a participação humana no trabalho. Conforme explicado por Kondo, esse tipo de atuação é um perfeito exemplo do chamado "social business model"[21], que seria uma das novas formas que os negócios teriam de adquirir se desejamos evoluir na construção de uma sociedade sustentável.

VI.2. Educação: Construindo o Futuro.

A educação é vista pelo MST como um elemento essencial para a conquista do respeito e da

dignidade. No Brasil, a maioria das pessoas pobres não teve oportunidade de sentar nos bancos escolares para aprender, e são portanto incapazes de ler ou escrever seu próprio nome. Essa incapacidade de ler, de entender os avisos, fatos, ou contratos que necessita por vezes "assinar" coloca os analfabetos numa situação de grande fragilidade, onde ao firmar um contrato é obrigado a colocar a impressão digital sem saber se existe ou não alguma cláusula desvantajosa para si.[22] Assim, a educação no MST não é apenas para as crianças em idade escolar, mas para todos que por alguma razão não tiveram a oportunidade de aprender. Segundo o MST, desde os seus primórdios, o Movimento sempre esteve consciente de que a luta pela terra tinha que vir acompanhada da luta pela escola. Assim, independentemente das situações conjunturais enfrentadas pelos seus membros, a educação é perseguida em todo e qualquer lugar. Seja nos acampamentos improvisados em beira de estrada, seja nos acampamentos das invasões de propriedades privadas, O MST sempre busca organizar uma maneira de ter as crianças estudando pelo método batizado como "escola itinerante" (V. Fig. 8). Segundo João Batista, uma das lideranças do Acampamento Eldorado do Sul visitado em 14 de março de 2004, é preciso "educar para que as pessoas se transformem em transformadores da sociedade e a partir daí fazer valer seus direitos." (V. Figura 7).

Figura 7 – João Batista (direita) e Cristina (centro) nos guiaram pelo acampamento.

Onde quer que se estude, a pedagogia segue os ensinamentos de Paulo Freire e o conteúdo está intimamente associado à realidade vivida pelos sem-terra. Freire indica que para encontrar o conteúdo programático de uma pedagogia viva, necessitamos ir à realidade vivida pelas pessoas e construir a percepção dessa realidade conjuntamente com educandos e educadores.[23] A educação no MST não é vista apenas como um processo de obter "certificação" (embora certificação seja também um importante incentivo) para concorrer a posições no mercado de trabalho, mas muito mais como um instrumento prático na solução dos problemas e no melhoramento da qualidade de vida da comunidade.

Figura 8 – Secretaria e sala de aula da escola itinerante no acampamento Eldorado do Sul no Rio Grande do Sul (Fotografado pelo autor e equipe em 14 de março de 2004).

Na visão do MST, os objetivos das escolas dos assentamentos são: "1) Ensinar a ler, escrever e calcular a realidade; 2) Ensinar fazendo, isto é, pela prática; 3) Construir o novo; 4) Preparar igualmente para o trabalho manual e intelectual; 5) Ensinar a realidade local e geral; 6) Gerar sujeitos da história; e 7) Preocupar-se com a pessoa integral."[24]

O esforço persistente do MST com relação à educação dos sem-terra passou pelos seguintes momentos de grande significância para o Movimento:[25]

- 1985 – surge a atividade educacional no acampamento da fazenda Anoni, no Rio Grande do Sul.
- Julho de 1987 – 1º. Encontro Nacional de Professores de Assentamento.
- Janeiro de 1990 – Início da primeira turma do Curso de Magistério (2º. Grau).
- Janeiro de 1991 – Curso de preparação de monitores para um projeto de alfabetização nos assentamentos.
- 25 de maio de 1991 – Lançamento do Projeto de Alfabetização do MST-RS no Assentamento Conquista da Fronteira, em Hulha Negra, com a presença de Paulo Freire. O projeto com duração de 2 anos formou 100 turmas de alfabetizandos.
- Julho de 1991 – Publicação do Caderno de Formação No. 18: O Que Queremos com as Escolas dos Assentamentos. A sua introdução descreve a história da educação no MST como "...uma caminhada feita de teimosia... Às vezes juntos, às vezes cada um do seu jeito e com as condições de cada momento..."[26] refletindo a percepção do MST sobre a centralidade da educação bem como o seu comprometimento com a ampla disseminação das oportunidades de educação dentre os sem-terra..
- 03 a 12 de novembro de 1992 – I Oficina de Capacitação Pedagógica, em Presidente Prudente, São Paulo.
- 15 a 16 novembo de 1993 – I Seminário Nacional de Educação de Jovens e Adultos (EJA).

- 10 a 27 de janeiro de 1994 – Curso de Pedagogia.
- Abril de 1994 – Publicação do Caderno de Educação No. 3 – Alfabetização de Jovens e Adultos: Como Organizar.
- Setembro de 1994 – Publicação do Caderno de Educação No. 4 – Alfabetização de Jovens e Adultos: A Didática da Linguagem.
- Dezembro de 1994 – Publicação do Caderno de Educação No. 5 – Alfabetização de Jovens e Adultos: Educação Matemática.
- 1994 – Nesse ano o MST foi também convidado a participar da Comissão Nacional de Educação de Jovens e Adultos ligada à Secretaria da Educação Fundamental, no Ministério da Educação, Cultura e Desporto.
- Julho de 1996 – Publicação do Caderno de Educação No. 8: Princípios da Educação no MST. Nesta publicação se definiram os princípios filosóficos e pedagógicos da educação no MST.

  Princípios Filosóficos:

  1) Educação para a transformação social;
  2) Educação para o trabalho e a cooperação;
  3) Educação voltada para as várias dimensões da pessoa humana;
  4) Educação para valores humanistas e socialistas; e
  5) Educação como um processo permanente de formação e transformação humana.

  Princípios Pedagógicos:

  1) Íntima relação entre prática e teoria;
  2) Combinação metodológica entre processos de ensino e de capacitação;
  3) A realidade como base da produção do conhecimento;
  4) Conteúdos formativos socialmetne úteis;
  5) Educação para o trabalho e pelo trabalho;
  6) Vínculo orgânico entre processos educativos e processos formativos;
  7) Vínculo orgânico entre processos educativos e econômicos;
  8) Vínculo orgânico entre educação e cultura;
  9) Gestão democrática;
  10) Auto-organização dos(as) estudantes;
  11) Criação de coletivos pedagógicos e formação permanente dos(as) educadores(as);
  12) Atitudes e habilidades de pesquisa; e
  13) Combinação entre processos pedagógicos coletivos e individuais.

- 27 de julho de 1996 – Ocorre um debate em Santos, SP, sobre a necessidade de aliar a alfabetização à capacitação técnica.
- Agosto de 1996 – Firma o 1°. Convênio com o Ministério da Educação, Cultura e Desporto (MEC) para a formação de 500 monitores do programa de Educação de Jovens e Adultos (EJA)

dos acampamentos e assentamentos do MST.

- 28 a 31 de julho de 1997 – 1°. Encontro Nacional dos Educadores e das Educadoras da Reforma Agrária (ENERA) no campus da Universidade de Brasília.
- 1998 – Implementação do Programa Nacional de Educação na Reforma Agrária (PRONERA) que financiou parcerias entre o governo federal, universidades, e movimentos sociais. 52 universidades se mobilizam elaborando projetos e as universidades seguintes firmaram convênios com o MST: Universidade Estadual de São Paulo, Universidade Federal de Alagoas, Universidade Federal do Ceará, Universidade Regional do Noroeste do Rio Grande do Sul – UNIJUÍ, Universidade Federal do Sergipe, Universidade Federal do Paraná, Universidade Estadual de Ponta Grossa, Universidade Estadual de Pernambuco e Universidade Estadual do Rio Grande do Norte, beneficiando 7.000 educandos.
- 1998 e 1999 – MST, UNESCO e MEC firmam convênio beneficiando 680 turmas em 18 estados totalizando 10.000 educandos.

Entre 1999 e 2003, o MST realizou uma série de encontros, seminários nacionais e regionais para discutir, avaliar e continuamente aperfeiçoar tanto a pedagogia como as ações educativas em parcerias com as secretarias de educação dos estados, com o MEC, com universidades e com a UNESCO. O MST ainda expandiu o acervo de material didático apropriado à realidade do campo, com o objetivo último de eliminar o analfabetismo nos acampamentos e assentamentos do MST.

A partir de 1996, o MST tem voltado suas atenções à capacitação técnica, tanto por iniciativa própria nos seus centros de capacitação, como a Escola Nacional Florestan Fernandes[27] e o Iterra[28], quanto por meio de convênios com universidades, como o curso superior de agronomia iniciado recentemente com a Universidade Federal do Sergipe ou o curso superior de pedagogia iniciado em 1998 com a UNIJUÍ do Rio Grande do Sul.

VII. O MST e a Atuação do Governo Federal

O MST habilmente tem construído vários canais de colaboração com órgãos do governo federal bem como dos governos locais. Embora, dependendo da situação fundiária do estado, a convivência entre o MST e o governo possa ser confusa e complexa, onde alguns setores do governo apoiam e outros opõem-se ao MST, uma vez que a desapropriação seja aprovada e as providências para a ocupação legal das terras seja concluída, o assentamento entra numa nova fase menos conflituosa.

Dentre os vários órgãos do governo federal que de alguma maneira apóiam o MST, o Instituto Nacional de Colonização e Reforma Agrária (INCRA), subordinado ao Ministério do Desenvolvimento Agrário (MDA), é o principal órgão. O INCRA tem dois papéis centrais. O

primeiro, é o de executar a Política de Reforma Agrária por meio da inserção de novos agricultores na agricultura e do desenvolvimento da agricultura familiar.[29] O segundo, é o de gerenciar a estrutura fundiária do País. Em outras palavras, o INCRA é o órgão responsável por todas as ações necessárias à manutenção e desenvolvimento das famílias acampadas e assentadas. Por exemplo, o INCRA realiza inspeções em propriedades que possam não estar cumprindo a sua função social, ou porque não são produtivas, porque causam estragos ao meio ambiente, ou porque a legislação trabalhista não está sendo respeitada. Se a inspeção constatar tal situação, a propriedade está sujeita à desapropriação.

Figura 9 – José Rui Tagliapietra (em pé) do INCRA explicando sobre a atuação do órgão no RS.

Uma outra maneira de o INCRA obter terras para a reforma agrária é através da compra de terras. Segundo o Decreto 433 de 1992, alterado pelo Decreto 2.614 de 3 de junho de 1998, o INCRA está autorizado a lançar editais em áreas de maior tensão social para a aquisição de terras para reforma agrária por meio da compra e venda. O pagamento é realizado por Títulos da Dívida Agrária resgatáveis anualmente a partir do segundo ano. Conforme o tamanho da propriedade, o pagamento é feito no prazo de 5 a 20 anos, sendo mais rápido para propriedades menores, e mais demorado para propriedades maiores. Benfeitorias são geralmente pagas em dinheiro.

Nos anos recentes, contudo, o valor do hectare subiu muito devido ao aumento da demanda por produtos da agroindústria no mercado internacional. Principalmente no Rio Grande do Sul, além do crescimento significativo do cultivo da soja,[30] o aumento de outras plantações como a de eucaliptos e acácias – recentemente introduzidas para atender ao mercado de exportação de celulose – elevaram o valor da terra a patamares que em muito superam os valores definidos em lei, chegando em alguns lugares a até 5 mil dólares o hectare, o que para o momento inviabiliza a atuação do INCRA nessa linha.[31]

Um outro problema enfrentado pelo INCRA é a dificuldade de estabelecer se uma propriedade é improdutiva ou não. Por exemplo, a média annual de produção de arroz na região é de aproximadamente 10.000 kg por hectare, mas o índice estabelecido para uso do INCRA para definir se uma área é produtiva ou não é de 2.500 kg por hectare. Para a soja, o índice é de 1.500 kg por hectare quando a média da região é superior a 2.000 kg por hectare. Durante o ano de 2003, o INCRA não foi capaz de desapropriar ou comprar terras.[32] Tal realidade coloca os cerca de 6.000 acampados no estado em situação extremamente difícil.

Além da questão dos índices estabelecidos de maneira conservadora, existem ainda várias maneiras pelas quais os proprietários de terras conseguem questionar e reverter as decisões do INCRA. Por exemplo, havia uma propriedade (maior que 130 municípios do Rio Grande do Sul) da empresa Sothal em São Gabriel com uma extensão de 14.000 hectares que foi inspecionada pelo INCRA, em dezembro 2001, e foi constatado ser improdutiva. Os proprietários recorreram à justiça e o tribunal federal deu ganho de causa aos proprietários sob o argumento de que o INCRA não havia adotado o procedimento correto de inspeção, que exige a notificação do proprietário com a devida antecedência.[33]

Segundo Cristina, uma das coordenadoras do acampamento Eldorado do Sul, os sem-terra teriam obtido informação de suas fontes de que a propriedade acima mencionada possuía dívidas vencidas no valor equivalente ao seu patrimônio. Esperava-se, portanto, que o governo tomasse posse da propriedade e a utilizasse para a reforma agrária. Aos sem-terra era difícil aceitar que um proprietário que não pagava suas dívidas vencidas ainda conseguisse se utilizar do sistema judiciário para manter a posse de terras improdutivas. Mas o uso do recurso ao judiciário para ganhar tempo, segundo os sem-terra, é a estratégia típica dos maus proprietários. Entre a primeira e a segunda inspeção, outros fazendeiros emprestariam bois que seriam colocados na propriedade e a nova inspeção realizada pelo INCRA não conseguia constatar a situação de improdutividade.[34]

Apesar dessas dificuldades que castigaram particularmente os acampados do Rio Grande do Sul, no restante do País o INCRA conseguiu desapropriar e comprar algumas propriedades. No ano de 2004, o INCRA desapropriou 564 mil hectares e adquiriu por compra direta 58 mil hectares a um custo médio de R$1.333 por hectare. O valor unitário, contudo, foi 43% superior ao valor orçado de R$930 por hectare, demonstrando claramente a valorização das terras cultiváveis no País. No total, o INCRA dispendeu cerca de R$ 984 milhões (cerca de US$ 394 milhões) em 2004 para a aquisição de terras.[35]

Entre outras formas de apoio ao assentado, ainda a nível nacional, o INCRA dispendeu R$ 223 milhões (cerca de US$89 milhões) para a concessão de crédito-instalação aos assentados no valor de R$4.500 (aumentado no decorrer do ano para R$7.400) por família, além de R$ 71 milhões para as ações de implantação dos assentamentos, fornecendo estudos topográficos, infraestrutura e planos de desenvolvimento do assentamento.[36]

Muito embora esses recursos do INCRA estejam teoricamente disponíveis, conseguir o acesso a eles é um processo que exige paciência e persistência. Quando as famílias são assentadas, elas recebem o auxílio-instalação, que é um montante inicial para a compra de implementos agrícolas,

sementes e animais, que não necessita ser reembolsado. A seguir, quando o INCRA tiver concluído a demarcação interna do assentamento, os assentados recebem um crédito (a ser posteriormente reembolsado) para a construção de suas moradias. Após cumpridas as condições necessárias, o assentado finalmente pode entrar com um pedido de crédito para financiamento da produção e obtenção de assistência técnica junto ao Programa Nacional de Fortalecimento da Agricultura Familiar (PRONAF). A provisão da infraestrutura básica faz parte do orçamento do INCRA, mas a demanda por tais serviços é grande e a obtenção efetiva desse apoio governamental é fruto de muita negociação que exige paciência e pode levar vários anos até que possa ser concluído.

VIII. Reflexões Finais

A interação com o MST, primeiro acompanhando o representante do MST em visita ao Japão, e depois visitando seus acampamentos e assentamentos no Rio Grande do Sul e outros estados, permitiu observá-lo como um grupo disciplinado e bem-intencionado de pessoas que atuam para resolver seus problemas e indicar possíveis caminhos para muitos que continuam marginalizados na sociedade brasileira contemporânea. Pelo que se pôde constatar, e contrariamente a uma das acusações mais comuns, ficou claro que os sem-terra não são um grupo interessado apenas em obter a terra gratuitamente para depois venderem em proveito próprio. Em realidade, a posição oficial do Movimento não é a de ter o título definitivo das terras, mas a de ter apenas o direito de utilizá-las produtivamente. O Movimento preconiza que qualquer terra que não esteja sendo utilizada pelos seus membros de maneira produtiva deva ser restituída ao Estado.

O contato pessoal com os acampamentos e assentamentos do MST é talvez o ato mais fundamental para efetivamente começar a entender o Movimento. Esse contato permitiu constatar vários aspectos marcantes do MST, algo que certamente a leitura dos noticiários ou livros não permite captar corretamente. Um primeiro aspecto foi o nível de segurança dos assentamentos do MST. Em contraste com a falta de segurança e o alto nível de violência nas cidades brasileiras, os assentamentos do MST impressionaram pelo grau de harmonia – que certamente não estamos descrevendo como perfeita – e pela raridade de brigas ou atos de violência. Pelo menos durante as duas semanas de visita, não se constatou ou ouviu-se a menção de qualquer ato de violência nos locais visitados. A postura do MST, até um tanto quanto radical, contra a violência pôde ser vista no Acampamento Eldorado do Sul onde apenas a música da capoeira era permitida, enquanto a sua prática era proibida.

Um segundo aspecto foi o entusiasmo marcante da grande maioria das pessoas que tivemos contato, mesmo quando muitos nem tinham o suficiente para se alimentar adequadamente (particularmente em lugares como Sergipe). No Rio Grande do Sul, mesmo nos assentamentos da

parte sul mais árida, onde as famílias viviam em situação difícil, não se via falar de desânimo, mas apenas de planos de como avançar nas proposições. A evidência impressionista sugere que o método radicalmente descentralizado de liderança do MST, que dá oportunidades a todos de aprender exercendo a liderança, deva ser um fator importante nesse entusiasmo mantido pelas pessoas.

Um terceiro aspecto foi a recusa do Movimento em se envolver no processo de barganhas políticas e sua insistência em agir com base no princípio da valorização do ser humano, em especial daqueles que mais necessitam de ajuda. Por exemplo, em torno dos anos 94 e 95, algumas famílias do MST, através da Cooperativa Regional dos Agricultores Assentados Limitada (COOPERAL) da região sul do estado do Rio Grande do Sul, próxima a Bagé, haviam firmado um contrato de produção de sementes com empresas privadas atuando nessa região. Com o passar dos anos, a COOPERAL começou a notar que as empresas estavam selecionando apenas os melhores produtores para renovar o contrato. Para os líderes do MST tal atitude, embora vista como normal e até justa no mundo dos negócios, feria um dos seus princípios básicos: "Como podiam abandonar as famílias menos produtivas se essas eram as que mais necessitavam de ajuda?" Como resultado, o MST começou os preparativos em 1996, e em 1997 iniciou a produção própria de sementes agroecológicas numa unidade batizada como BIONATUR. Dessa maneira, o MST busca transcender a prática do mercado neoliberal e construir um mercado social e cooperativo. Pelo que se pôde constatar, no MST a essência da pessoa humana vem antes da sua capacidade de contribuição para a produção ou geração de lucros, e tanto o trabalho quanto as bases de troca são apenas um instrumento para o crescimento e realização da pessoa humana.

Figura 10 – Sementes agroecológicas produzidas pela BIONATUR.

Um quarto aspecto foi o compromisso de manter uma estreita comunicação com as bases, assim como garantir que isso se faça de maneira bastante participativa e eficaz. Como escuta as bases, o Movimento se adapta e se modifica continuamente às mudanças dinâmicas da realidade.

Um quinto aspecto foi o compromisso dos seus membros em efetivamente criar condições de participação igualitária das mulheres em todos os papéis e níveis. Sensível ao fato de que as mulheres naturalmente acabam assumindo as responsabilidades mais domésticas, o MST tem estimulado seus membros masculinos a tomarem a iniciativa de cuidar das crianças, cozinhar, lavar louças e limpar as dependências. Certamente, a realidade ainda acaba por manter uma certa coloração dos papéis tradicionais, mas a participação da mulher no MST em papéis de liderança ou

atuando em tarefas tipicamente masculinas é substancialmente superior a qualquer outro setor da sociedade brasileira na atualidade.

A luta do MST é um trabalho gigantesco e em construção. Gigantesco porque o MST propõe-se a construir uma nova sociedade onde as contradições do sistema econômico atual possam ser eliminadas. Hoje as forças que impulsionam o MST são a fome, a marginalização sofrida pelos sem-terra e o despertar dos corações dos cidadãos de várias camadas sociais para a injustiça da exclusão existente na sociedade brasileira. De fato, alguns segmentos das classes mais abastadas têm iniciado um esforço de repensar suas atividades econômicas e adotar procedimentos que sejam menos exploratórios aos seres humanos e menos danosos ao meio ambiente natural.

Por outro lado, grande parte da sociedade mundial parece estar cada vez mais influenciada pelos princípios neo-liberais da economia de mercado. E iniciativas verdadeiramente novas que transcendam a lógica da primazia dos lucros ainda não foi desenvolvida por nenhuma economia mais significativa. Os países mais ricos, representados pela OCDE, tem como regra básica das trocas econômicas o consenso de Washington, que certamente nada tem de semelhante às práticas adotadas pelo MST. A primazia do lucro faz com que o mais eficaz tenha mais direitos. Os mais eficazes, iludidos ou embriagados pela aparente superioridade experimentada, interpretam esse direito como o direito de explorar os mais fracos, considerando-a legítima, desde que feito dentro das regras do livre mercado. Nesse mundo competitivo, os mais fortes ou competentes são premiados com o privilégio de conquistar mercados e, por conseqüência, expulsar produtores menos eficientes desses mercados. Aos que são expulsos, resta a opção de continuar competindo numa área de menor lucratividade, ou de se sujeitarem, como empregados, aos vencedores da competição. Embora possa haver casos excepcionais, tal sujeição significa geralmente perder a possibilidade de desenhar seu próprio futuro e de tomar suas próprias decisões. Aos ainda menos produtivos, a opção deixada é a de obedecer às condições impostas pelos mais eficazes. Nos milhões de casos de indivíduos pobres que não tiveram a oportunidade de se educar ou se formar, a opção é mendigar, viver na miséria, ser um fora-da-lei, sofrer da fome, ou morrer vítima da fome ou violência. O MST não é uma panacéa, mas é um movimento bastante inovador onde os que estão na escala mais desesperadora da sociedade encontram um ambiente que lhes permite buscar, errar, crescer, aprender e como cidadão despertar para a grande possibilidade de ser um ator na construção do seu próprio futuro.

Finalmente, o MST enfrenta o grande desafio de transformar os parâmetros do enfrentamento de hoje. Embora o governo tenha aprovado leis para acelerar a reforma agrária por meio da compra de terras pelo INCRA, a questão central que necessita ser discutida é a legitimidade da posse de terras de milhares de hectares de extensão por um único indivíduo. A Constituição prevê que a terra necessita cumprir sua função social, e mecanismos legais para garantir esse princípio poderiam ser

implementados com relativa facilidade. A ausência de tais mecanismos sugere a resistência dos grandes proprietários de terras no Congresso Nacional e outros setores da sociedade receosos de perderem seus privilégios desproporcionais. Pelo menos as iniciativas do governo no combate à grilagem é um passo importante nessa direção. Talvez essas conquistas significativas que resultaram da pressão exercida pelo MST sejam as sementes que ajudarão a mudar o quadro fundiário do Brasil de maneira paulatina mas definitiva. Tal resultado dependerá da habilidade do Movimento de crescer mantendo firmes seus valores e princípios, mas sobretudo dependerá da capacidade da sociedade brasileira de compreender que não existem justificativas que permitam manter o extremo nível de desigualdade hoje existente entre seus próprios membros.

IX. Referências

Bibliografia

Cardim, Sílvia Elisabeth de C.S., Paulo de Tarso Loguércio Vieira e José Leopoldo Ribeiro Viégas, *Análise da Estrutura Fundiária Brasileira* (Brasília: INCRA, n.d.).

DJI, *Índice Fundamental do Direito,* http://www.dji.com.br/constituicao_federal/cf.htm, acessado em 19 de janeiro de 2006.

Freire, Paulo., *Pedagogy of the Oppressed,*, ed. revisada (London: Penguin Books, 1996).

Harnecker, Marta., *Landless People: Building a Social Movement,* (Sao Paulo: Expressao Popular, 2003).

IBGE, *Prognóstico da Produção Agrícola Nacional 2005*. Acessado em 20 de janeiro de 2006 http://www.ibge.gov.br/home/estatistica/indicadores/agropecuaria/lspa/lspa12200510.shtm

Kondo, Edson. K., "Sustainable Communities in Brazil and Japan: Building a Social Business Model for Sustainable Societies Part I," Area Studies Tsukuba, No. 25 (2005), pp. 51-69.

Krieger, Richard, "Getting the Most of Your Pasture–The Voisin Way." Acessado em 10 de fevereiro de 2005 da Floresdale Estate Alpacas: http://www.flowerdalealpacas.com.au/library/library10_pasture.pdf.

MST, "Educação de Jovens e Adultos: Sempre é Tempo de Aprender," Cadernos de Educação No. 11 (novembro 2003).

MST, "O Que Queremos com as Escolas dos Assentamentos," Cadernos de Formação No. 18 (julho 1991).

Entrevistas

Artêmio. Comunicação pessoal com o autor durante visita ao Assentamento Roça Nova e vários outros em Candiota e Ulha Negra, RS, 16 e 17 de março de 2004.

Batista, João. Comunicação pessoal com o autor durante visita ao Acampamento Eldorado do Sul, Arroio dos Ratos, RS, 14 de março de 2004.

Berbigier, Márcio. Comunicação pessoal durante reunião na Superientendência Estadual do INCRA, Porto Alegre, RS, 15 de março de 2004.

Cazaroto, Leocir (Loa). Comunicação pessoal com o autor durante visita ao Assentamento Trinta de Maio, Charqueadas, RS, 14 e 15 de março de 2004.

Correa, Ciro. Comunicação pessoal com o autor entre os dias 14 e 21 de março de 2004.

Cristina. Comunicação pessoal com o autor durante visita ao Acampamento Eldorado do Sul, Arroio dos Ratos, RS, 14 de março de 2004.

Fontes, Geraldo. Comunicação pessoal com o autor no Hotel Itamarati, São Paulo, SP, manhã de 14 de março de 2004.

João Felix. Comunicação pessoal durante reunião na Superientendência Estadual do INCRA, Porto Alegre, RS, 15 de março de 2004.

Tagliapietra, José Rui. Comunicação pessoal durante reunião na Superientendência Estadual do INCRA, Porto Alegre, RS, 15 de março de 2004.

Tonin, Ivonete (Nina). Comunicação pessoal com o autor durante visita ao Assentamento Trinta de Maio, Charqueadas, RS, fim de tarde, 14 de março de 2004.

Wathier, Pedro. Comunicação pessoal com o autor durante visita ao Assentamento Trinta de Maio, Charqueadas, RS, 15 de março de 2004.

Notas

* Kondo, E., "O Movimento dos Trabalhadores Rurais Sem Terra no Rio Grande do Sul," (The Movement of the Landless Rural Workers in the State of Rio Grande do Sul) *BOLETÍN del Instituto de Estudos Latino-Americanos de Kyoto* - IELAK, No. 5, Dec 2005, pp. 33-59. (Portuguese)

---

[1] Esta pesquisa contou com o generoso apoio financeiro da empresa Sanko, sediada na província de Mie, que, por intermédio do seu presidente Konosuke Katano, recebeu graciosamente o representante do MST, Ciro Correa, quando da sua visita ao Japão e explicou sobre as técnicas de compostagem para produção de fertilizantes naturais e seu uso na produção de frutas e legumes em sua empresa. O projeto contou ainda com o apoio financeiro parcial do projeto "Pesquisa Transdisciplinária de Valores para o Estabelecimento de uma Ciência da Sustentabilidade" da Universidade de Tsukuba, coordenado por Takeshi Kimura. A equipe de pesquisa foi liderada pelo autor, Edson Kenji Kondo, atualmente Professor Titular do Programa de Doutorado em Culturas Contemporâneas e Políticas Públicas da Universidade de Tsukuba, e contou com o apoio e colaboração de Nobumistu Doi, Consultor de Meio Ambiente, Maria Majella Rio, então mestranda da Universidade de Tsukuba, e Yoshisuke Akimoto, então mestrando da Universidade de Tóquio.

[2] V. Cardim, S.E. et al. sobre a Análise da Estrutura Fundiária Brasileira.

[3] V. Harnecker, 27-9.

[4] V. Harnecker, 28-9.

[5] V. Harnecker, 34.

[6] V. Harnecker 31-38.

[7] Comunicação pessoal com Ciro Correa do MST.

[8] INCRA. Informações prestadas à CPI da Grilagem pelo Ministro Jungmann em 21/03/01. Acessado em 20 de janeiro de 2006 de http://www.incra.gov.br/reforma/grilagem5.htm.

[9] INCRA. Balanço da Grilagem – Agosto de 2001. Acessado em 20 de janeiro de 2006 de http://www.incra.gov.br/reforma/grilagem4.htm.

[10] A maior parte das informações desta seção foram obtidas durante reunião na Superintendência Regional do Rio Grande do Sul do INCRA em 15 de março de 2004.

[11] Tipo de carne salgada.

[12] Comunicação pessoal com Ciro Correa e Artêmio em 16 e 17 de março de 2004.

[13] Baseado nas discussões com Artêmio e Ciro Corrêa em 16 e 17 de março de 2004.

[14] V. DJI, Índice Fundamental do Direito.

[15] Comunicação pessoal com Geraldo Fontes em 14 de março de 2004.

[16] Em 2004, a instância nacional constituía-se de 107 representantes, com 3 representantes vindo de cada estado, e o restante constituído de pessoas de destaque dentro dos 11 setores prioritários do MST. Comunicação eletrônica com Ciro Corrêa, em 27 de janeiro de 2006.

[17] "Última" quando da entrevista em 14 de março de 2004.

[18] Esta sessão está baseada em sua maior parte nas entrevistas realizadas com Ivonete Tonin (Nina) em 14 de março, e Pedro Wathier em 15 de março de 2004.

[19] Charqueadas é o município onde se localiza o assentamento.

[20] V. Krieger, R. 1994. "Getting the Most of Your Pasture–The Voisin Way." Neste assentamento cerca de 10 animais são deixados em um piquete por cerca de 4 horas e o mesmo piquete é utilizado novamente depois de 45 a 60 dias de descanso, dependendo da estação do ano.

[21] V. Kondo, E.K. "Sustainable Communities in Brazil and Japan: Building a Social Business Model for Sustainable Societies Part I."

[22] Cadernos de Educação no. 3:6.

[23] Freire 1996: 77.

[24] MST – Cadernos de Formação No. 18.

[25] Os fatos aqui listados foram retirados na maior parte de MST, "História da Educação de Jovens e Adultos – EJA no MST", Caderno de Educação No. 11:5-29.

[26] MST – Cadernos de Formação No. 18: 5 citado em MST – Cadernos de Educação No. 11:9.

[27] Escola Nacional Florestan Fernandes - Está localizada a cerca de uma hora de viagem de São Paulo em condução terrestre. A Escola, concluída recentemente, foi construída de forma radicalmente participativa e com o uso de tecnologias sustentáveis. A tecnologia em questão permite a redução radical do uso de cimento e um uso muito maior de terra. Aproveitando a vinda à Escola para treinamentos, grupos de cerca de 60 a 70 pessoas vinham à Escola a cada dois meses e se dedicavam a construção da Escola. As primeiras 2 semanas eram utilizadas para o aprendizado da técnica e então ela era aplicada na construção dos prédios nas 6 semanas restantes.

[28] Iterra (Instituto Técnico de Capacitação e Pesquisa da Reforma Agrária) - Localizada em Veranopolis no Rio Grande do Sul, este Instituto, sustentado pelo governo estadual, serve como um centro de treinamento de conhecimentos especializados como administração ou gerenciamento de cooperativas. Mais especificamente, ensina como administrar assentamentos e administrar cooperativas agrícolas. Ensina também outros cursos técnicos de longo prazo em areas de produção e articula oficinas para educadores. (V. http://www.mstbrazil.org/summary). O ITERRA foi criado há cerca de 10 anos. Uma parte do prédio foi doado ao MST para a criação de um centro de treinamento. Os (as) estudantes do MST quando vêm ao ITERRA permanecem ativos das 6 horas da manhã até meia-noite, porque em uma parte do dia eles estudam as disciplinas lá ministradas e na outra parte do dia aplicam os conhecimentos ali adquiridos. Tem capacidade para aproximadamente 150 pessoas e atualmente existem cursos de agentes comunitários de saúde, professores itinerantes, dentre outros. (Comunicação pessoal com Ciro Correa em 14 de março de 2004).

[29] Márcio Berbigier, INCRA, durante comunicação pessoal da equipe de pesquisa com membros da superintendência estadual do Rio Grande do Sul em 15 de março de 2004. Ver também *Relatório de Gestão INCRA Exercício 2004*, p. 5.

[30] Segundo a Tabela "Índices de Perdas do Plantio à Pré-colheita dos Principais Grãos Cultivados no País 1996-2002" em *Indicadores Agropecuários* do IBGE, a produção da soja cresceu de 23 milhões de toneladas em 1996 para 42 milhões em 2002, (acessado em 20 de janeiro de 2006 de http://www.ibge.gov.br/home/estatistica/economia/agropecuaria/indicadoresagro_19962003/tab1p.pdf) enquanto que as safras para os anos de 2005 e 2006 estão estimadas em 51 e 59 milhões de toneladas, respectivamente (acessado em 20 de janeiro de 2006 de http://www.ibge.gov.br/home/estatistica/indicadores/agropecuaria/lspa/ lspa12200510.shtm).

[31] Márcio Berbigier, INCRA, comunicação pessoal em 15 de março de 2004.

[32] Ibid.

[33] Ibid.

[34] Cristina e João Batista, comunicação pessoal em 14 de março de 2004 no acampamento Eldorado do Sul.

[35] INCRA, Relatório de Gestão Exercício 2004, pp. 12-14.

[36] Ibid.