Development of Self-esteem in Students: A Comparative Study in Japan, Korea, and China

Ichiko SHOJI
Daisuke NAKAI
Development of Self-esteem in Students: A Comparative Study in Japan, Korea, and China

Ichiko SHOJI**
Daisuke NAKAI**

The purpose of this study was to investigate the development of self-esteem in children and students and to compare it among three countries, Japan, Korea, and China. Participants were 3,077 in total of children and students in fifth grade in elementary schools, eighth grade in middle high schools and eleventh grade in high schools who lived in and near the capital of the three countries. Coopersmith's self-esteem scale scores conducted to the participants were significantly correlated and significantly different from their grade level (schools) and their country. The score of fifth graders was significantly high and eighth graders was the lowest, and eleventh graders was higher than eighth graders but lower than fifth graders. This tendency was the same among the three countries. Chinese girls' scores were the highest. The scores of Japanese eleventh graders were the lowest. The correlation between the Japanese self-esteem scores and self-evaluation of their academic achievement (5-point scale) was significant. The correlation of self-esteem scores and high school students' self-evaluation of their academic achievement was lower than the other graders. Implication concerning the main factors of country and sex for children's and students' self-esteem are discussed.

With the entry into the 21st century, great social changes have diversified and escalated problems of children. The era of falling birthrates has dawned on developing nations, the rate of students wishing to pursue higher studies has grown increasingly, and entrance exam races still continue. Schools have become stressful environments for young students. It has been shown that children attend school under many stresses such as studies and relationships with teachers and fellow students, and that these stresses are linked with their school adjustment and mental health problems (Shimada, 1998). Because we live in a stressful society, every child has needs to be a special to those who are their family, teachers, and friends.

In ancient days, such human feelings were treated as "feelings of self-evaluation" (James, 1890). James noted that these "feelings of self-evaluation", in other words, self-esteem (SE), are defined by:

$$\text{self-esteem} = \text{success/pretensions}$$

According to this theory, self-esteem would increase the more you succeed or the less you desire. Furthermore, he notes that self-esteem would not grow if this success is not in an area that the individual values. Thus, a person who has modest goals and fulfills these may consider himself a perfectly worthwhile person. He will not

---

* University of Tsukuba, Institute of Education (Graduate School of Comprehensive Human Sciences, Doctoral Program in Human-Care Sciences)

** University of Tsukuba, Graduate School Student (Graduate School of Comprehensive Human Sciences, Doctoral Program in Human-Care Sciences)
deem himself superior to others, but he will be relatively satisfied with himself; such self-satisfaction would be reflected in a high self-esteem score.

Maslow (1954) listed the following as basic needs of humans: (i) survival needs, (ii) needs for belongingness and love, and (iii) needs for self-regard, self-respect. From Maslow’s standpoint, self-esteem can be viewed as a basic urge of humans. Furthermore, Horney (1945) and Coopersmith (1967) have given love, acceptance and approval as antecedent conditions of self-esteem. This suggests that having enough of these are important, and which self-esteem changes depending on the love and acceptance received from parents and significant others. Sullivan (1953) also considered that people constantly protect themselves so as not to loose self-esteem. He points out that loss of self-esteem is the derogation of self-value by significant others that occurred in personal history. This shows that people have the basic urges of self-esteem and self-respect, and try to protect them. Such mentality is formed as a result of the love and the acceptance given by others, especially significant others, and that the loss of it has a severe damage on self-esteem.

Arraragi (1996), in his comprehensive review of self-concepts and self-esteem studies, pointed out that self-esteem is composed of three components. These are: simple self-love (for example, “I am strong”, “I can do it”); vanity as a consequence of comparison between self and others (“I am better than so-and-so”); and self-confidence (comparison of past and present like “I am better than before”). Arraragi indicates that above all, vanity as a comparison of oneself and others comprises a large proportion of self-esteem.

Based on the above, self-esteem implies: “feelings of self-respect one possesses, emotions or the way one feels about oneself, including self-acceptance”; and is defined as feelings that is connected self-concept, and it relates to one’s self-values and one’s abilities. Furthermore, self-esteem can be closely related to relationships and acceptance with significant others from childhood.

Rosenberg (1965) attempted to clarify self-esteem by questionnaire method. He showed that self-esteem has hardly any relationship with social class or religion, but is related to birth order, and that it is high in those born as an only child, especially who are male. Rosenberg (1965) also noted:

Self-esteem has two quite different connotations. One connotation of high self-esteem is that the person who thinks he is “very good”; a very different connotation is that who thinks he is “good enough.” It is thus possible for a person to consider himself superior to most others but to feel inadequate in terms of certain standards he has set for himself. Conversely, an adolescent may consider him/herself as an average person but be quite contented with the self he observes. Consequently, the concept of self-esteem should be distinguished “very good” from “good enough” (pp. 30–31, Table 1).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Connotation meaning</th>
<th>Component of the concept</th>
<th>Related studies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Very good</td>
<td>Completeness</td>
<td>Coopersmith (1967)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Superiority</td>
<td>Kaiho-Yamashita (1968)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Nemoto (1973)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good enough</td>
<td>Self-satisfaction</td>
<td>Rosenberg (1965)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Harter (1986)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Higgins (1987)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Rosenberg (1965) indicates that the former feeling of the person is related to his/her superiority and perfection, being superior to others, and being seen as such by others. The latter is self-acceptance based on one's standard of values even if one's performance is average, self-liking, and self-respect. This suggests that self-esteem includes self-evaluation based on one's own standard of values, and evaluations based on comparison of oneself with others.

Coopersmith (1967) and Rogers and Dymond (1954) et al. have developed a 58-item self-esteem inventory (SEI; form A) for children (Bennett, Serensen, & Forsby, 1971, for adults edition, p. 50). Coopersmith (1967) also compiled the studies of Mead (1934), Horney (1945), Rogers (1951), and Fromm (1941, 1947) defined self-esteem as "positive or negative attitudes toward a particular object, namely, the self". He pointed out the following as antecedent conditions that contributed to the development of such attitudes: (a) complete or nearly complete acceptance of children by parents; (b) clearly constrained or forced limitations; and (c) respect for individual behavior within stipulated constraints. He showed that the self-esteem of children is formed based on these three conditions.

Using Coopersmith's (1967) 58-item questionnaire, Kokons (1974) studied feelings of self-respect for fourth through eighth-grade students and showed that self-respect feeling scores were lowest in sixth graders and that they had a high tendency to look at themselves negatively. This result presumably reflects anxieties concerning junior high school. In addition, using Janis & Field's (1959) 23-item scale (Japanese version, Endo et al. 1974), Araragi (1986) studied second- through sixth-grade students and showed that self-respect feelings were highest in third graders and thereafter tends to gradually decline until the sixth grade. Male students showed a higher score than female students. Using Rosenberg's (1965) scale, Yamada and Tagami (2003) investigated the feelings of self-respect in fifth graders through third-year senior high school students and showed that school level has no main effect, but there is a significant gender difference, male students scored higher than female students.

Kokons (1974), Rosenberg (1979), and Araragi (1986) all show that the highest scores of self-respect feelings were in second- and third-grade students, afterwards the score gradually decreased. Kokons (1974) suggests that the decrease of the self-respect feelings is the result of the remarkable increase of the self-denial factor rather than the decrease of the self-acceptance factor.

The study shows that self-esteem has two aspects that the absolute sense of values against self-existence and the sense of values resulting from comparison and evaluation of oneself with others. In addition, previous studies have shown that self-esteem tends to decline as the grade level increase, and to be higher in males than females. This causes an increase of negative, non-constructive factors regarding self.

This study attempts to measure self-esteem and to clarify the developmental process of it in children and students from elementary to senior high school in Japan, Korea, and China. It also aims to find the differences in these three East Asian countries. The revised scale for children created by Coopersmith (1975) was selected as the measurement due to its reliability, validity and ease of administration.

Method

Participants

The studies were performed as a collaborative study in three countries, Korea, China, and Japan. Participants were 975 children of public elementary school (B5), 1,034 eighth graders in public middle school (M5), and 854 eleventh graders in public senior high school (H2) who live in Seoul, Zhejiang (Hangzhou, Ningbo, Jinhua) and Tsukuba. Populations of three cities are from 300,000 to ten million. Table 2-1 and Table 2-2 presents total number of participants of each country by age and sex.
Table 2-1
Total Number of Participants in three countries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>E5</th>
<th>M2</th>
<th>H2</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>493</td>
<td>568</td>
<td>413</td>
<td>1474</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>482</td>
<td>466</td>
<td>441</td>
<td>1389</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>975</td>
<td>1034</td>
<td>854</td>
<td>2863</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. E5 = fifth graders in elementary school; M2 = second graders (eighth graders) in middle school; H2 = second graders (eleventh graders) in senior high school.

Table 2-2
Total Number of Participants by Country

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Koreans</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E5</td>
<td>M2</td>
<td>H2</td>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>224</td>
<td>205</td>
<td>1474</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>195</td>
<td>195</td>
<td>207</td>
<td>1389</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>378</td>
<td>419</td>
<td>412</td>
<td>2863</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. E5 = fifth graders in elementary school; M2 = second graders in middle school; H2 = second graders in senior high school.

Materials

Demographic questions. Participants were asked their demographic factors, including grade, age, and sex.

Self-esteem scale. To measure self-esteem, participants were asked to perform 25-item Coopersmith's self-esteem scale (SEI), using yes-no type scale ("like me" or "unlike me").

Self-evaluation of academic performance. Participants were asked to evaluate his/her academic performance on a 5-point scale anchored by 5(excellent) and 1(poor).

Procedure

The questionnaire was carried out at each school. All participants in three countries completed SEI and only participants in Japan were also asked to answer the questions about academic performance after teacher showed the procedure.

Results

Out of the 3,077 responses, 2,863 were included in the analysis and 214 were excluded since there were deficits on their responses. The numbers of each grade and gender of candidates from three countries are shown in Table 2-2.

Result of SEI

The reply on each item of SEI was marked “0” for “No” and “1” for “Yes”. The inversion item was marked in reverse. The results show that one of the items: “I am much pleased to be with someone” has a maximum number of the response “Yes” (81.2%), and another item: “I have many things that I want to change, if I can” has a minimum number of the response “No” (27.9%). Subsequently, all items of the scale were summed to compute the scaled score. The range of the total score was 0-25 (M = 13.69, SD = 4.99). The distribution curve is near normal, but barely skews to the right (negative skew). It has two people scored the minimum, and seven with
the maximum (See Figure 1). The distribution of the three countries, Korea, China and Japan are shown in Figures 2-1, 2-2, and 2-3, and the score and SD was high in order of Koreans, Chinese, and Japanese: Koreans are 13.53 (SD = 5.02), Chinese are 14.49 (SD = 4.89), and Japanese are 13.03 (SD = 4.95) (See Figure 3).

Comparison of grade, sex, and countries

The scaled scores were analyzed using a three-way ANOVA, whose variables were country, grade, and sex. The main effect of country and grade was significant ($F(2, 2862) = 26.28, p < .001; F(2, 2862) = 42.23, p < .001$, see Table 3). The results of the multiple comparison showed that the score of Chinese was significantly higher than that of Koreans and Japanese. The score of Koreans was significantly higher than that of Japanese ($p < .05$); the score of fifth graders in elementary school was significantly higher than that of second graders in middle school and second graders in senior high school, and the score of second graders in middle school was

![Histogram of distribution scores of self-esteem scale among Japanese, Koreans, and Chinese participants.](image1)

*Figure 1.* Histogram of distribution scores of self-esteem scale among Japanese, Koreans, and Chinese participants.

![Histogram of distribution scores of self-esteem scale of Koreans.](image2)

*Figure 2-1.* Histogram of distribution scores of self-esteem scale of Koreans.
Figure 2-2. Histogram of distribution scores of self-esteem scale of Chinese.

Figure 2-3. Histogram of distribution scores of self-esteem scale of Japanese.

Figure 3. Mean scores of self-esteem scale by Country.
Table 3

Self-Esteem scores by Country and by grade and by sex

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>(SD)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Koreans</td>
<td>E5</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>13.72</td>
<td>(4.81)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>14.31</td>
<td>(4.81)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M2</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>13.63</td>
<td>(5.31)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>12.94</td>
<td>(5.10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>H2</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>13.05</td>
<td>(4.65)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>13.54</td>
<td>(5.28)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinese</td>
<td>E5</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>14.48</td>
<td>(5.15)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>15.95</td>
<td>(4.98)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M2</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>14.36</td>
<td>(4.71)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>13.55</td>
<td>(4.75)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>H2</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>14.07</td>
<td>(4.90)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>14.70</td>
<td>(4.62)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japanese</td>
<td>E5</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>14.63</td>
<td>(4.71)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>15.62</td>
<td>(4.89)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M2</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>12.25</td>
<td>(4.42)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>10.71</td>
<td>(4.70)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>H2</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>11.70</td>
<td>(4.14)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>11.60</td>
<td>(4.59)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Main effect

Country

grade  \( P = 26.28*** \)

sex  \( P = n.s. \)

Interaction effect

Country \× grade  \( P = 10.13*** \)

Country \× sex  \( P = n.s. \)

grade \× sex  \( P = 11.00*** \)

Country \× grade \× sex  \( P = n.s. \)

*** \( p < .001 \)

Note: E5 = fifth graders in elementary school; M2 = second graders in middle school; H2 = second graders in senior high school.

significantly lower than that of fifth graders in elementary school (\( p < .05 \)). There are significant interactions between country and grade, and between grade and sex (\( F (4, 2862) = 10.13, p < .001; F (2, 2862) = 11.00, p < .001 \)). Although, the multiple comparison did not show any significant difference between the scores of Koreans and Chinese or Japanese, the scores of some categories showed significant differences: (1) The score of Chinese fifth graders in elementary school is significantly higher than that of Korean second graders in middle school; (2) The score of Chinese second graders in middle school is significantly lower than that of Korean fifth graders in elementary school; (3) The score of Japanese fifth graders in elementary school is significantly higher than that of Korean fifth graders in elementary school and second graders in middle school; (4) The score of Japanese second graders in middle school is lower than Korean fifth graders in elementary school and second graders in senior high school; (5) The score of Korean second graders in senior high school is significantly lower than Japanese fifth graders in elementary school (See Figure 4). Since the interaction between grade and sex was significant, the multiple comparisons were conducted. The results showed three significant differences: (1) The score of male was lower than that of female in case of fifth graders in elementary school, (2) The score of male was higher than that of female in case of second graders in middle school, (3) The score of male was significantly lower than that of female in case of second graders in senior high school (See Figure 5).
Figure 4. Mean scores of self-esteem scale by country and School: E5 = fifth graders in elementary school; M2 = second graders in middle school; H2 = second graders in senior high school.

Figure 5. Mean scores of self-esteem scale by school and gender: E5 = fifth graders in elementary school; M2 = second graders in middle school; H2 = second graders in senior high school.

Figure 6. Mean scores of self-esteem scale by the ratio of students proceeding of high schools.
Relationship of results with Self-evaluation of academic performance

The relationship between the results of self-evaluation of academic performance and self-esteem was investigated only in Japan. The correlation coefficient between them was $r = .35$ ($p < .001$) in total, $r = .33$ ($p < .001$) in fifth graders in elementary school data, $r = .24$ ($p < .001$) in second graders in middle school data, and $r = .21$ ($p < .001$) in graders in senior high school data. The correlation coefficient between the two was the most strong, and becomes weaker as the school grade levels increase.

Relationship of Self-esteem and Ratio of students who go on to the next level of education

The relationship of the self-esteem and the ratio of students who go on to the next level of education were explored. The high school students were divided into two groups by the ratio (High and Middle), as an objective indicator, and compared SEI points. Results indicated there was no significant difference between the two means ($y = 2.05$, n.s.; See Figure 6). This may be because the average SEI of senior high school students was relatively low ($2.47$, $SD = 1.05$), which caused the data unremarkable.

Discussion

Self-esteem is the evaluation of information including self-concept, or the feelings about self. The self-image consists of various components, and this feeling may differ according to these components. Children whose self-evaluation is low regarding their academic performance might be satisfied with themselves when they evaluate themselves highly in their athletic skills or popularity.

According to Kokenes (1974), who examined self-esteem in children with developmental perspectives, the self-esteem was the lowest in 6th grade children, and they are likely to consider themselves negatively. Coopersmith (1979) observed the same tendency: self-esteem falls from 8 to 12 years old, and then goes up gradually. In our research, fifth graders have the highest self-esteem, eighth graders have the lowest, and it increases gradually in eleventh graders in senior high school. Before the fifth grade, self-esteem is assumed to be higher; nonetheless the more students' grade increases from fifth grade to junior high school, the less the self-esteem students have. It was shown that junior high school students had lower self-esteem than elementary school students, and they were considered to be self-negative. Besides this result imply that the second period of rebelliousness affect each junior high school student's school performance, students tend to compare him/herself with others regarding school achievement more often than elementary school children. However, our findings on the correlation between self-estimate of school achievement and self-esteem, as well as our findings on the ratio of senior high school students proceeding high schools were inconclusive. The relationship between self-esteem and other self-evaluation of academic performance data should be investigated in the future.

Why did the three countries exhibit such conspicuous differences? According to Brookover and Erikson (1969, 1975), self-concept of children is highly influenced by the estimation of significant others. Rosenberg indicated that only children, especially boys, have high self-esteem. The self-esteem of Chinese children scored highly can be assumed because the percentage of only child is much higher than the other countries due to the national one-child policy.

Gender is another significant variable that produced different results. Even though it has passed 40 years since the Brookover and Erikson's study published, it is still true that male students have higher self-esteem than female students in Japan (Yamamoto and Tagami, 2003). On the other hand, in Korea and especially in China, girls showed higher self-esteem than boys. The reason for this result is not clear from our data. If self-
esteem is influenced by the positive self-evaluation of academic, social, and physical self-concept, it is worth investigating if female students' self-evaluation of China and Korea are actually superior to men in these aspects. Furthermore, we questioned that there are any differences of discipline that parents or adults give their children. Recently in Japan, the number of young married couples who would rather want to have girls than boys has been increasing. It would have some influences on their expectation and attitudes toward their children. Is the same tendency seen in Korea or China? The factor of parents' influence must be investigated.

The fact that self-esteem decreases with growth of children after fifth grade is consistent with the findings of Araragi (1986) who suggested: "vanity that comes from comparison with others accounts for a large part of self-esteem". In Japan, as school grade increases, children are more likely to be compared with other peers than children in China and Korea. As a result, it is probable that they become to consider their own value with their relative positions to the others. A number of studies consist with the findings that academic performance are positively correlated with self-esteem in students (Backman & O'Mally, 1977; O'Mally & Backman, 1979; Maruyama et al. 1981; Aino, 1971; Inoue, 1986). O'Mally and Backman (1979) have researched this correlation for twelve years in a longitudinal study. Overall, the result of our study also consisted with the results of these previous studies except the direct correlation between academic performance and self-esteem decreased with their grade level. The reason for this could be because of students' development, not only the relative position of academic performance schools, but also other factors that interact with one another complicatedly. As a result, the influence of academic performance becomes relatively weak. Moreover, in Japan, there is a unique way of self-presentation. Japanese tends to evaluate others relatively high by humbling themselves. This characteristic is known as "modesty". Such a cultural factor might be reflected in our results. Also, there is a proverb in Japan which says "a nail that sticks out may be hit" refers to the fact that one in Japan who might excel or stand out in a group tends to be devaluated or negated. Thus, junior high and senior high school students may behave in an inconspicuous manner so that they won't "stick out". This tendency is presumably reflected in our data.

According to Amagai (1997), self-trust and distrust defines the self-esteem of teenagers. And Ito (2001) suggested that the self-esteem of students in adolescence was related to recognition of their parents' good relationship, and their reliance on and respect for their father for producing such a relationship. We should examine other variables that affect self-esteem, such as academic performance, physical and social factors, popularity, parents' and adults' discipline, cultural differences in self-evaluation, self-presentation, self-trust, and self-confidence and reliance on others. Factors that were examined in this study have been analyzed in detail and factor-analyzed indicators have been developed. In the future, the accuracy of the indicators should be improved and their reliability and validity should be examined.

Finally, self-respect that was measured by SEI was lower in junior and senior high school students compared to elementary school children. It implies adolescence and youth are likely to recognize their characteristics relatively and negatively. It is necessary to clarify the reasons and factors influencing the students' inadequate self-esteem and self-confidence. It is also problematic if their self-esteem drops abruptly. In such cases it is critical to help and support such students to promote their self-esteem. In the future, more comparative and multicultural studies among the three countries examined herein should be conducted. In addition, the relation between the self-esteem and mental health of children and students need to be clarified so that those working with children and students can offer educational and mental health services that best meet their needs.

References


